



Center for Open Access in Science

Open Journal for
Sociological Studies

2020 • Volume 4 • Number 2

<https://doi.org/10.32591/coas.ojss.0402>

Special Issue:

Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems

Guest Editors:

Murat Şentürk (PhD), *Istanbul University, Department of Sociology, TURKEY*

E-mail: murat.senturk@istanbul.edu.tr

Glenn W. Muschert (PhD), *Khalifa University of Science & Technology, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, UNITED ARAB EMIRATES*

E-mail: glenn.muschert@ku.ac.ae

ISSN (Online) 2560-5283

OPEN JOURNAL FOR SOCIOLOGICAL STUDIES (OJSS)

ISSN (Online) 2560-5283

<https://www.centerprode.com/ojss.html> * ojss@centerprode.com

Publisher:

Center for Open Access in Science (COAS), Belgrade - SERBIA

<https://www.centerprode.com> * office@centerprode.com

Editor-in-Chief:

Christiana Constantopoulou (PhD)

Panteion University of Social and Political Sciences, School of Social Sciences, Athens, GREECE

Editorial Board:

Georgios Stamelos (PhD)

University of Patras, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, GREECE

Cristian Ortega Caro (PhD)

Arturo Prat University, Faculty of Humanities, Iquique, CHILE

Valentina Marinescu (PhD)

University of Bucharest, Faculty of Sociology and Social Work, ROMANIA

Valentina Milenkova (PhD)

South-West University "Neofit Rilski", Faculty of Philosophy, Blagoevgrad, BULGARIA

Katerina Dalakoura (PhD)

University of Crete, Faculty of Letters, Rethimno, GREECE

Esteban Nicholls (PhD)

Simon Bolivar Andean University, Social and Global Studies, Quito, ECUADOR

Alexis Ioannides (PhD)

Democritus University of Thrace, Department of Social Policy, Komotini, GREECE

Ivan Nachev (PhD)

New Bulgarian University, Faculty of Basic Education, Sofia, BULGARIA

Ninel Nesheva-Kiosseva (PhD)

New Bulgarian University, Faculty of Distance, Electronic and Upgrading Education, Sofia, BULGARIA

Anica Dragovik (PhD)

Ss. Cyril and Methodius University of Skopje, Faculty of Philosophy, NORTH MACEDONIA

Antoanela Petkovska (PhD)

Ss. Cyril and Methodius University of Skopje, Faculty of Philosophy, NORTH MACEDONIA

Maria Kontochristou (PhD)

Greek Open University, School of Social Sciences, Patras, GREECE

Tatyana Kotzeva (PhD)

Burgas Free University, Faculty of Humanities, BULGARIA

Copy Editor:

Goran Pešić

Center for Open Access in Science, Belgrade

Special Issue:

Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems

Guest Editors:

Murat Şentürk (PhD), *Istanbul University, Department of Sociology, TURKEY*
E-mail: murat.senturk@istanbul.edu.tr

Glenn W. Muschert (PhD), *Khalifa University of Science & Technology, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, UNITED ARAB EMIRATES*
E-mail: glenn.muschert@ku.ac.ae

CONTENTS

- i Introduction to the Special Issue: “Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems”
Murat Şentürk & Glenn W. Muschert
- 55 New Trends in Urban Life of Turkey in the Context of Lifestyle Migration
Betül Kızıltepe
- 67 Rural Household Strategies for Expropriated Land: A Case Study of Demirci Village
Şefika Aydın
- 79 The Social Networks and Engagements of Older Turkish Migrants in Germany
Ferhan Saniye Palaz
- 93 Examining the Role of Immigrant Carers in Care for Older People at Home: The Case of Istanbul
Hamza Kurtkapan
- 103 Social Exclusion in the Process of Employment: The Experiences of Roma Youth
Ali Egi
- 115 Post-Materialist Waste: A Study of Turkey’s Importation of Rubbish
Michael Babula & Glenn Muschert
- I Special Issue: “Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems” – Afterword
Müjdat Avcı



**Introduction to the Special Issue:
“Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems”**

Murat Şentürk (PhD), Associate Professor¹
Istanbul University, Department of Sociology, TURKEY
Email: murat.senturk@istanbul.edu.tr

