Center for Open Access in Science

Open Journal for
Anthropological Studies

2020 • Volume 4 • Number 1

<https://doi.org/10.32591/coas.ojas.0401>

ISSN (Online) 2560-5348

OPEN JOURNAL FOR ANTHROPOLOGICAL STUDIES (OJAS)

ISSN (Online) 2560-5348

<https://www.centerprode.com/ojas.html>

ojas@centerprode.com

Publisher:

Center for Open Access in Science (COAS)

Belgrade, SERBIA

<https://www.centerprode.com>

office@centerprode.com

Editorial Board:

Alexandra Balakaki (PhD)

Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Faculty of Philosophy, GREECE

Meryem Bulut (PhD)

University of Ankara, Faculty of Humanities, TURKEY

Emil Heršak (PhD)

University of Zagreb, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, CROATIA

Snežana Filipova (PhD)

Ss. Cyril and Methodius University of Skopje, Faculty of Philosophy, NORTH MACEDONIA

Tsvete Lazova (PhD)

New Bulgarian University, Department of Anthropology, Sofia, BULGARIA

Executive Editor:

Goran Pešić

Center for Open Access in Science, Belgrade

CONTENTS

- 1 Performative Hybridity of Informal Initiatives Helping Refugees: A Way of Resistance
Mario Rodríguez Polo & Jaroslav Šotola
- 15 “Has the West Lost It? A Provocation”: A Comment in Regard to the End of Western Dominance (Book Review)
Emil Heršak & Tibor Komar
- 25 Un Hombre Puede Hacerlo, pero ¿una Mujer? A Critical Discourse Analysis Showing how Mexican Women might be *Machistas*
Silvia Monserrat Pacheco Constantino

Performative Hybridity of Informal Initiatives Helping Refugees: A Way of Resistance

Mario Rodríguez Polo & Jaroslav Šotola

*Palacký University Olomouc, CZECH REPUBLIC
Department of Sociology, Andragogy and Cultural Anthropology*

Received: 4 December 2019 ▪ Accepted: 20 January 2020 ▪ Published Online: 25 January 2020

Abstract

The so-called “refugee crisis” has challenged establishment putting its capacities under question as the image of a chaotic situation prevailed over European Union and its member states intervention. Formal civil society and big transnational humanitarian institutions also became the target of the critics of a heterogeneous public. Present work argues that current forms of civil engagement, manifested for example in informal initiatives helping refugees, locate their efforts under an umbrella of decolonization of their own societies. Participants in informal initiatives produce with their actions a discourse of outrage, preferentially channelized through direct action approaches, which persecutes the creation of an emancipative alternative. In such a way, participants distance themselves from their societies of origin and came closer to the subaltern groups, such as those under the label “refugees”. Informal initiatives participants became, at least figuratively, the new “hybrids” in our society. A group of people figuratively localized between the oppressor forces and the subalterns. Far from essentialist conceptions of hybridity and aware of the critic literature at this respect the concept of hybridity is understood in performative terms. Present study attempts to describe the performance of hybridity by informal initiatives in a context of exercising dialectical power with other social actors, such as authorities as part as the oppressor forces; established civil society which does not seem to really challenge status quo; refugees as a forming subaltern group; and within themselves as part of two worlds full of contradictions and incongruences.

Keywords: performative hybridity, informal initiative, refugee crisis, civil society.

1. Introduction

During September of 2015 the Czech media generated a fictitious atmosphere of fear under the threat of a “barbarian refugee invasion” that will end with the “honorable European and Christian civilization”. Politicians portrayed themselves as protectors keeping citizens safe from the imminent and destructive “migrant wave”. Czech Republic was presented as a fortress, defended by police forces at the borders but also in main cities, controlling any suspicious person. Frustrated by the homogeneity of establishment’s paranoia small groups arose in main cities organizing help convoys to border corridors and building a solidarity network for those few refugees that exceptionally crossed the country. We followed activist groups in Prague. Action took place in the corridors and main hall of the main train station, one of the most transited and supposedly controlled public spaces in the country. This was a disturbing fact: anti-migrant atmosphere and xenophobic discourses were dominant in Czech society but at the same time,

security authorities and state forces at the train station not only tolerated the presence of aid groups but even collaborated with them in a very discrete way. The unrecognized complicity of informal initiatives within authorities allowed refugees to continue their trip. Informal initiatives did not confront the dominant discourses entering in the public arena of discussion, creating public resistance to xenophobic arguments or organizing contra-anti-migrant-demonstrations. Their activism was focused on concrete actions having a direct impact on migrants' destinies thanks to a fragile balance of toleration within authorities. Researchers observed that such incongruences were a pattern characterizing emerging informal initiatives helping refugees all over the Balkan route and then we decided to focus our ethnographic efforts on its understanding (Speed, 2006).

The present work aims to deeply understand a variety of informal initiatives which emerged in Central-Eastern Europe in 2015 as a reaction to the so called "refugee crisis" (Holmes & Castañeda, 2016; Kallius, Monterescu & Rajaram, 2016). Their large diversity and constant presence must have called the attention of any witness of the processes of mobility and immobility across the "Balkan route". These groups often acted in liminal areas – such as train stations, borders and border corridors – under the label of "international volunteers". Their name is a declaration of independence against any formal humanitarian actor or state organization. This paper is an attempt to frame their understanding in a transnational arena focusing on the tensions within other social actors: such as NGO's and international humanitarian organizations; the states and some of its structural forces, police and army; and the diversity of actors covered under the common label: "refugees" (Malkki, 1995).

Informal initiatives are not a uniform movement and they show a strong diversity in terms of their size, aims or the intensity or temporality of their existences. It is not our aim to provide a functional typology. Instead, analysis focuses on their ambivalence following a methodological intention to avoid any essentialism. The last is not a statement in favor of a description of an object of study swimming in a postmodern fluidity à la Bauman. Instead our approach is built as a complex mosaic turning around the concept of hybridity, which we believe could provide a rehabilitating view to the social complexity of such interconnected phenomenon. Participants of informal initiatives became, at least figuratively, new "hybrids" in our societies. A group of people figuratively localized between the oppressor forces, the one imposing immobility, and the subaltern, those who attempt to achieve mobility.

The hybridity concept is a fundamental pillar of postcolonial theory and it has been deeply discussed in the last decades (Bhabha, 1994; Young, 2004; Acheraïou, 2011). Hybridity constitutes a key component in the interdisciplinary effort to better understand the unequal relations between colonizers and colonized, claiming that subaltern's identity is not constructed in a clear opposition to hegemony but instead it is constructed through the ambivalent processes of translation and itineration. The concept has been criticized for its lack of uniformity as it may be understood as descriptive (hybridity as *métissage*), or normative, remarking subaltern capacity to subvert forms of oppression challenging hegemony not only in a discursive level but also in a practical level. Following Bhabha (1994) resistance forms may be understood as a way to challenge power which does not have to be direct; in its performance may collaborate with power or copy its strategies. A complex understanding of hybridity, as form and strategy (Young, 2004: 345), is inspirational for the understanding of informal initiatives, as even when they clearly oppose to established powers they never combat their dominancy directly. At the same time, our attempt is to frame the so called "migration crisis" as a postcolonial situation in an arena where such approach is not traditional (Lánský, 2014). Refugees are understood as a subaltern entering into the European arena as components of alteration, as they are portrayed as a rupture or a threat to supposed national homogeneities. In our local context, Central-Eastern Europe, the opposition against those searching for mobility hides a hierarchy of unbalanced power structures dominated by privileged European citizens.

In our study hybridity is not only studied as a component of the postcolonial subjects but it is approached through the hybrid performance of the volunteers groups, which emerged providing basic humanitarian aid across the route. Their hybridity resides in their radical transgression of the discursive limits of us and them, which divides population in deserving and undeserving. Informal initiatives think and act beyond the parameters of any methodological nationalism (Wimmer & Glick Schiller, 2002,) not only forming groups with aims and actions go beyond the national scope but performing a real transnational agency across borders. Their negation to respect or reproduce physical and discursive borders is a consequence of their unacceptance of established legal inequality on the basis of the nation state and its logics. In such a way, they constitute an opposition to hegemonic conceptions establishing who has the right to live in Europe, who deserves protection or whose mobility must be stopped.

In this work, analysis focuses on the performance of hybridity as a practice. Our methodological decision is also a reaction to the critics targeting the concept, asking for the need to discuss the concept in concrete material and political contexts (Acheraiou, 2011). We propose to work with the term *performative hybridity* as a way to conceptualize the capacity of this social actor to perform subversive actions, opposing political and economic hegemony and negating constructed binarism of legal citizenship from a radical position. Paradoxically in occasions, intentionally or unintentionally, informal initiative copy and reproduce domination practices. Their hybridity is not understood as a characteristic of a concrete group but as a tactic or strategy responding to a concrete arena, where the practice of hybridity turns to be an advantage. It is our hope to move further with the articulation of this concept from the understanding of informal initiatives helping refugees as simple counter power groups or as temporary forms of civic society. Through the study of their performative hybridity we hope to be able to contribute to the debate of current forms of civic society in Europe and the way to approach future migration challenges. Discussion is located in a network of diverse tensions and positions among present social actors in the field. It is through the study of these tensions in concrete situations where the hybrid character of their agency is manifested. Having this in account the text will analyze the relation of informal initiatives with state authorities, formal NGOs and refugees.

2. Methodology

Under the methodological label “informal initiatives” researchers refer to a heterogeneous group of public engagement initiatives which arose as a response to the so called “refugee crisis”. Even when such groups manifest a rich diversity attention is located on groups following grassroots logic under a manifested will to establish a horizontal organization, focused on direct action and performing a constructive intention of interaction within other actors that undercover their critical positions (Arditti, 2012).

Researchers have followed these groups to arenas of exercised power – where conflict interactions took place – using multi-sited ethnography as an appropriate tool (Marcus, 1995; Falzon, 2012). The field was physically located on different “non-places” (Augé, 1995), such as

border corridors¹, train stations² and other relevant points of the migration route³. Such places were strictly controlled by formal authorities as they were the so called “hot spots” where “the crisis” was taken place. Participants of informal initiatives were forced to find a pragmatic way to perform their activities in a very complicated arena where in principle only legitimate state forces and certain civil society actors were supposed to be. Focusing on power and power exercising, and with the help of ethnographic methods, researchers participated and observed how “volunteers” interact within a complex network trying to gain and maintain a legitimate status that allowed them to perform their activities. In the internal fight to solve such difficulties is where hybridity takes place. Power and hybridity are performed through practice so descriptive efforts will try to contextualize and discuss them through field situations.

The research demanded a long term approach, from September 2015 to February 2016, combining peaks of intensive participation and diverse forms of engagement in the field with a continuous monitoring of the initiatives activities. The field proved to be strongly rich in ethnographic materials which were closely analyzed, such as diaries collecting observations and casual conversations on the field, pictures and recorded interviews with initiative participants (Horst, 2015). Engagement with informal initiatives opened us the possibilities to discuss our research with participants of informal initiatives and to carry on in depth interviews with key informants (Hale, 2008). The fact that the emergence and disappearance of informal initiatives occurred ad hoc, as responses to the changing conditions and fast developments which characterized the route during research period turned diachronic approaches into a challenge. Our efforts focused on providing enough information of concrete situations in order to locate analyzed situation on clearly explanatory contexts.

3. Informal activities and authorities

3.1 *When restricted areas are not completely restricted*

Informal initiatives are forced to interact with authorities who control the areas where the migration route takes place. Often they may be covered by certain anonymity provided by public spaces when the action is taking place in urban environments such as train stations or squares in their nearby. Municipalities and local authority forces may even find their activities convenient as they solve a social aspect that could easily be pointed as their responsibility. The logic of interactions within authorities must be readapted in areas of border crossings such as corridors or transit facilities. Those areas are usually strictly controlled by authorities and entering in to transit zones is also restricted. At the same time volunteers need to enter in to these areas in order to reach their target, the refugees in need. This situation should be in principle conflictual but reality is that in observed areas volunteers managed not only to enter but even to build aid camps and informal facilities to storage and distribute aid in the restricted areas.

In appearance authorities developed a strict strategy in order to control and limit public engagement in restrictive areas. One of their most common tactics was to request informal camps to join a census of volunteers forcing them to perform their activities under a formalized

¹ Paradigmatic is the case of the border closing at Röszke after the Hungarian government completed its fence closing the previous crossing corridors. Researchers were present at the moment the fence was finally closed and an improvised refugee camp arose in the no man's land between Serbia and Hungary on 15 September 2015. Researchers were also able to experience and observe the following corridors: Horgoš (Serbia) – Röszke (Hungary); Berkasovo (Serbia) – Bapska (Croatia); Botovo (Croatia) – Zákány (Hungary); and Hegyeshalom (Hungary) – Nickelsdorf (Austria).

² Observation and engagement activities took place in main train stations in Prague, Vienna, München and Keleti train station in Budapest.

³ Such as aid storages and logistics centurms controlled by informal initiatives in Vienna and Bratislava.

actor, such as an NGO or an international actor, as for example Red Cross. Volunteers had the obligation to inform from their activities and to formalize their position what could have a strong impact in their previous independency. In practice, the whole situation could be described as chaotic. Authorities were clearly overcome by the situation and could not totally control the transit of refugees, so controlling other actors was secondary. On the other hand, some volunteers stayed on the field maybe only a few days what means that formal procedures were not always possible to accomplish as they took often longer time. Flexibility *de facto* coexisted within restrictive measures that could be also avoided claiming to “be waiting for documents”. In such a way, a restrictive strategy coming from authorities turned to provide a flexible situation where covering tactics allowed volunteers to claim a status of *quasi* legitimacy.

Not only the presence of volunteers in the area and the construction of camps were tolerated but also the continuous logistic aid convoys crossed across the restrictive areas every day. Almost in a daily basis loaded vehicles crossed the official controls and entered into restricted areas full of food, clothes, blankets and other materials for the camps. Paradoxically – and in contrast with the strict control that governments claimed to have over the so called “hot spots” of the “refugee crisis” – a continuous traffic of vehicles of engaged citizens was taken place in restricted areas without any special permission neither to transport or to distribute goods or food.

Paradoxically, authorities’ strict control of the areas turned to be the best legitimacy for the informal camps. Camps were tolerated and legitimated by their activities. For example, authorities controlled hygienic conditions of food storage and had different perspective of activities such as cooking, in occasions allowing volunteers to cook for refugees but also forbidden them to do it. This control was not only restrictive but when positive, it formalized volunteers’ position and established clear boundaries of legitimate action for informal initiatives. Paradoxically the camps, as a way of resistance, found legitimacy under the control of establishment forces.

3.2 Are we enemies? Let’s talk about it sharing a coffee or a drink

It is remarkable that volunteers cultivated and reconfigured their *a priori* incongruences and ambivalences, such as their opposition to authorities. Different tactics described below help informal initiatives to perform a constructed hybridity which focus was on turning their liminal positions into an advantage. Efforts to get closer to authorities and establish a functional network with other social actors was developed as a tactic on the field. Keeping a good relationship with policemen ensured certain tolerance and flexibility which potentially could facilitate informal initiatives actions. Tactics and approximation behaviors in order to build an arena of mutual trust, and in doing so reinforce collaboration, were embodied in small gestures of everyday life in the conflict areas. For example, at Bapska corridor some policemen got used to drink a morning coffee at the aid camp. Volunteers offered them a hot drink and nice chat. They joked and talked about the difficulties during the night shift. Some officers called volunteer’s by their name and shared breakfast break with them. Volunteers read encounters as an opportunity to legitimate their work and earn trust. For authorities was probably also an advantageous situation as they could monitor volunteers camps and activities and keep a direct contact with key volunteers that could become their mediators in case of need. Often locals, who were employed by the municipality to keep the area clean, also joined informal “coffee groups” served by volunteers in front of their tents. During a few minutes the coffee break transformed the transit area in a meeting point for those who stayed and shared the “hot spot” arena day after day. Even when the nature every actor was clearly distant and sometimes in opposition, the morning coffee ritual allowed volunteers to place themselves in a closer and more legitimate position manipulating their hybridity once again in their favor.

In a similar way but this time during night shifts volunteers' tents received the visit of officers and part of the crew of Red Cross. Volunteers had always ready in a discreet part of their storage a bottle of local spirits and they took turns to have a shot with visitors. One or two shots of *palinka*⁴ kept the bodies warm and gave everyone strength to confront night events. These attitudes extremely informal could be easily criticized and read in moral disapproval. In the field it was interpreted as a way to build a community between the different actors confronting a *Dantesque* situation. Mutual brotherhood arose from these informal practices and located all actors as part of a common collective. Volunteer's tactic allowed police forces to express their ambivalence as they were not mechanic oppressor but also humans who could empathies with others suffering. The advantage for volunteers is obvious: they found a clear legitimacy; and their presence was now read as the social meeting points where everyone could be a human and not only a police member or part of a bigger organization. Visitors often manifested their frustrations connected to their roles in the refugee crisis. Officers showed their humanity and their empathy within refugees. Policemen often talked about the war, what was also a part of their childhood. They shared their worries about the dangers of such a journey, the sea, bomb attacks, mines, sexual aggressions for women or other abuses during the route as kidnapping or thefts. They shared these thoughts with volunteers that were seen in their eyes as "good people but extremely naïve". With such a discourse they also legitimated their position as authorities. They constructed their image as a strict protection agent, which even when may not show clear sympathy for refugees, is protecting them from the "real" hazards from the route. Distancing themselves from the image of oppressive forces they reconstruct their positions in paternalist approached towards refugees but also towards volunteers⁵. Approaching tactics between social actors lead to the depolarization of their *a priori* opposite conditions. Mutual alteration is reinterpreted recognizing, even when every actor does it through very different subjectivities, their proximity or belonging to a common position. Previous observations showing hybridity articulations may be framed in Bhabha's described capacities of what he called a Third Space (Bhabha, 1994: 38).

The impact in the field of such a resistance practices was that breaks and informal interactions benefited collaboration when everyone was performing their established roles. As refugee groups were transiting across the volunteers camp friendly officers pointed volunteers their needs with sentences like: "Find some shoes for that kid" or "Don't you have something warm to cover those babies". In another occasion weather forecast announced a big storm for the night. Red Cross received thousands of raincoats but did not have enough personal to distribute them. The solution was to unite forces with their "drinking contacts" among volunteers. Volunteers did not only get access to other organization resources but again they earn legitimacy and their difference with an established civic actor as Red Crossed became blurred in practice. Trust and community experience was also turned into police officers closing their eyes to certain activities that were not allowed to volunteers but were morally legitimated, such as regrouping families in order that they could travel in the same bus to next transit location; finding medical help in case of need; and even allowing them to exceptionally transport in their vans people in need. At the same time, proximity with authorities opened the possibility of new forms of resistance on the basis of flexibility between obedience and disobedience. Volunteers gained some possibility not to fully or immediately fulfil authorities orders such as keeping the lines or showing certain laziness to accomplish police mandates when were in opposition with their principles. Forms of resistance were articulated in a context where opposition and conflict were conducted to certain collaboration. But this situation was clearly unstable and as we describe below was not free of tensions.

⁴ Local spirits.

⁵ Similar paternalistic approaches have been observed by author when presenting their research on informal activities to political actors interested on civil society approaches towards refugees.

3.3 *When the volunteer's body becomes the meeting point of two worlds in conflict*

A clear example of how volunteers embody the tensions between authorities and refugees could be found in the following field experience. During our stay at Bapska corridor police forces changed again their people. Through the volunteers a rumor spread saying that policemen were becoming too weak. It seems that the origin of previous policemen, who came from nearest areas to Bapska corridor, which was one of the most affected areas during the Balkan war, played a big role in their growing empathy towards refugees. Empathy and solidarity towards refugees constituted a problem for them at the time to fulfill orders. The rumor was pictured with powerful scenes claiming that some volunteers spotted policemen crying at the corridor. Being the rumor true or not, during the night new and unknown authorities were on the field and previous power balance did not apply anymore. The new policemen were aggressive and rude. They continuously shout orders to the refugees and limited the areas of action and time capacity of the volunteers. They even did not allow groups of refugees to stop at the aid camp to take water, food or clothes. Volunteers tried to mediate with officers. Their response was arbitrary; some of them became a little bit more flexible allowing refugees to briefly stop at the camp, while others kept marching showing clear opposition to volunteers. Volunteers discussed the possibilities of action: should they respect the new-*status quo* and try a long term strategy patiently earning a friendlier environment; or should they openly oppose police behavior and risk the camp existence and good relations with some of the *establishment* members. This was a powerful dilemma. While discussion between volunteers was taking place inside the tents, outside groups of refugees kept crossing the corridor under the demeaning yells and shouts of some of the officers. It was time to take a decision in order to solve the dilemma as soon as possible. The consensual strategy decided not to confront aggressive officers when they did not allow refugees to stop by the camp but instead take alternative action. From one side volunteers from the “clothes” area will rapidly monitored extreme needs, as people without shoes or children without warm clothes. Then they will just run and provide aid “on the move”. Another volunteer will welcome the group and escort it through the corridor. His or her role will be to calm the situation providing information and speaking in a friendly way to refugees. In practice, having someone identified with the reflective vest located between the officer and the group soon calm the situation. Officers were not so free to yell at the groups and even when they do it the volunteer offered his counter discourse. At the same time any abuse from the part of authorities will be immediately reported by the volunteer. The volunteer would also try to avoid situations that potentially could increase the nervousness of authorities, such as fragmentation of the group or the separation of some of the group members. Also volunteers slightly tried to keep the order of two lines⁶ that was also appreciated by officers as it fits their para-military criteria of order. In doing so the officer also got something from volunteer's collaboration and the tensions tend to low. Walking through the corridor the hybrid body of the volunteer became a barrier protecting refugees and controlling authorities' agency. With the only help of a reflective vest and a friendly discourse volunteers inverted the logic of fear created by new police forces into certain equilibrium under the parameters of humanitarian action. Their corporal position serves also as an example of their liminal condition in between the two worlds embodied in establishment forces – as the embodiment or at least performer of establishment oppression, and refugees – as subaltern.

⁶ Establishment forces tent to organized transit refugees into groups of 50 or 60 people ordering them to march into two parallel lines. Volunteers usually did not clearly collaborate with this practice, as in their understanding, its martial nature constituted a tension towards scared refugees who were treated as prisoners.