Glenn W. Muschert (PhD), Professor of Sociology
Khalifa University of Science & Technology, UNITED ARAB EMIRATES
Department of Humanities & Social Sciences
Email: glenn.muschert@ku.ac.ae

This special collection, as is the case of most academic work, began as an interpersonal conversation between scholars, in this case over many small glasses of tea in a Turkish *kahvehane* (tea house). The nature of the discussion involved the idea that Turkish sociology was relatively under-appreciated among Anglophone sociologists, and that in the current period of globalization, it would serve the interests of sociologists in Turkey to garner greater attention from international scholars, just as it would be beneficial for scholars worldwide to know more about Turkish sociological perspectives on the types of social problems currently faced within Turkey (or the Turkish diaspora). The editorial team, Dr. Şentürk and Dr. Muschert, are very pleased to present this work, and to have played a role in bringing it from conceptualization through to completion. However, it would be remiss to fail to acknowledge that the project is a collective endeavor among editors, contributors, reviewers, and others who have offered support. In the spirit of inclusiveness, we offer our sincere thanks to those whose names do not otherwise appear in this collection, including our skilled cadre of blind peer reviewers, our skilled editorial assistant Dr. Sadia Jamil, and those at the Center for Open Access in Science (COAS) in Belgrade, Serbia, who publishes this journal. We clarify that our selection of *Open Journal for Sociological Studies* was deliberate due to its Open Access model, which fit our intention to bring the scholarship included here to the widest audience possible. Finally, our decision to publish in English language was similarly strategic as the language has become one of the most broadly used in global academic discourse.

Thus, this project is an attempt to bring the sociological perspectives of Turkish scholars and studies of Turkish social problems to an international audience. While Turkish scholars and those who study Turkish society may be well-aware of the breadth and depth of Turkish sociology over the last century, this is perhaps less-known beyond the boundaries of Turkish intelligentsia. In presenting Turkish perspectives on social problems in English and for an international audience, this project is a modest effort to broaden the exposure of the dynamic sub-field of Turkish sociology and its research into the social problems in contemporary Turkey.

¹ The authors are Guest Editors of the Special Issue.

As one of the main interests of sociology, the study of social problems and strategies for coping with these problems can differ with respect to societies even though the origins of both the scholarship and problems may be similar. By addressing social problems, social structure can be understood, and problems that appear to be individual can be addressed in a social context. Further, suggestions for solutions can be developed, and such strategies can be communicated among different societies forging greater understanding of social dynamics and leading to applied knowledge.

C. Wright Mills' *Sociological Imagination* has an important place in addressing social problems, specifically because Mills emphasized the most important indicator of the ability of social imagination to be "the difference between the understanding that sees the encountered problems as problems from the individual's narrow living environment with the understanding that addresses these problems as public problems of the social structure".² For example, marriage partners may be confronted with personal problems experienced in marriage, but if 250 marriages out of every 1,000 end in the first four years, this means marriage has a problem related to the marriage institution and the other social institutions supporting marriage as an institution. Social problems can be more deeply understood as sociologists assess the values and circumstances in their respective milieu, and these situations may reveal which contradictions in the social structure.

In order to reveal social problems, Mills³ underlined the need to be aware of three trends related to methodology: those based on propositions that develop in the context of historical theory, piles of concepts that have a more static and abstract approach, and understanding and conceptualizing the facts and problems through empirical analysis. He critiqued those scholars who confine their analysis to one of these three areas. According to Mills,⁴ the components of the three types of problems that sociologists will seek answers to are: (1) the basic features and structure of society, its social relationships, and the differences and similarities in societies; (2) the places, locations, changes, and processes within the historical perspective; and (3) humans, human nature, the nature of human behavior, and typologies. In order to answer these, the theoretical framework of sociology, the historical and social perspective, and the empirical data need to be worked.