3.4 *Tricking male hierarchies*

In a similar way another paradox affects articulations of hierarchy in the camps. Even when the ideology and practice of most of the studied camps claimed a strong preference for non-hierarchical horizontality a figure of a “coordinator” often emerged as a link to the outside world. In occasions a member of the camp acted as a reference person for authorities in order to mediate and communicate with the camp. The “coordinator” could also act as a reference person for newcomers joining the camp. For example in Bapska camp at the time of our research a young Swiss girl was often pointed by volunteers as the contact person for newcomers, and she also was requested by authorities when they needed to communicate with volunteers. She had been the longest time at the camp so was understood as a leading continuity by authorities and at the same time her knowledge and experience was respected by new volunteers. It is interesting to notice that her leadership based on her continuity and experience was not something that she easily accepted. She refused to be addressed as coordinator and always explained her preference for horizontal approaches to everyone who just arrived. She refused to take her own decisions neither command tasks to do. Even when she was recognized as a legitimate “leader” of the camp, the own internal logic of power erased any possibility of leadership. At the same time she accepted temporal functions of representation in order to maintain a constructive relationship with the authorities, using the hybrid mask of coordinator in front of the *others*. Her power is again in our understanding an embodiment of hybridity as is born in an internal contradiction between the “world” of the camps and the “world” of formal authorities. Two worlds forced to meet and manipulated by volunteers in such a way that conflict and opposition are turned into compromises allowing them to transform both realities. In this case there is a clear intention to perform their hybridity on their favor even when a priori they are admitting a compromise against their own logic.

The feminist glasses of any social researcher will certainly remark the carnivalesque character of previous leadership compromise. It is true that the informal initiatives compromised to accept the imposition of a representative coordinator but in many cases this coordinator were young female activists. An observation repeated on the field, a young female coordinator discussing, negotiating, making compromises, with always male army authorities or male police officers. Gender contradictions should be remarked as informal initiatives deeply contra posed the patriarchal limits of our societies. Female activists’ empowerment found not clear gender barriers in a social situation opposing the established logics of society. As a consequence young girls performed highly responsibility or representative positions even interacting within one of the most masculinized areas of current societies, the army.

It must be remarked that even when volunteers may manage on the field to establish a functional collaboration with authorities, solid boundaries are also kept between them. One of these limits is the access to information. In occasions authorities did not share information about the expected number of refugees arriving to the area neither informed of the official plans and perspectives. Such a lack of transparency forced volunteer work to be a continuous improvisation in a context of uncertainty and information chaos. Hence, it is difficult to balance interaction with authorities as they were always in a changing context or circumstantial tensions. In a formal level tensions kept an unstable equilibrium between tolerance and legitimate recognition. In informal levels tensions were embodied in dense social networks of personal interactions under a chaotic situation that overcome all present social actors.

4. Interactions with formal civil society

Informal initiatives constitute a form of public engagement constructed until certain extent in opposition to common organized civil society actors, such as NGO’s or transnational human rights organizations (Harell-Bond, 2002). With a strong preference for independent and

self-organizing systems informal initiatives negate the role of mediator between “subalterns in need” and “public” whose agency is limited to founding of supporting NGOs projects. Such tendency is motivated by a worldview understanding formal actors of civil society as part of the establishment. Inefficiency of established civil agents was confirmed in the eyes of volunteers with their incapacity to confront the humanitarian disaster taking place under the label of “refugee crisis”. A parallel could be established with Nandy’s cruel label for elite nationalists as “ornamental dissenter’s (Young, 2004: 344, quoting Nandy, 1983: xiv). In terms of meanings and self-identification informal initiatives distance themselves from organized civil society and try to approach to the subaltern. A participant put it in the following words: “Let’s do something real”. Is this symbolic dislocation what transformed them in society hybrids as their position is characterized by the incongruences and inconsistencies of their refusal to the “world” they previously belong and their search for a new position a more active roles in the alternative their initiatives perform.

Disaffection to their previous environment is clearly manifested for example in a strong attitude of no-label politics⁷. Informal initiatives avoid clear definitions or any other construct that could turn them in an essentialist version of themselves putting them again under the logic of establishment forces.

4.1 Acting under the cover of a formal actor

The complexity of the field forced informal initiatives to act covered under a formal civil organization. Such was the case of a group of volunteers connected to SOS Röske⁸ providing aid to refugees inside the Opatovac transit facilities. Opatovac facilities, under strict military control, received refugees who came directly by bus after crossing the Bapska corridor. There, they had to wait an uncertain time (could be a few hours or one or two days) to continue their journey taking a train to Botovo, at the border with Hungary. The area was controlled by the army and only formal humanitarian entities such as Red Cross or Doctors without Borders were allowed to enter in the camp. Informal volunteers managed to establish a collaboration under Red Cross thanks to a personal relationship with a “functional coordinator” from the informal initiative and the person in charged at the local Red Cross. The collaboration allowed informal volunteers to go through a bureaucratic process of registration which gave them entrance into the very restricted area. This strategy allowed them to have a permanent storage inside the military camp, which was regularly supplied by informal donations, and a tent with tens of plugs for charge mobile phones. The access to the camp was used also by an independent volunteer who used the cover of Red Cross to install an independent WiFi Point inside the restricted area. As the tent in the camp was relatively small, and volunteers were not allowed to enter into the camp with their vehicles, an informal camp emerged next to the transit facilities. In a next field, informal volunteers established their camping tents to spend the nights and also big tents serving for storage for clothes, mostly coming from Austria that will be distributed inside the camp. Improvised headquarters served as the same time as communal kitchen for volunteers and logistic center. Several white boards organized in a horizontal way: distribution of shifts for tasks inside the camp; logistics; and their own transport in cars coming from and leaving to Austria or Germany. Other tasks, such as treading and organizing clothes in the storages were taken voluntarily without any formal mediation. In doing so, the informal initiatives adapted its nature to two very different logics being able on the one hand to cope under the restrictive bureaucratic military regime inside the transit camp, and in the other hand keeping their liberty of engagement of their members and their horizontal strategies. More than a contradiction, observations are again an embodiment of their hybrid condition which

⁷ A paradigmatic example may be found in Vienna’s train station where members of organized social actors, such as Red Cross or other established NGOs, should cover the logos in their clothes and vests with adhesive tape as a requirement imposed by informal initiatives acting in the area.

⁸ SOS Röske, see at <https://www.facebook.com/events/898993260182425/>, accessed 13 September 2015.

is performed always in adaptation to tactics and strategies on the field. The relation with Red Cross was just a formal requirement that allowed volunteers to build an informal camp next to the military facilities in principle covered by the legitimacy of the Red Cross.

4.2 *Tensions and conflicts with formal civil society*

Interactions with formalized actors conforming civil society is not aware of tensions and conflicts. During the field researchers could engage in situations where both actors needed each other and were forced to join forces. An illustrative example could be a short sketch from the chaotic days of middle September 2015 at an improvised refugee camp which emerged after the completion of Hungarian plot closing a previous corridor between Serbia and Hungary. Thousands of refugees got stocked in their way in an area without any infrastructure. Informal initiatives and independent volunteers rapidly established a camp offering medical aid and distributing food, clothes and drinking water. Soon, formal actors were also present in the area. During the first days there was a lack of drinking water in the area. In one or two days water tanks will be provided by civil society organizations alleviating basic needs but in the while a solution was needed. A small team from a Central Eastern European NGO present in the first hours had the capacity to pay for water pallets. But they did not count with a way to transport it, neither counted with the human resources necessary to distribute the water in such a chaotic situation. In a public volunteers assembly NGO workers asked for potential help to independent volunteers. Their vans could provide the transport and they could do the distribution walking across the occupied fields with tents and improvised camps. The collaboration was established but the two actors soon entered into conflict.

Driving back to the field she [the NGO's leader] started to do some confidences about her feelings about the buying water action and collaboration with independent volunteers. She was very upset after buying the water because it was not an efficient action. She was completely right but thanks to the volunteers they could manage to do something that they have no options before. They had the money but they needed people and transports. She was also annoyed because the other van [meaning a group of volunteers who provided their logistic capacity] expressed their willing to start distributing water by their own [meaning not under the NGO commands]. She wanted to keep the water in the storage and control the distribution process. She claimed: It is OUR water. We PAID for it.

Rodríguez's fieldnotes, Röscke, 15 September 2015.

Volunteers understood the situation in terms of cooperation among equals and demanded a strong respect for everyone's independency. The NGO leader understood the situation as a benefit for her and she presupposed a superior hierarchical role over volunteers based in NGO's professionalism and economic capacity. The narration of this conflict attempts to exemplify the different perspective of both actors. Even when volunteers, and until certain extent also NGO members, were able to perform their hybrid condition in mutual terms their alterations emerged creating opposition. Volunteers reinforced their liminal position defending their independency while the NGO leader expected to maintain their dominant position. Even where both actors where a priori in close proximity and shared very similar goals their approaches were so different that the alteration between them kept growing into an escalating tension.

5. Interactions with refugees

5.1 *Reinforcing their subaltern condition*

In the previous narratives is remarkable the absence of agency or even the lack of presence as subjects of refugees. Interactions with the diverse category covered under the label

“refugee” were radically subjected to the circumstances under which the encounter took place. Often the nature of the interaction was limited by extreme temporal limitations. An example is the walking corridors where refugees nearly did not have time to stop in the camp aid, they rapidly took what they needed and continued. In other places such as train station or transit areas the interaction could get more complex as it had the opportunity to be prolonged on time. Field observations will explore one of the biggest challenges confronted by informal initiatives which deeply arose from their ambivalence and hybrid condition: how to interact within refugees in order not to reproduce establishment colonialist approaches.

Researchers could observe and participate in several public assemblies which took place during the mid-September events at Röske. Assemblies were introduced as the main instrument to organized independent volunteers and to design their interaction within authorities, formal civil society actors and refugees. Their approach towards refugees was clearly non-inclusive. Starting with the fact that there were no refugees present in the assembly. Other actors, as NGO’s workers, joined and unified forces with the informal agents. Current analyses points to the emergence of a colonialist dilemma (Long, 2013). Volunteers were distancing themselves from their target group. In such a way, they were constructing a differentiation between “those able to help” and “those who need help”; those who have agency and those who are mere objects. Certainly such a difference was not aware of contradictions. Some volunteers pointed the potential benefit of increasing their working capacities if they extend their agency to refugees. But still them, this argumentation hides an opportunistic approach objectivizing refugees as labor force to be used or commanded. The language skills of some of the refugees qualified them as valuable translators, and in doing so, as potential mediators between volunteers and the refugees. Another task pointed as requiring external labor force was garbage collection, in order ensuring certain hygienic conditions. It is remarkable that potential refugee agency was understood under the planning or commands of the volunteers what constitutes a contradiction with their claimed independency and self-organization, basic characteristics in the construction of informal initiatives. A clear embodiment was observed in the space where the assembly took place, which also served as storage. The area was limited by a cordon, separating the “refugee areas” from the “volunteers’ headquarters”. Refugees were not expected to cross the cordon neither to take part of decision making processes. They were transformed in an “object” which received help or which was considered useful as “translation tools” that could provide mediation between volunteers and the “others”. In doing so, informal initiatives reinforced the condition of refugees as a subaltern. Such incongruences are characteristic for hybrid actors who even when their efforts search the emancipation from subjugating powers are not always able to avoid its reproduction.

5.2 When mimicry is turned into sarcasm

A final observation reinforces the articulation of the hybrid condition of volunteers and the strong incongruence embodied in their own nature. In the housing facilities of Gabčíkovo⁹ provided and controlled by Slovak Government in collaboration with Austrian authorities researchers were surprised to meet young guys wearing vests and acting as mediators within refugees and authorities. The profile seemed to fit in what our research efforts was trying to define as “independent volunteers” or “members of an informal initiatives”. To our surprise they were employed by the Slovak Interior Ministry as mediators or social workers. They were the bridge between authorities and refugees but clearly subjected to authorities program. It is remarkable that the dominant forces adopted the image of the volunteer providing their workers with “no-label” vests. It is a clear embodiment of the hybridity of the volunteer figure: a friendly power located in the liminality between the two worlds. In this case, establishment managed to

⁹ In July 2015 the Slovak Government – based on a bilateral agreement signed with the Austrian ministry of Interior - agreed to temporarily house in the town of Gabčíkovo near the Hungarian border around 500 refugees.

manipulate the meaning of the hybrid component and benefited from its symbolic half-way position. The situation reminds the descriptions of mimicry where the colonized attempts to imitate colonizer modes and behaviors but always the result is somehow comic and demeaning. In our case the situation turned into sarcasm as establishment capitalized the powerful image of the independent volunteer on its favor.

6. Conclusions

During the last decade life among European societies have become an art of surviving continuous crisis. The so called “refugee crisis” seems to have reinforce embodiments and ways of resistance of certain parts of local population who construct themselves in clear opposition to establishment’s hegemony. Understanding the heterogeneous group under the label “refugee” as subaltern, critical forms of public engagement organized in what authors propose to call informal initiatives. Their main aim was to provide aid to refugees across very diverse spots of the so called Balkan route. Through a series of multi-site fieldworks and engagement, authors gain ethnographic knowledge about informal activities and their interactions with other social actors in the field. Informal initiatives are constructed in opposition to hegemonic values but in their performance are not aware of incongruences and ambivalences. Performance hybridity characterizing informal initiatives is performed through their agency focused on helping refugees. Their actions as they oppose establishment and confront it in their performance are understood as a way of resistance. Through ethnographic efforts authors tried to describe and interpret the way the hybridity of informal initiative is performed towards three different social actors: establishment forces as an articulation of establishment oppression; civil society characterized by certain “ornamental dissenter” position; and finally towards refugees as a subaltern.

Informal initiatives manipulate their hybridity and ambivalence developing tactics to be able to carry their help activities on the field. Even in occasions, complex strategies arose benefiting from their knowledge as insiders of the social reality they are opposing. Emerging ways of resistance may even challenge the deep structures of European societies. Participants do not enter in dialectical opposition with public arena but discreetly build an alternative reality for their activities. With their action they reconstruct their ambivalence as a tactic. Such alternative approach to refugees and interaction within them do not only oppose to the political or societal approaches to the so called “migration crisis” – they are performing acts of dissidence closed to civil disobedience. With their actions informal initiatives confront the established limits of the deserving solidarity group formed under a nation-state paradigm and spreading it to a universal framework (Yarris & Castañeda, 2015). As a consequence of this fact and remarking their inclusive approach to refugees informal initiatives also negate the dominant social construction of migrants as main figures and holders of alteration. Their preference for direct action may also challenge current paradigms of who has the possibility to implement any social agency. Agency in social affairs is currently stressed as a state or politician capacities, complemented or corrected by established social society but is not expected to be implemented by normal citizens. Negation of representative actors generates an estrangement between informal initiatives and formal civil society actor that a priori share similar interests. The solidarity agency and confrontation agency to injustice seems to be dislocated from the established civil society spectrum. Informal initiatives, in their continuous stress of independent agency and inclusive equality, confront also gender inequality and in doing so the basic pillars of patriarchy. The sum of such oppositions and ways of resistance turned informal initiatives into a transformative actor in similar way as last European social movements (della Porta & Diani, 2006; Badiou, 2012).

Observations on the field described how the performance of their hybridity may turn into empowerment and legitimacy. A preference to create dense social networks within other social actors is used to cover their conflict opposition tending to create collaboration areas. Inequality of agency possibilities and previous constructed approaches towards the “other” may

also turned their hybrid condition in embodiments that in contradiction to their principles reproduce or reinforce criticized establishment's values. Their legitimacy and recognition by refugees may also be manipulated by other social actors as in the case of Gabčíkovo. The question for the future is until which point informal initiatives helping refugees, understood as a way of resistance, could go beyond the "refugee crisis" and have a transformative impact in European societies.

Acknowledgements

The research was conducted with the support of the Czech Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, grant project IGA_FF_2014_056.

The authors declare no competing interests.

References

- Acheraiou, A. (2011). *Questioning hybridity, postcolonialism and globalization*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Arditti, B. (2012). Insurgencies don't have a plan – they are the plan: Political performatives and vanishing mediators in 2011. *Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies*, 1, 1-16.
- Augé, M. (1995). *Non-places. Introduction to an anthropology of supermodernity*. London: Verso.
- Badiou, A. (2012). *The rebirth of history – Times of riots and uprising*. London: Verso.
- Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The location of culture*. London: Routledge.
- della Porta, D., & Diani, M. (2006). *Social movements: An introduction*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Blackwell. First published 1999.
- Falzon, M.-A. (2012). *Multi-sited ethnography: Theory, praxis and locality in contemporary research*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Hale, Ch. (2008). *Engaging contradictions: Theory, politics, and methods of activist scholarship*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Harrell-Bond, B. E. (2002). Can humanitarian work with refugees be humane? *Human Rights Quarterly*, 24(1), 51-85.
- Holmes, S. M., & Castañeda, H. (2016). Representing the 'European Refugee Crisis' in Germany and beyond: Deservingness and difference, life and death. *American Ethnologist*, 43(1), 12-24.
- Horst, H. A. (2015). Being in fieldwork: Collaboration, digital media and ethnographic practice. In: R. Sanjek & S. Tratne (Eds.), *eFieldnotes: The makings of anthropology in a digital world* (153-168). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Kallius, A., Monterescu, D., & Rajaram, P. K. (2016). Immobilizing Mobility: Border ethnography, illiberal democracy, and the politics of the 'refugee crisis' in Hungary. *American Ethnologist*, 43(1), 25-37.
- Lánský, O. (2014). Postkolonialismus a dekolonizace: Základní vymezení a inspirace pro sociální vědy. *Sociální studia*, 11(1), 41-60.
- Long, K. (2013). When refugees stopped being migrants: Movement, labour and humanitarian protection. *Migration Studies*, 1(1), 4-26.

- Malkki, L. H. (1995). Refugees and exile: From 'refugee studies' to the national order of things. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24, 495-523.
- Marcus, G. E. (1995). Ethnography in/of the world system: The emergence of multi-sited ethnography. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24, 95-117.
- Speed, Sh. (2006). At the crossroads of human rights and anthropology: Toward a critically engaged activist research. *American Anthropologist*, 108(1), 66-76.
- Wimmer, A., & Glick Schiller, N. (2002). Methodological nationalism and beyond: Nation-state building, migration and the social sciences. *Global Networks*, 2(4), 301-34.
- Yarris, K., & Castañeda, H. (2015). Discourses of displacement and deservingness: Interrogating distinctions between 'economic' and 'forced' migration. *International Migration*, 53(3), 64-69.
- Young, R. J. C. (2004). *Postcolonialism. An historical introduction*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

“Has the West Lost It? A Provocation”: A Comment in Regard to the End of Western Dominance (Book Review)

Emil Heršak & Tibor Komar

University of Zagreb, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, CROATIA

Received: 2 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 20 April 2020 ▪ Published Online: 3 August 2020

1. Book review

The book under the above title was published by Kishore Mahbubani (1948–) last year. Mahbubani was born in Singapore and was originally from the Sindh Indian people, who arrived in Southeast Asia in a small number, perhaps under the influence of Western colonists (considering that Britain had already occupied India in the 19th century. Otherwise, this author was Singapore’s representative to the United Nations in 1984-1989 and 1998-2004, and was also a representative of the UN Security Council from 2001-2002. These factors are certainly very important when considering the contents of the book.

The title of this book can be translated literally from English into Croatian: “Je li Zapad izgubio?”, though it would be convenient to expand: “Will the West lose its dominance [in the world]?” And it should be added (in small letters) that commentary “provocation”, even though the author was not critical toward the West, and in fact at the very end of the paper he wrote that this was essentially a “gift to the West” ... because he clearly wants the West to settle normally, because it would be a great tragedy if the West triggered turbulence (unrest) and obviously other negative factors (pp. 90-91).

Mostly the text points out that the West has become the most dominant in the world over the last two centuries, and if there were no two world wars in the 20th century then the West could be dominant still “for many centuries” (p. 20). However, it would be convenient if the author defined the term “West” at the beginning of the work, because in all likelihood it only applies to the US, Great Britain, probably some Western countries in Europe (but not Eastern, not Russia), and probably Canada and Australia (though Australia is not located in the West). So, it would actually be convenient first briefly to define what the “West” is. And, for the rest of the area the author uses the term “Rest”, which would mean the rest of the world. But when the book is read, it becomes enough clearly the center of the West is essentially the US, Great Britain – and the countries that first joined the EU, while that “rest” mainly is Asia, Africa, South (so-called “Latin”) America and also Russia. And we can think where would be our Croatia before it liberated itself from the former Yugoslavia and subsequently joined the EU.

The author’s main thesis is that the West no longer has a dominant role in the world, and that this decline is in the upper hand authorities formed after the end of the Cold War. But the West continued to encourage some conflicts and wars, while other countries were increasingly developing. Supposedly, China, India and even Indonesia will soon become major and the most important countries in the world, especially through the economy and the fact that their rulers are increasingly being strive to improve status of their citizens. Mahbubani also presented in the text

some accounts of the world economy development... where one map emphasizes that China will have the largest share around 2022 (p. 12), and in one another map is that China and India will have the largest share of GDP till 2050 (p. 25). Besides, the author pointed out that one inconvenient event in China, i.e. the 1989 Tiananmen Square crisis in Beijing, did not have such a negative impact on the country as the West thought... and there was no shock crisis in that because former President Deng Xiaoping (1904-1997) had already promoted the positive status of the Chinese citizens. But the author thinks the event influenced the West to become “blind” to the further development of China ... and certainly other “non-Western” countries (p. 42). What seems problematic in this section of the book is the author's idealization of GDP as the sole measure for a country's development, and the claim that development brings a better education for all, a longer life span, reducing crime rates, eradicating poverty and generally bringing happiness. As it is well known, contemporary research from the perspectives of anthropology of globalization and anthropology of development warns that increased consumption around the world, unsustainable growth of emerging economies and even the global trend of tourism expansion (p. 35) contribute to destabilization of world economies, increase of climate (and others) refugees, corruption and increased domestic and international conflicts. Also, citing the examples of Pakistan and Bangladesh as excellent examples of growing economies, the enormous poverty problems these countries are struggling with are again ignored here.

Regarding the basic development of the West, Mahbubani has repeatedly mentioned the violence that is the West doing more recently and – according to him – that breakup of Western domination, began after the end of the Cold War. And a negative occurrence, he noted, was NATO's expansion towards the European border along Russia, after communism had already been abolished in Russia. But based on various reviews, it is very clear if the author felt that the West should end conflicts and even attacks against other countries, and even Europe would have to establish “peace with Putin” (p. 67), and peace is essentially key positive dimension for the future, and that the West must follow. And in the world, supposedly, violence is becoming less and less... and people not only on the West are living longer ... and – according to the thesis – as early as 2030, half the world's people will have a middle class life status ... which is striking.