While social problems take place among the most important topics in Western Europe where sociology first emerged and in North America where it developed in the post-World War II era, they are also an important agenda item in non-Western societies. Perhaps more in the sociology of social problems than in any other sub-field of sociology, the precise and embedded nature of the objects of study (i.e., the historically-bound iteration of social problems) mean that to understand specific scholarship, one must also understand the context in which it has developed. The social problems formed by the economic, political, and social changes experienced since the 19th century have long been one of the main interests of Turkish sociology. A social transformation began to be experienced as a result of the Industrial Revolution and the technological developments and economic and political changes that accelerated in connection with it. Social problems that have emerged within this transformation, and quickly have become some of the basic pursuits of both the administrators of public policy as well as among and intellectuals who investigate social issues.

² Mills, C. W. (2000). *Toplumbilimsel düşün* [The sociological imagination]. (çev. Ü. Oskay). İstanbul: Der Yayınları, 20,22.

³ *Ibid.*: 46-49.

⁴ *Ibid.*: 17-18.

The need to address the social problems that would emerge with these social changes had become so intense that the first sociology department outside of the West was established in Istanbul University at the considerably early date of 1914 by the renown Turkish sociologist Ziya Gökalp. The Turkish sociologists of this period were generally focused on the topic of Turkish society being in a crisis of transition from the centuries-long Ottoman period which ended after World War I, and through the establishment of the modern Turkish Republic in 1923. The main goals of early Turkish sociology were, thus, to determine which social institutions are essential to the establishment of modern society, and to facilitate the development of those that were necessary for this transition.⁵

In a practical sense, early Turkish sociologists studied the social change occurring in internal and external dynamics in Ottoman social orders. On one hand, the development of technology and the numerous changes happening at that time, including the rise of industrial capitalism in the West and the establishment of political changes based on civil liberties, caused many changes in traditional Ottoman society. The view that the state and society, which had lost its power through the changing material and ideological influences coming from the West, would regain its former glory were widespread among intellectuals only in relation to the need to preserve existing culture in order to prevent the social problems assumed to come from the deterioration of traditional society. For some, avoiding the changes that these innovations would bring was nearly impossible. The main topics of discussion that lasted in Turkey from the last quarter of the 19th century until the middle of the 20th century were therefore concerned with how the state would regain its strength, including what role social institutions would play in this process. In other words, the focus of early Turkish sociology was determining how to ensure the social order needed to keep the state strong. Analyses based on field research directly related to social problems were limited, and thus the suggestions or solutions to be developed were also limited.

Aside from some of the earliest studies mentioned above, a corpus of sociology based on empirical data related to social problems did notably develop until the mid-20th century. Some of the main reasons for this situation were the intensification of immigration to the city from rural areas and the beginning of the acceleration of urbanization processes, as for example, studies on change in rural areas began to emerge in the mid-Twentieth Century,⁶ as a means of understand the social changes brought by urbanization and accelerating modernization. Many social structural problems accompanied the urbanization process, such as obtaining housing, unemployment, poverty, education, and health, were the increasing social problems in areas like family life, alcohol and drug addiction, social deviance, and crime. The change in social solidarity networks and interaction patterns that accompanied urbanization caused significant social problems in Turkey. Sociologists, whose number had increased in Turkey through the 1950s, collected empirical data on social problems by doing more field research with the funds they received from the state and international organizations. In this period, the field research method which had been widely used in the Chicago School tradition in the USA in particular, contributed to the development of the empirically based sociological perspective in Turkish sociology.

⁵ Gökalp, Z. (1917). Mukaddime [Preamble]. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 1(1), 2-3.

⁶ For example, see Berkes, N. (1942). *Bazı Ankara Köyleri Üzerinde Bir Araştırma* [Research on some villagers from Ankara]. Ankara: Uzluğ Basımevi. Boran, B. (1945). *Toplumsal Yapı Araştırmaları* [Social structure research], Ankara Üniversitesi DTCF Felsefe Enstitüsü Sosyoloji Serisi. Ankara: TTK Basımevi. Ülken, H. Z. (1941). İçtimai araştırmalar [Studies on social life]. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 2(1), 271-320.