But as far as violence is concerned, the author particularly emphasized the very embarrassing war that the US launched in 2003 against Iraq, and they certainly wrongly linked the leader of Iraq, Saddam Hussein, with a strike to some buildings in the US, on 11 September 2001. The author also points out that the West had a negative relationship also in regard to Islam, even though this religion is (supposedly) evolving in the world. Even Europe (probably the EU) had instability towards the development of Islam worldwide.

However, as far as the positive elements of prehistory are concerned, the author said that the West also encouraged some key ideas around the world... and it can be concluded that phenomena such as cell phones, etc., have been interesting consequences throughout the world, also outside the West. The largest share of cell phones in the world is reportedly in the India, where 220 million people use these devices, while even the Southeast Asian country, Malaysia, has very large number of cell phones, and therefore ranked 9th in the world in that number. That would be Western influence ... but in essence the expansion of the cell phones had a greater advantage in the areas where due to the wide bands and hills, etc., it was much harder to build wire telephone infrastructure. The author did not necessarily mention this, although we believe that the spread of cell phones had interesting incentives both in the West and around the world, though Mahbubani added the detail that the Internet rapidly expanded in Malaysia, from 21.4% to 68.6% (p. 29).

In this book, the author also highlighted the positive ideas and educational supplements that the wider world has received from the West, and also the influence of Western educations around the world. But that and some other comments would be described very briefly now.

First, as far as expanding education from the West is concerned, it probably related mainly to the success of the United States. However, we should probably add a description presented by Bill Clinton, who believed that children's education in the US was not the most successful in the world, but is the best in some other Western countries (for that description see text: Bill Clinton, *Back to Work*, Zagreb: Mate, 2012). Mahbubani also wrote that the West was solving the problems of Asia, which had problems from the flood, etc. (p. 11). But there is one very opposite factor. According to an important BBC documentary, people in India could usually handle problems when floods erupted, but when Britain conquered that country and imposed an external capitalist model ... it triggered a loss of food from local people ... and reportedly 1880 – as many as 30 million Indians have starved to death (see BBC FOUR, *Racism. A History*. Editors: Tim Robinson and Marx Corrance, 2007). The BBC documentary also pointed out that a racist vision had arisen from the West in relation to other nations, and we can add that this may be related to some so-called the “eugenic” incentives that originated first in Great Britain – and therefore have been very extensively encouraged in the US, Germany and some other areas. And I can add that this eugenics had an impact on immigration to the United States... and because of that vision, because of a supposedly “less sense”, the US reduced the number of immigrants from Slavic eastern countries in 1924... and from Croatia. And quite contrary, some analyzes have confirmed that the smartest immigrant to arrive in the US was our Nikola Tesla (1856-1943), and we know that he wanted to make sure that all people could get electricity for free... but American scientist Thomas Edison (1847-1931), in essence – because of the impetus of capitalism, was significantly against Tesla's desire. Mahbubani claimed in his work that technologies, and even electricity, etc., going through capitalism (p. 11), and that would probably mean that it was also an intellectual impetus... but we just brought up that Tesla example. And of course Edison, who focused on capitalism, also raised other important subjects besides electricity... and for example electric bulbs – but still, he was not the first to invent those bulbs (the first examples were made in Britain and Russia, and not in the US). When referring to education, Mahbubani in several places in the book mentions the US as “the best educated society on Earth” (p. 52), which is a very interesting statement and in fact quite inaccurate in the context of any independent measurement where, for example, according to the 2017 PISA tests, the US holds an unprecedented 38th place in mathematics, and very similarly ranked in other areas.¹ He also portrays the term “reasoning” as an invention of the West, while neglecting centuries of Eastern philosophy or Islamic medicine and science, so it turns out that the whole world was just waiting for input from the West to begin thinking. What definitely obvious when reading a book are the numerous generalizations the author resorts to and which have no scientific basis – e.g. his idea of more and more Muslims becoming more religious actually contradicts recent data in support of societies becoming less religious, both in the West and the East (the example of Turkey is interesting because it shows a slightly increased number of believers, but also a considerable decline in their religiosity).²

Another additional detail may be interesting. Specifically, the author mentioned and described today Prime Minister of India, by the name of Narendra Modi, and was reportedly frequently criticized in the West, allegedly for right-wing nationalism, although it received support from Muslims (p. 17). However, it was not mentioned that in the text is another interesting feature, i.e. Modi avoided using English in international role³. And this actually has another key dimension that the author is a little different from described at the end of his paper. What is also striking is the praise of Prime Minister Narendra Modi, Chinese President Xi Jin Ping, and Indonesian President Joko Widod in the economic directions they lead their countries, which again

¹ <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/02/15/u-s-students-internationally-math-science/>.

² <https://interaktif.konda.com.tr/en/HayatTarzlari2018/#7thPage/1>.

³ Short description via Twitter, at <https://twitter.com/sampattoshniwal/status/506763508608802816>.

emphasizes purely economic social aspects, without taking into account other perspectives and the eventual consequences thereof.

The West must certainly get to know and respect the rest of the world, and learn about various other cultures, and has to allow equality of other peoples and ends military domination. And learning many other languages, whatever could be easily handled by computer, if the English would be replaced everywhere, then it would be very positive for our world development. And after all, we often mention one comment made by Gene Roddenberry (1921-1991), the man who started *Star Trek*, i.e. we must know and respect all the differences in the world, because otherwise we wouldn't be able to go into space at all. And that would probably be in line with the theses of the author Mahbubani. And he said Bill Clinton also argued that Americans need to adjust that they must not be “number one” (p. 81). However, as for today's US President Donald Trump, Mahbubani has concluded that Trump is not the best president, because he “doesn't even know about the world” (p. 87)! But still, if we read a Trump book a few years ago translated into Croatian, we can find one key review against illegal American war in Iraq (see Donald Trump, *Great Again: How to Fix our Crippled America*. Zagreb: Mate, 2016).⁴

But there is another weird detail that the author has outlined. In particular, he claimed that period 1990-2020 was the best phase in human history (p. 28). Certainly, it was also the end of the Cold War, and further development of the world would be great ... if all peoples respected others (and I may add that except Roddenberry also Pope Francis today had a similar view). Admittedly, that period after 1990 also led to war in our Croatia and B&H, which cannot be described as positive.

And we can add another author's focus. In particular, he mentioned the famous author Niccolo Machiavelli (1469-1527) several times (he also presented one of his descriptions at the beginning of his book). And emphasize that Machiavelli had thesis that the leader must take care of charity (p. 8), which is likely percussive. But he also said that many people in the West considered Machiavelli to be “the embodiment of evil” (p. 8), because it is essentially poorly understood, although the West needs to understand what Machiavelli had claimed (p. 63). But here there is one known detail that the author did not mention, i.e. may added in a comment. Machiavelli's work on the rule is not quite accurately translated into English. It is one well-known translation *lapsus*, and for an accurate understanding it is necessary to avoid English translation of this known work.⁵

Mahbubani's book is relatively short ... only 91 pages of text and 8 pages of notes and list page (index). If the text been a little larger, it might have covered some of the comments we made and mentioned in this review. But – regardless – we think this book should be translated (to our language) and post soon, because regardless some of comments ... the topic is crucial. Surely, the domination of one part of the world must be stopped ... and all different cultures and successes in the world should be respected.

⁴ Admittedly, he added, Hilary Clinton was in favor of this illegal war, so it could be interpreted as a detail from sources, because the main rival to Trump in presidential election was just her.

⁵ There is more confirmation that Machiavelli's translation in English is problematic, which leads to problems, although the Croatian translation from Italian is very accurate. Otherwise, in this regard, I added one note in the translation of the book: see Brendan Simms, *Europe. The Struggle for Supremacy, from 1453 to the Present*. Zagreb: Mate, 2016, p. 24. The English version used by Simms was completely inaccurate to the Italian, while in Croatian it was almost correct, and many other English authors do not realize that it was either a lapse or perhaps even a deliberately modified translation.

2. Notes

– A chapter from Machiavelli's work is before the first chapter is (iii).

(1) *A New Order of Things*

– A change in the history of 200 years Western domination; before, China and India were dominant (p. 3).

– The West has not triggered a world strategy, it has initiated wars ... Iraq, Syria, Russia's sanctions and criticism of China ... (7).

– The wrong interpretation of Machiavelli ... "Many in the West consider Machiavelli to be the embodiment of evil (8)" ... but according to M. the leader must first establish the goodness of others ...

– "Machiavelli advocated that a leader who makes himself 'responsible for the lives of others' must come first to put forth your charity." (8)

– World poverty is decreasing ... 1981 was 44% of poverty and now 2016 is 10% (10).

(2) *The Gift of Western Wisdom*

– The influence of Western "reasoning" ... the example that wanted *The Oxford English Dictionary* ... "adoption many new technologies, from modern medicine to electricity, from railways to cell phones ..." (11) but it still went over capitalism, and we know that Tesla had problems with Thomas Edison in the US, as for electricity, and so was the problem with light bulbs in the US ... it was rumored that Edison invented electric bulbs in the world, but this is NOT true ... those bulbs were invented in Britain (Joseph Swan from and even in Russia before that).

– The expression ... "The application of the scientific method has also provided solutions to seemingly unsolvable problems which Asians have had millennia, including floods and famines, pandemics and poverty." (11) ... but this is not exactly ... the West, specifically Britain when it took over India launched the killing of 30 million people! (see BBC FOUR: *Racism. A History*. Editors: Marx Corrance and Tim Robinson, 2007), and in that movie (at the end) writes that racism made the difference between the West and the rest.

– Western reasoning has reportedly encouraged non-Western societies in recent decades (12) ... but again there is the problem of capitalism ... an example is Tesla, but in general health problem from the US.

– China ... Deng Xiaoping tried to improvise everything in China (13) ...

– Burma (Myanmar) Bangladesh, Pakistan and the Philippines have changed (14).

– First revolutions ... democracy ... western theorists of democracy ... Asian leaders now know they are responsible to their own people ... the author claims that this is a gift that the West has given Asia (14-15).

– The Second Revolution ... psychology (15).

– Third Revolution – Field of Government (16).

– [Narendra] Modi is often criticized in the West (17) ... he doesn't speak English in the world because the world has to learn English as your own language⁶; Modi is Muslim ... and profitable is a great support from Muslim countries ...

(3) *Suicidal Western Wars*

– The domination of the West could have continued for many centuries, if it had not been two world wars in the 20th century - this is generally marked by the author (v. 20).

– The author talks about the impact of Western education on the world (21) ... but Clinton (as an addition) pointed out in his book that the US is very negative about it! (See Bill Clinton, *Back to Work*. Mate: 2012, table on p. 99 and see his slightly wider descriptions). And problems also arose in Kenya when education was in English ...

⁶ <https://twitter.com/sampattoshniwal/status/506763508608802816>.

but when promoted from English to Swahili then it was more positive ... and clearly it would be positive too for Swahili to be learned in the West.

– Francis Fukuyama’s book about the end of history has been around since the end of the Cold War ... and that it will be Western liberal democracy to be the ultimate form of human government ... but China and India have awakened ... (21-22).

– The 1989 Tiananmen Square incident in China ... the West then thought that China would continue to be corrupt country, and did not take into account that former President Deng Xiaoping (1904-1997) was already very positive developed China ... (22).