While many social problems disappeared with the improvements experienced throughout the entire 20th century in terms of the economic, political, and cultural aspects in Turkey, new social problems surfaced in almost every period or at least they become more apparent. Alongside the increase in urbanization levels in the 1980s, Turkey faced new social changes brought on by opening up political, economic, and cultural life more to outside influences. Significant social problems were experienced, such as difficulties of modernization, urbanization, the decline of the countryside, changes in work and family life, and competition for housing. Micro-level studies on addressing social theory and the social problems in Turkey in connection with the changes in sociological thought and research methods had started to gain importance in this period. For example, research attempting to address the different modes of sociality and urban problems became more common in the 1960s.

The modernization process that continued in the 1980s in Turkey accelerated with the arrival of the 2000s, which coupled with rapid changes in communication technologies, brought great changes to social life. The changes the new millennium opened the way to the emergence of new problems, and during this period qualitative research method was used more commonly to study social problems. With its increasing and demographically aging population, immigration into Turkey became more common, and the population became more diverse. New forms of discrimination faced members of ethnic groups, notably within contexts new interactions of urban and rural settlements, the variations connected to new communication technologies and media usage, and determining the different aspects of unemployment and poverty.

Sociology since its earliest iterations has always been a discipline concerned with understanding social dynamics within changing times, and its permutations depend upon the types of societies that exist, and notably the types of social problems which characterize specific eras. The aim of this special issue is to address social problems from the perspective of contemporary Turkish sociology. What is the perspective of Turkish sociology? Certainly the power of a single sociologist to answer such a question will not suffice, as this exceeds the limits of any article, special issue, or scholar. The original studies presented in this issue attempt to show the contribution the Turkish sociological perspective has made to the topics they address. Yet, these efforts obviously have to be limited because the perspective of Turkish society is to continue to attempt to establish tight ties with the theoretical and methodological knowledge in sociology, which is still a comparatively young discipline. On the other hand, the Turkish sociological perspective is not exactly new, as it has been contributing to research on social problems for over a century, has the potential to provide contributions to the social problems not just of its own society but to those of different societies.

The origins of social thought in Turkey date back further than the last quarter of the 19th century. From this perspective, although it has different content and methods, it possesses an accumulation of social thought. In terms of non-Western societies, it has been the direct and most important addressee of significant events that have changed world history like the Industrial Revolution and the French Revolution. Because it has been the mandatory interlocutor, it possesses a world of thought where many ideas have developed on how radical social changes will be realized; whether they succeed or not is not important. Turkish sociology has established relations since as early a period as can be counted with the tradition of sociological thought that developed in the West on level with the founding fathers (Marx, Weber, Durkheim). Turkish sociology has been influenced by the various traditions of sociology such as the social philosopher, historian, methodologist/empiricist, and it has experienced differentiation within itself. These divergences have provided the opportunity to debate the topic of what the methodology of sociology needs to be in Turkey. Saying that these debates have developed a new sociological perspective is difficult. However, discussing the main points of a

specific sociological perspective on the historical, social, and cultural conditions based on criticisms of Western knowledge and technique in non-Western societies will be a significant foundation in future pursuits.

The six articles are contained in this special edition are written from the perspective of Turkish sociology, whose basic features we have tried to describe, and each attempts to address the social problems that appear significant these days. We wish this issue to be a modest contribution to the discovery of the Turkish sociological perspective in addressing social problems. The colleagues contributing to this special issue have actively engaged with the social problems subfield of sociology, and in each case have produced an original piece of research focusing on some aspect of Turkish social life. The aim is to bring Turkish sociological perspectives and empirical studies of Turkish social problems to the international audience. In particular, each contributor has been asked to clarify how their empirical studies and perspectives not only shed light on the social problems on which they focus, but more generally how such findings can be relevant beyond the institutional, geographic, conceptual, and linguistic frontiers of Turkish sociology. While each article summarizes the relevance of research concerning a concrete social problem within its respective sub-field of sociology, as a whole the special issue will allow readers to access findings accessible to academic sociologists, and are intended to be accessible to those generally versed in sociology and other social science disciplines.





New Trends in Urban Life of Turkey in the Context of Lifestyle Migration

Betül Kızıltepe

*Balıkesir University, Faculty of Science and Literature, Balıkesir, TURKEY
Department of Sociology*

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 July 2020

Abstract

Demographic structures and difficult living conditions of metropolitan cities affect the search for different lifestyles by individuals living in these cities. This presents a different concept: lifestyle migration. In cities, spatial and social transformations, persuade individuals to have a simple life style than those who live in the metropolis. Today, the migration pattern has transformed from large-scale cities to smaller-scale cities. Boredom and the rat race of metropolitan life lead individuals to live in smaller-scale cities instead of large-scale. This study has explored people's migration from İstanbul to provinces during the last three years. Findings suggests that increasingly people select locations to migrate to, considering the effect it will have on their quality of life. This research aims to indicate that urban density and changing urban conditions lead individuals to live in relatively smaller cities and reveal the different trends in urban life in the context of Turkey. In this research, which is based on the secondary data analysis, migration patterns and new urban trends have been determined by examining the intercity migration data of Turkey.

Keywords: lifestyle migration, new urban tendency, better life, metropolitan city, smaller-scale city.

1. Introduction

Lifestyle migration is a new type of contemporary migration and mobility. It includes domestic and international migrants. These individuals “present migration as a route to a better and more fulfilling way of life. This way of life emphasizes on lifestyle choices specific to individuals of the developed world” (O'Reilly & Benson, 2009: 1). It is conceptualized as antimodernist (living in the village and staying away from urban lifestyle), escapist (escape from problems), self-realization project or a search for the intangible good life (O'Reilly & Benson, 2009). But the main motivation is that migrants want to live a better and less stressful life and they migrate primarily to change their life style rather than to pursue their economic goals. Lifestyle migration has different processes, motivations and experiences from other types of migration. Individual motivations underpinning life style migration includes: the fear of ecological catastrophe, the desire to escape to a safe and good place, a new type of life (Nefedova, Pokrovskii & Treivish, 2016). Besides, countries' economic and social changes are important factor to facilitate the people's lifestyle migration (Hoey, 2010; Torkington, 2012; Eimermann, 2013; Huete, Mantecón & Estévez, 2013; Gkartzios & Scott, 2015; Aner, 2016; Robins, 2019).

Lifestyle migration is an inclusive concept because it contains different sorts of migrations such as: residential migration, retirement migration, counter-urbanization, second home ownership and seasonal migration (Benson, 2010; O'Reilly & Benson, 2009; Benson & O'Reilly, 2009; AërØ, 2006; Clark & Onaka, 1983; Clark, Deurloo & Dieleman, 1984). The different types of migrations are related to the life choices of migrants who want a better life. From a better life style means, “the (re)negotiation of the work–life balance, the pursuit of a good quality of life, freedom from prior constraints” (O'Reilly & Benson, 2009: 2). This migration is important for people to make sense of contemporary life practices because the existing types of migration are not enough to interpret this phenomenon so they need new types of migration. In this context, people decide on their *life route* and it is related to their individual choice and new lifestyle (Tekeli, 2007: 471).

The urban displacement of individuals, from the metropolitan areas to relatively smaller areas, is based on improving their quality of life. In addition to the spatial change of the population, this migration symbolizes a different phase of urbanization. It presents the difference of lifestyle perception and individuals' preferences/ understandings of a new urban life. Life becomes more fluid than in the past by the effect of modernity, and this change also means occurring of the different types of migration. In spite of the increasing population density in large-scale cities, new migration movements create new urban life preferences and urban tendencies.

Urban areas have different economic, social and everyday life dynamics from rural areas and these dynamics cover a wide range from the relationships between individuals to spatial change, and from economic developments to demographic change. All of them include different lifestyles, cultural patterns and personality structures (Simmel, 1969: 50-55; Şatiroğlu, 2014: 398). The increasing density in the city causes chaotic structure and affects individuals' daily lives. While the metropolitan city provides the opportunity of autonomy and personality that is not found in rural life, it requires a level of caution and feeling of displacement not experienced in small towns; the fact that the city is sustained solely within the money economy forces the individual to be increasingly punctual, calculating, and exact, all of which characterize city life (Simmel, 1969: 50-51). According to Simmel (1969: 55), the money economy matched with being the main place of boredom, and the intense and compressed life in the city causes the individual to become mentally distant and tired. Lefebvre (1996: 127-8) suggests:

The ordering and arrangement of daily life, the massive use of the car, mobility, and the influence of the mass media have detached from site and territory individuals and groups. Neighborhood and district fade and crumble away: the people move about in a space which tends towards a geometric isotopy.