– The 9/11 2001 incident in the US ... and then the attack on Iraq ... “Unfortunately, most elites in the West are still with scornfully looks at all those who voted for Trump and Brexit. Hillary Clinton discovered that when described Trump supporters as a ‘basket of deplorables’” (23).

– Pakistan is one of the largest problem countries in the world (26) (and is pushed there by English); Bangladesh - a major increase in life from 45.83 in 1960 to 69.68 in 2010 (27).

– By 2030, over half of the world’s people will have middle class status ... (27)

– The author claims that the period 1990-2020 was the best in human history (28) ... but it was not in Croatia and in Iraq, although Croatian politicians today focus on the US (especially our former president Kolinda Grabar-Kitarović who worked for NATO).

(4) *The Blindness of Western Elites*

– Internet penetration rates rose from 21.4% in 2000 to 68.6% in 2016 (29) a shift from English (and it can be seen as a shift from English) ... the proportion of adults who own cell phones, Malaysia ranks third in the world (29); it is used here. The term “smartphone” which is typically tricky etymologically, but we call it “cellphone”; but cell phones have expanded because of the fact that telephone wire infrastructure over some areas could not be made ... otherwise, in Croatia, cell phones appeared during the war because there were no links between the conflicting areas ...

– “... our planet is aggravated by the global dominance of the Western media, which dominates the global news and infect the world with the prevailing Western pessimism” (29).

– Thesis “the end of the West may lead to a new dark age”, but the author says it is true the opposite ... (30).

– Southeast Asia will be the fourth economic zone in the world by 2050 ... (31).

– I am critical of Nepal and Yemen ... (31).

– Europe was in shock when refugees started arriving from North Africa ... (33); it had to be described a little longer ... because the American strikes triggered it.

(5) *The Global Explosion of Travel*

– International tourism is a supreme luxury (35).

– George W. Bush said in 2006 that American people need to know that they live in a dangerous world ... (36)

– The West does not know that China is developing better than in all its last 3,000 years ... (36).

– India has the largest number of smartphones in the world; over 220 million users (37).

– Violence becomes less and less ... (37) and it must be reduced ... and then humanity will be better connected ... (38).

(6) *Why Hasn’t the West Noticed?*

– As for the West ... As George Orwell wrote, “To see what stands in front of one’s nose needs a constant fight [= constant struggle]” (39).

– The West reportedly lost its direction after the end of the Cold War, and now is influenced by “hubris” (in Croatian: oholost, arogancija) (39).

– Fukuyama badly influenced thoughts in the West (“brain damage to the West”) ... (39-40).

– According to the author, after the Second World War, the West continued to focus and lead the competition; and when the USSR made its way into space, the US was in shock ... so in 1969 that country sent humans to the moon (40).

(7) *Western Hubris*

– China developed independently of 1989 Tiananmen (Western Vision) (42).

– Asia had a financial crisis in 1997-8, but it has overcome ... (42).

– China became the world’s largest economy in 2014, though it was only 10% of the US in 1980 (43).

(8) *Strategic Errors: Islam, Russia and Meddling in World Affairs*

– The worst was the invasion of Iraq in March 2003 ... an inaccurate attack on Osama bin Laden ... though Saddam Hussein opposed bin Laden ... (44).

– It was a disaster (45); the author has criticized Trump several times, but did not mention that Trump told in one of his books that he was against this illegal Iraq war (see D. Trump, *Great Again: How to Fix our Crippled America*. Zagreb: Mate, 2016).

– Islam is perhaps the most evolving world (45).

– The West ... that modernization and economic development lead to less religion and greater secularity ... contrary to Islam (46); however, it is Protestantism in the West.

– “Another major strategic mistake of the West was to further humiliate already humiliated Russia” ... and NATO expansion! (47) As a result, Russia has elected Putin ... (48).

– Revolts after the Cold War: Yugoslavia in 2000 (Bulldozer, the so-called “excavator revolution” against Milošević); Georgia 2004 (Rose, “Roses”), Ukraine 2005 (Yellow), Iraq in 2005 (Purple), Kyrgyzstan in 2005 (Tulip), Tunisia in 2010 (Jasmine), and Egypt in 2011 (Lotus) (49-50); the author did not mention that war that is created after the breakup of the former Yugoslavia, and also after the Cold War ... and as for that “Revolution rose” in Georgia ... it was a political move towards the West and a distance from neighboring Russia ... and Eduard Shevardnadze (1928-2014) lost his presidency then, and replaced him by Mikhail Saakashvili, who wanted to liaise with NATO and started the war with Russia in 2008 (essentially the Russians gave their citizenship to the Ossetians in the so-called South Ossetia, to be in touch with North Ossetia in Russia, and that no matter what they lived in Georgia ... but the Georgian army later attacked that province of the South Ossetia, and this prompted Russian intervention).

– Gabriel García Márquez ... from 1824 to 1994 the United States made 73 invasions into Latin America ... (51).

– Donald Trump - his ignorance over time will be overcome from the wider community, by the well informed human communities ... (52)

– Trump separates the US from the policy of climate change (52) ... China and India will suffer most from climate change deterioration ... (53).

(9) *A New Strategy: Minimalist, Multilateral and Machiavellian*

– During civic work, the US launched al-Qaeda against the USSR and Afghanistan ... and this company is attacked a country that supported it on 11/09 2001 ... (World Trade Center) ... (55).

– Obama transferred ISIS warriors from Afghanistan to Syria against Assad ... The US stated that it was against ISIS ... (ISIS = Islamic State in Iraq and Syria) (56).

– ASEAN ... Alliance of Southeast Asian Nations: Brunei, Indonesia, Cambodia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, Vietnam / success in Myanmar ... (57).

– EU - zero-war move among the countries concerned ... (57); Nordic countries: economic growth and social harmony ... (58).

– The West needs to better understand the other part of the world (58).

– According to Paul Kennedy's thesis from the Great Britain, it was alleged that President Truman launched in 1945 the global one Parliament through the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) (58-59); since the author of this war also served at the UN, he knew how UNGA functioned ... (59).

– The first US invasion of Iraq by senior Bush was legal through the UN, and the second by the younger Bush was illegal (60).

– “Machiavelli is one of the most famous and least understood Western figures”. The West needs more to know from Machiavelli (63).

– The global power of the West is increasingly diminished ... but goes beyond autopilot... (64).

(10) *The West on Autopilot: Europe and America Do Not Face the Same Challenges*

– The strategic challenge for the US is not the same as for Europe ... (65); according to Merkel ... Europe has to take it alone his fate in hand ... (66); primarily NOT, and it is followed by conflict with Russia, so Europe needs to establish peace with Putin ... Europe's biggest problem is instability towards the Islamic world ... (66).

– One of Obama's greatest gifts to America was the nuclear deal with Iran (70).

– Clinton linked the security of states with the bombing of Syria, and Obama thought he should bombing Afghanistan and Pakistan ... and Trump bombing Syria, after a chemical attack Asasa (6 April 2017) (73).

– China will win in economic competitiveness because it has large populations, 1.37 billion, in proportion to 321 million in the US (74).

(11) *A More Dangerous World*

– The world will become more volatile if the West does not change its orientation (75).

– The West is wrong that democracy is necessary for economic success (76).

– Japan became the first non-western country with modern development, during the reign of Meiji 1860s ... (78); but it also led to a crisis (cf. the Japanese book *I'm a Cat*, which is written 1905-1906 by Natsume Sōseki [1867–1916], which mentions this psychological change that has caused Meiji).

– Huntington incorrectly pointed out that “Islam has bloody borders” ... (79).

– Trump - focus on military competition; he increased the number of the US warships from 272 to 352 ... (81).

– Bill Clinton suggested to Americans to adjust to a world where the US is not “number one” ... it was bravely from him (82).

– China will develop, but as Xi says, it will not seek to change the world ... (84).

(12) *A Better World - for Americans and Europeans*

– Western minds must know that for over 2 centuries they have been aggressive and interventionist ... (85).

– Trump (according to the author) clearly does not know about the world (= “... ignorant about the world”) (87).

– As Amitav Ghosh from Asia said ... so-called *New Yorker* magazine directs ideas toward traditional worldview (89).

– Liberalism promotes intellectual superiority to the rest of the world ... (89).

(13) *So - Has The West Lost It?*

- The West is coming to an end! It is not impossible that China will lead the world (90)
- This book is supposed to be a “gift to the West” - it described what the West did for the shell state, but it will be a great tragedy if the West is going to be the main driver of turbulence (turmoil/upheaval) and uncertainty in the moment of the greatest promise (oath) of mankind (91).

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The authors declare no competing interests. The translation of the reviewed book by E. Heršak and T. Komar in Croatian can be expected soon (it will be published by Mate, Zagreb, Croatia).

Un Hombre Puede Hacerlo, pero ¿una Mujer? A Critical Discourse Analysis Showing how Mexican Women might be *Machistas*

Silvia Monserrat Pacheco Constantino

University of Guanajuato, MEXICO
Division of Social Sciences and Humanities

Received: 1 June 2020 ▪ Accepted: 25 August 2020 ▪ Published Online: 31 October 2020

Abstract

Thousands of women die every day all over the world due to violence. Mexico is a country in which it is believed that *machismo* is one of the reasons why women are violated and murdered. There is the stereotype of believing that the female gender is being mistreated directly by men. However, this study aimed to show how women express themselves with a negative connotation against their own gender. Perhaps, females portrait themselves as feminists or women defenders. Nonetheless, their language states their true position. This project employed a critical discourse analysis under the use of Fairclough's model. The results demonstrated how the discourse employed by the participants highlighted a *machista* perception towards women.

Keywords: critical discourse analysis, machismo, violence against women, female perceptions.

1. Introduction

In 2019, 976 women were victims of femicide in Mexico. In January of 2020, 10 women were murdered every day in my country. Corradi et al. (2016) highlight the use of the word femicide as to “raise awareness that violent death of women was a crime per se, not to be confused with the gender-neutral term homicide” (p. 976). I define femicide as a hate act towards women for the fact of being it. **The big** question is: Who is it guilty? Many people blame men and many make women responsible of their own death. Perhaps, Mexicans think that women should act, work, dress, and even walk in a certain way. If they do not do it, then they deserved to die. I blame *machismo*. Mosher (1991) states that *machismo* is represented by hypermasculinity in where male gender is believed to be socially superior to the female gender. Initially, it could be thought that men are the only gender to be *machista*. However, women have demonstrated through the years that they agree to some extend to the *machista* ideology. This study presents a critical discourse analysis (CDA) with the aim of analyzing women's discourse which demonstrates that their support *machismo*.

- Mexican women discourse can portrait hidden messages that might support ideologies corresponding to machismo.
- The discourse of both participants are constructed with predominantly behavioral and mental processes.
- Socio-historical conditions affect differently the results obtained from the verbal sign analysis.
- Two aspects of social practices in critical discourse analysis were highlighted in the discussion of analysis: power relation and ideologies.

2. Literature review

2.1 *Mexican machos*

Machismo is a word that is used to define violent attitudes and behaviors towards women. This set of attitudes raise the difference between men and women. However, these dissimilarities make the female gender inferior in this comparison.

An interesting analysis of the origin of *machismo* is the one stated by Paredes (1967) who mentions the following:

Machismo has its origins in the Spanish conquest, when Hernan Cortes and his conquerors arrived in Mexico and raped the Aztec women. From this act of violence, the *mestizo* hates and envies the Spanish father and despises the Indian mother since they were born (p. 65).

Mestizos suffered from discrimination because they did not belong to the Spaniards neither to the Aztecs. They were not recognized by their Spanish fathers and it is unknown whether the Aztec women were raped only by one man or by many. The conquerors did not belong to one place. Consequently, they left the land in which they had raped the Aztecs abandoning the women and their children. The *mestizos* perhaps found their way out their feelings by blaming their mothers.

Paredes (1967) introduces the idea of the origin of *machismo* and highlights the importance of taking into consideration the time in which all of this happened. If *machismo* in Mexico was originated from the acts of raping indigenous women in Mexico, it would mean that this phenomenon has been around the country for about four centuries. Perhaps, people are more aware these days of the attitudes that lead men to act in certain way which will categorize them as *machistas*. I rather use the word people instead of being specific to men because it is a reality that not only men are *machistas*.

According to Hölz (1992), the philosophy of *machismo* claims that the natural disposition of women is determined by weakness, the need for protection, gentleness and charity. If women grow up thinking that their responsibilities are at home to be a housewife, a mother and to take care of their husbands, they are also being *machistas*. Orozco (2008) remarks how women have been seen from the macho perspective:

From a considerably long period of time there has been a kind of arcaded domination towards women, the so-called “weaker” sex. In general terms, this way of conceiving the female gender has come from yesteryear, due to the cultural practices of the peoples, mainly indigenous (p. 9).

This study analyses the discourse of Mexican women; therefore, it is relevant to consider the idea of including how *machismo* perceives the female gender. I intend to prove *machismo* is not men exclusive. Women who think that they should live under the characteristics mentioned by Orozco (2008) and Hölz (1992) should also be considered *machistas*.

2.2 Femicide in a Mexican context

I decided to include a section dedicated to femicide because I consider that *machismo* has a strong impact on society. Also, these two topics are related because it is a reality that *machismo* can lead men to kill women. I selected the definition of feminism provided by Corradi et al., (2016) due to its suitability for the Mexican context.

The translation of femicide into Spanish was promoted by Marcela Lagarde ... along with other Mexican researchers, such as Monárrez Fragoso, pushed for a translation that did not adopt the English term “femicide” literally. *Feminicidio* (instead of *femicidios*) tends to be employed in Spanish as the one notion that best expresses the violent death of women and girls, because it incorporates the semantic field of connivance of state and public institutions as relevant factors in femicide (p. 984).

Many families in the country lose their daughters, mothers, nieces, cousins, aunts, etc. due to femicide. The translation that was provided is a powerful statement that describes the violent deaths that many women suffer. I believe this definition suits not only Mexican women, but also females all over the world.

Olivera (2006) states that the killings would belong to unknown assailants. Nonetheless, “in the majority of cases, women are murdered by someone known to them or related through work, family, or romantic involvement” (p. 105). I want to emphasize that language plays a key role in these cases. Maybe, people can be able to identify whether a relative or a friend of the family intends to harm someone by their expressions. Perhaps, it is not that language can show that a person is about to commit a crime, but their attitudes towards women can certainly be inferred. It is not only men who can express themselves as *machistas*.

Olivera (2006) illustrates how the inequalities against women can portrait direct or hidden messages:

Violence against women, an expression of male power, is present in various forms and degrees throughout their lives ... In all societies the cultural models for being a woman assign positions to women ... creating real and symbolic inequalities... These inequalities are expressed in direct or hidden messages... violence against women progressively develops from insinuations, offensive comparisons, harassment, threats, verbal intimidation, abuse, irresponsibility, betrayals... (p. 105)

Femicides is a consequence of violence against women. There are several factors that lead men to end the life of a female. However, these aspects can be identified before the situation escalades. I do not want to imply that language can provide a solution for femicides, but it could help to have a faster identification of a person who is *machista*. For me, *machismo* is the first step on the ladder of femicide.

2.3 Feminism over the years in Mexico

The term feminism arose from the need of women equality. According to Acosta-Alzuru, the words feminism and feminist are concepts with a strong and controversial message. She states that “Latin American women’s movements have played a key role in improving the political, social, and legal conditions for women in the region” (Acosta-Alzuru, 2003: 269). Mexico has not been the exception to this rule. The history of feminism in Mexico dates back to the revolution of the country. As Leland (2010) cites: “The *Porfiriato* witnessed the emergence of the modern feminist movement that would extend into the later twentieth century both in forms of organization and cases for argument of their positions” (p. 10).

Back in those days, the “ideal of womanhood in Mexico consisted of the woman who only used her education to better herself as a wife and mother” (Leland, 2010: 7). This idea has

change over the years. However, it has not been an easy path because even to current time, some people still have misconceptions regarding the role of the woman in the society. During this paper, I will be showing how some Mexican women portray themselves as *machistas* when mentioning some aspects they consider a woman should follow to belong to the society. Woman discourse can show that they agree to some standards that belong to the *machista* ideology.

The evolution of the feminism in Mexico started rising attention by the end of the 80's and 90's when Mexican feminists had started to participate in the public institutional sphere, a domain that they had not considered a suitable space for action in the 1970s (Bartra et al., 2000, as cited in Chen, 2019). Additionally, women start to conduct studies in the area as well as directing feminist groups and organizations.

Nowadays, more women protest for their rights. There are several factors that have made Mexican women fight for their equality in society. Perhaps, one of the main reasons that has motivated them to go out to the streets to protest is the increase in the number of femicides in the country. More females are joining the organizations and groups to disprove the misconception of their role in the society.

The next section will describe the methodology that was followed in order to analyze the discourse of two Mexican women.

3. Methodology: Critical discourse analysis

This paper aims to analyze the discourse of two women who claimed defending women's right. In order to conduct this examination, critical discourse analysis (CDA) was selected as part of the methodology for this study. Two aspects of social practices in critical discourse analysis were highlighted and taken into consideration: power relation and ideologies.

Fairclough (2001) remarks the explanation of this research method as following:

CDA analyses texts and interactions, but it does not start from texts and interactions. It starts rather from social issues and problems, problems which face people in their social lives, issues which are taken up within sociology, political science and/or cultural studies (p. 26).

In addition, Janks (1997) explains that every social practice provides with a historical practice which relates it to language. In the case of this paper, femicide and *machismo* are social issues that are relevant and affect Mexicans' everyday life. I implemented CDA as the research methodology of this paper based on Fairclough's (1989; 1995) model which is explained in the following table.

Table 1. Fairclough's (1989, 1995) model for CDA

Inter-related dimensions of discourse	Application	Different kind of analysis
The object of analysis	including verbal, visual or verbal and visual texts	Text analysis (description)
The processes by means of which the object is produced and received	writing/ speaking/ designing and reading/ listening/ viewing by human subjects	Processing analysis (interpretation)
The socio-historical conditions which govern these processes		Social analysis (explanation)

Note: Information retrieved from Janks (1997).

For the analysis employed in this paper, the subjects of the study were selected. The text analyzed were fragments of conversations between women in Mexico in a daily routine. It is

relevant to mention that the participants were against violence and *machismo*. However, verbal signs were identified in which they support this ideology, contrary to what they stated at the beginning of the conversation. After the text was analyzed and the verbal signs were identified, the social analysis was carried out in order to provide an explanation of why it was thought that the participants contradict themselves in their discourse.

Figure 1 represents the three dimensions that were the reference for the conducted analysis of the abstracts in this research.

Note: Retrieved from Janks (1997: 330).

Figure 1. Fairclough's dimension of discourse and discourse analysis

The next section will present the findings following the discourse analysis model of Fairclough (1989, 1995) which was represented in Table 1 and Figure 1. It will be referred to them in order to explain some of the features identified in the analysis.

4. Results of the analysis

For this section, I discuss the findings following the discourse analysis model of Fairclough (1989, 1995). As it was presented in the previous section, this model consists of three stages. First, I will present a textual analysis of the abstracts of the conversations between the participants as a description. Then, I explain the processes by the recognition of verbal signs in which I interpret the text. Finally, I analyze the socio-historical conditions related to the identified issue.

4. 1 Textual analysis

As it was mentioned in the methodology section, the texts employed for the analysis of this paper were abstracts of a conversation between two different participants. There are two women in their 50's who are neighbors and maintain a close friendship. They know each other's family. Therefore, they talk about personal topics. In Mexico, perhaps, it is common to comment between friends about family issues and experiences. Both women portrait themselves as women

defendants. They are mothers of one son and one daughter. They believe both of their children should have the same rights and opportunities.

In the linguistic text, the participant 1 retells an experience that she lived a few weeks ago as the following:

Me sentí muy incómoda porque... ¿si ubicas a las vecinas, las que son lesbianas que viven aquí a la vuelta? Bueno, pues un día fui a la tienda a comprar y estaba una de ellas. Y tú sabes como me visto con mi short y mi blusa de tirantes. Pues me echó una mirada que dije ¡ay no qué horror! Un hombre te morbosea de por sí, pero ¿una mujer? ¡No! Me sentí abusada. / I felt extremely uncomfortable because... Do you know the neighbors who are lesbians that live right around the corner? Well, this other day, I went to the store to buy something and one of them was there. And you know how I usually dress with a short and a tank top. Well, she looked at me head to toes and I had a terrible feeling. It is normal that a man looks at you with desire, but a woman? Hell no! I felt abused.

The participant did not use many adjectives. However, she expressed herself using these adjectives after the verb be, have, and feel: lesbians, terrible, and abused. Consequently, she relates negative feelings with her experience. She portrays a negative image towards a lesbian woman staring at her and having lustful thoughts. She relates the adjective lesbian with a terrible experience which made her feel abused. Perhaps, she was not sure whether her neighbor would stare at her because of that reason, but she immediately assumed it. She reacted negatively because of the fact that her neighbor is lesbian. Despite, I was not able to present a picture of the situation, I was present as a researcher when she was retelling her story. I could perceive by the tone of her voice that she was disgusted. Additionally, she perceives the idea of men having the right of staring at her no matter the intention they have.

Regarding the participant 2, I selected the following abstract in which she defends her son's position in his marriage:

El otro día estaba hablando con mi hijo porque él y su esposa pelean mucho. Yo no sé qué va a pasar si se separan. Yo lo pienso por mi nieto. Cuando se pelearon yo pensaba que mi hijo se estaba viendo con otra muchacha. Y a mí me gustaría tener más nietos en el futuro. No me importa con quién los tenga porque si son hijos de tu hijo los tienes que aceptar aunque él ande con otra mujer / The other day I was talking to my son because he and his wife fight a lot. I do not know what is going to happen if they split up. I think about it because of my grandson. When they fought, I thought my son was cheating on my daughter-in-law. I would really like to have more grandchildren in the future. I do not care with whom my son has them. I mean, if they are your son's children you must accept them no matter what. It does not matter if he is dating someone else besides his wife.

In the text, the noun "son" is constantly repeated. She states her indifference towards the woman his son is married to. She employs the modal verb "must" to emphasize the feeling of obligation towards being responsible of accepting and taking care of her grandchildren. She does not show empathy towards her daughter-in-law. She mentioned her to provide the context. However, the participant highlights her position in this situation. Also, the use of the personal pronoun is present in most of the sentences. This shows that her opinion is based on what she personally desires or wants.

4.2 Verbal signs analysis

Janks (1997) introduces a check list based on Halliday's (1985) and Fairclough's (1989) to provide a complete text analysis. The check list presents six features as following: lexicalization; patterns of transitivity; the use of active and passive voice; the use of nominalization; choices of

mood; choices of modality or polarity; the thematic structure of the text; the information focus; and cohesion devices.

I identified that in both abstracts the text was represented through verbs in the majority of it. Therefore, I decided that I wanted to analyze the verbs in the patterns of transitivity. In Figure 2, I represent the criteria I followed for the analysis of verbal signs through the patterns of transitivity.

_____ <i>Types of doing</i> Material processes: actor + goal
Doing: e.g. Parents sometimes hit children. (active voice)
Doing to: e.g. Small babies should not be hit. (passive voice)
Creating: e.g. The investigator does not have to make inferences.
_____ <i>Saying</i> Verbal processes: sayer + what is said + (receiver)
e.g. One of the workers suggested that I try some brew.
_____ <i>Sensing</i> Mental processes: Senser + phenomenon
Feeling: e.g. I like that one. The children feel angry.
Thinking: think, know, understand, interpret, etc.
Perceiving: saw, notice, stared at, etc.
_____ <i>Types of being</i> Relational processes
Being: x is y e.g. Child abuse is terrible (or a terrible thing).
_____ <i>Types of behaving</i> Behavioral processes
Physiological- breath, dream, sleep.
Psychological- smile, laugh.
_____ <i>Things that exist or happen</i> Existential processes
e.g. The world is round. There was a man at the door.

Note: Retrieved from Janks (1997: 336).

Figure 2. Halliday's (1985) explanation of transitivity

Figure 2, Janks (1997) represented the six different types of transitivity proposed by Halliday's (1985). "To do a transitivity analysis it is necessary to identify every verb and its associated process "(Janks, 1997: 337).

I followed the processes of identifying the verbs and their associated processes. The results are illustrated in Table 2 and Table 3.

Table 2. Types of transitivity of the verbs

Abstract Participant 1	
Activity	Process
Felt	Mental
Know	Mental
Are	Relational
Live	Behavioral
Went	Behavioral
Buy	Material
Was	Relational
Know	Mental
Dress	Behavioral
Looked	Behavioral
Had	Relational
Looks	Behavioral
Felt	Mental

Table 3. Types of transitivity of verbs

Abstract Participant 2	
Activity	Process
Was talking	Behavior
Fight	Behavior
Know	Mental
Going to happen	Behavior
Split up	Behavior
Think	Mental
Fought	Behavior
Thought	Mental
Was cheating	Behavior
Would like to have	Relational
Do not care	Mental
Has	Relational
Are	Relational
Must accept	Mental
Does not matter	Material
Is dating	Behavior

Table 2 and Table 3 demonstrate that the discourse of both participants are constructed with predominantly behavioral and mental processes. Figure 2 refers to behavioral processes as physiological and psychological features which means these women's discourse is being affected in those areas. Also, it can be observed that both participants construct their verbal transitivity with a low number of material processes. The first participant only used one and the second participant did not use any. These results suggest that both women do not act on their own. If we go back to Figure 2, it is explained that material processes imply the act of doing and in both cases they do not state verbs of act. Perhaps, that could answer why participant 2 was so involved in her son's life. She expressed her opinion as if she was part of the marriage and she acts as if her son needed to be taken care of.

In the case of participant 1, she felt abused by the fact that a woman stared at her. Her transitivity of verbs shows how she is being affected by psychological features. In the next section, I will relate this analysis to the social context to provide a further explanation of why she felt that way.

4.3 Discussion of the socio-historical conditions

In this section, I discuss the results and provide a justification with social conditions. Fairclough and Wodak (1997) describe critical discourse analysis as a social practice which means that language and context constitute a relevant aspect in the analysis. As I mentioned in the methodology section, I identified that the results of this project are related to power and ideologies.

On one hand, participant 1 expressed her disagreement towards being stared at by a woman but normalizes the idea of men behaving the same way. She portrays herself as a woman defendant. However, when it comes the time to talk about lesbianism, and women freedom she responded awkwardly to these type of situations. As the text analysis showed, her discourse was constituted mainly by behavioral and mental processes. This means that she is more in touch with her feelings and that her discourse is affected by her way of thinking. The literature highlights how women have been discriminated by men. The male gender should not carry all the responsibility towards women's discrimination because as the results imply, women also judge each other.

On the other hand, participant 2 normalizes the perceptions that correspond to *machismo*. She stated that she would love her grandchildren no matter who their mother is. She stated that even if his son cheated on his wife, she would stand by his side to support him. Again, I recall the analysis of the text in which behavioral and mental processes are dominating her discourse. Perhaps, past experiences affected her psychological and emotional thoughts which is now related directly to her discourse.

It was disappointing to realize that both women's discourse lacked of material processes. This type of process states that a person is capable of doing and creating. The results associated this deficiency with the absence of a person being able to act under their own decisions. As it was presented in the literature, Mexican women have struggled to stand by their own. For many years, they have depended on men. First, when a woman is born, they depend on their fathers and when they get married they depend on their husbands.

I do not want to imply that all Mexican families develop in the same way. Nonetheless, it is culturally known that *machismo* has influenced many families all over the country. *Machismo* perceives the men as the strongest family member and the one who needs to take care of the family. When a son becomes adolescence, it is time for him to work and help the father to take care of the family members specially women.

5. Conclusion

Through Fairclough's three-dimensional model of critical discourse analysis, I have proved how women might support *machismo* through language. The participants expressed their feminist position. However, their discourse was identified as the opposite. I would not conclude that they support *machismo* in a 100% level, but it is alarming that they are being so close-minded in these important topics.

The purpose of this article is not to attack women, but to raise awareness on how discourse is relevant and how it can portrait hidden messages and meanings. The results of this analysis compile the disagreement between what a person might express as their way of thinking and their actual beliefs.

As I mentioned in the discussion of the socio-historical conditions, I do not generalize, but I refer to the context in which this study was conducted. There would always be women whose history and past experiences keep them from unleashing themselves from the oppressor. Mexican women have fought for their rights over the years and we will continue fighting until we make a change in history.

Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank the University of Guanajuato for accepting me as part of their community of students in the master's degree program. I am beyond grateful for the opportunities that all my professors have given me to work on diverse projects. I would also like to express my gratitude to the professor Troy Crawford Lewis who encouraged me to write this article and publish it.

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

References

- Acosta-Alzuru, C. (2003). "I'm not a feminist... I only defend women as human beings": The production, representation, and consumption of feminism in a telenovela. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 20(3), 269-294.
- Chen, Y. Z. (2019). Early activism and work arrangements of young feminists in Mexico City. *Journal of Youth Studies*, 22(4), 457-472 <https://doi.org/10.1080/07393180302775>
- Corradi, C., Marcuello-Servós, C., Boira, S., & Weil, S. (2016). Theories of femicide and their significance for social research. *Current Sociology*, 64(7), 975-995. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011392115622256>
- Fairclough, N. (1989) *Language and power*. Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1995) *Critical discourse analysis*. Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (2001). Critical discourse analysis. In A. McHoul & M. Rapley (Eds.), *How to analyze talk in institutional settings: A casebook of methods* (pp. 25-38). A&C Black.
- Fairclough, N., & Wodak, R. (1997). Critical discourse analysis. In van Dijk (Ed.), *Discourse studies: A multidisciplinary introduction* (pp. 258-284). Sage.
- Hölz, K. (1992). El machismo en México. Sobrevivencia y rechazo de un tópico socio-cultural. *Iberoamericana*, 2(46), 33-41.
- Janks, H. (1997). Critical discourse analysis as a research tool. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 18(3), 329-342.
- Leland, M. (2010). *Separate Spheres: Soldaderas and feminists in revolutionary Mexico* (Doctoral dissertation). The Ohio State University.
- Mosher, D. (1991) Macho men, machismo, and sexuality. *Annual Review of Sex Research*, 2(1), 199-247. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10532528.1991.10559871>
- Olivera, M. (2006). Violencia femicida: Violence against women and Mexico's structural crisis. *Latin American Perspectives*, 33(2), 104-114. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0094582X05286092>
- Orozco, W. (2008). El machismo en México y su esencia. *Revista Entreverando*, 2(2), 8-11.
- Paredes, A. (1967). Estados Unidos, Mexico y el machismo. *Journal of Inter-American Studies*, 9(1), 65-84. <https://doi.org/10.2307/165157>

AIMS AND SCOPE

The OJAS, as an international multi-disciplinary peer-reviewed **online open access academic journal**, publishes academic articles deal with different problems and topics in various areas of anthropology and close scientific disciplines (cultural anthropology, social anthropology, urban anthropology, ethnology, ethnomusicology, anthropology of art, media anthropology, feminist anthropology, economic anthropology, physical anthropology, psychological anthropology, medical anthropology, linguistic anthropology, palaeoanthropology, applied anthropology, archeology, etc.).

The OJAS provides a platform for the manuscripts from different areas of research, which may rest on the full spectrum of established methodologies, including theoretical discussion and empirical investigations. The manuscripts may represent a variety of theoretical perspectives and different methodological approaches.

The OJAS is already indexed in Crossref (DOI), DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals), BASE (Bielefeld Academic Search Engine), Google Scholar, J-Gate, ResearchBib and WorldCat - OCLC, and is applied for indexing in the other bases (Clarivate Analytics – SCIE, ESCI, SSCI and AHCI, Scopus, ERIH Plus, Ulrich's Periodicals Directory, Cabell's Directory, SHERPA/RoMEO, EZB - Electronic Journals Library, etc.).

The authors of articles accepted for publishing in the OJAS should get the ORCID number (www.orcid.org), and Thomson-Reuters' Researcher ID (www.researcherid.com).

The journal is now publishing 2 times a year.

PEER REVIEW POLICY

All manuscripts submitted for publishing in the OJAS are expected to be free from language errors and must be written and formatted strictly according to the latest edition of the [APA style](#). Manuscripts that are not entirely written according to APA style and/or do not reflect an expert use of the English language will **not** be considered for publication and will **not** be sent to the journal reviewers for evaluation. It is completely the author's responsibility to comply with the rules. We highly recommend that non-native speakers of English have manuscripts proofread by a copy editor before submission. However, proof of copy editing does *not* guarantee acceptance of a manuscript for publication in the OJAS.

The OJAS operates a double-blind peer reviewing process. The manuscript should not include authors' names, institutional affiliations, contact information. Also, authors' own works need to be blinded in the references (see the APA style). All submitted manuscripts are reviewed by the editors, and only those meeting the aims and scope of the journal will be sent for outside review. Each manuscript is reviewed by at least two reviewers.

The editors are doing their best to reduce the time that elapses between a paper's submission and publication in a regular issue. It is expected that the review and publication processes will be completed in about 2-3 months after submission depending on reviewers' feedback and the editors' final decision. If revisions are requested some changing and corrections then publication time becomes longer. At the end of the review process, accepted papers will be published on the journal's website.

OPEN ACCESS POLICY

The OJAS is an open access journal which means that all content is freely available without charge to the user or his/her institution. Users are allowed to read, download, copy, distribute, print, search, or link to the full texts of the articles, or use them for any other lawful purpose, without asking prior permission from the publisher or the author. This is in accordance with the BOAI definition of open access.

All articles published in the OJAS are licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Authors hold the copyrights of their own articles by acknowledging that their articles are originally published in the OJAS.