In modern city life, social activity is carried out by the behavior that is called as tactful indifference. This distance gives individuals the confidence in their daily lives (Goffman, 1956). Thus, it is clearly evident that there is a lifestyle special to the city and individualism is an important value in the city's life and it creates dissociation. Dissociation is only one of the basic forms of socialization in the city and the area of personal freedom risen by the distance shows a “relatively small circle” tendency (Simmel, 1969: 54). The physical intimacy in a crowded and chaotic structure of the city is not sufficient for mental intimacy. The distance increases with the population and spatial density of the cities. Therefore, mental intensity and fatigue in the city give rise to different problems over time.

The population pressure of the cities causes the individual's desire to escape. Escape or migration demonstrates that individuals want to change social, political, economic and hard conditions in the city (Tuan, 2015: 30). In the past, we viewed migration as a symbol of escape from the country to urban. However, now it represents an escape to nature, indicating that the people's preferences vary according to time and condition. Besides, the change in social, environmental and economic conditions has led to an increase of attention to environmental

movements and environmental culture and the change of ideas and perceptions about the nature (Tuan, 2015: 42). Giddens's structural theory (1986) suggests that the actions of individuals are influenced by changes in the society and thus individuals begin to apply different practices under social conditions (such as lifestyle migration).

The escape from the metropolis can also be defined as a part of the change or self-realization. The individual, who lives in the metropolis, describes a better place/city/life where she/or he escapes than in the metropolitan city. According to Giddens (1991: 77), time and its emphasis are self-actualization and the flow of daily social life because of "the establishing of zones of personal time which have only remote connections with external temporal orders". As a matter of fact, "*holding a dialogue with time* is the very basis of self-realization, because it is the essential condition of achieving satisfaction at any given moment - of living life to the full" (Giddens, 1991: 77). Moreover, lifestyle migration includes both opportunities and risks. In the process of self-realization and adaptation of a new lifestyle, the individual can find what she/or he wants and takes the opportunity while s/he may take the risks such as a new life and adaptation process.

With regard to self-realization, the routine decisions are important because "modernity confronts the individual with a complex diversity of choices and, because it is non-foundational, at the same time offers little help as to which options should be selected" (Giddens, 1991: 80). In this regard, the importance of lifestyle appears.

Lifestyle implies choice within a plurality of possible options. Lifestyles are routinized practices, the routines incorporated into habits of dress, eating, modes of acting and thus each of the small decisions a person makes every day contributes to such routines" (Giddens, 1991: 81).

Aspects or routine and daily life are characteristics which build the individual's identity and symbolize the individual's lifestyle. They are the individual's life project and show that the individual continues to consume in accordance to their lifestyle.

To sum up, lifestyle migration is a new concept in the literature, it offers a new beginning and life that can be preferred rather than the life before migration and it is defined as an individual decision to realize themselves. The idea of relocation and the preference of a life outside the large-scale city in order to have a better life are becoming widespread all over the world. Migrants explain their movements by comparing disadvantages and inadequacies of their previous locations/residences such as: increased crime rate, unemployment, reduced social spirit, coercive lifestyle, etc.) with features of their current locations/residences (slow pace of life, cheap life, climate and health benefits, community feeling, and so on (Benson & O'Reilly, 2009). Therefore, the migration stories emphasize the individualized and the self-realizing narrative of the migration decision, and symbolic capital that is combined with education, cultural and social capital influences the decision on migration and the chosen place (Benson & O'Reilly, 2009: 610-16). The escape from the metropolis includes the return to true self and the search for happiness in the context of a better life. The will and choice of individuals leave their marks on lifestyle and the art of life which include having a good life in pursuit of happiness as the prime engine of human thought and action (Bauman, 2008: 53).

In this study, the lifestyle migration has been discussed within the context of Turkey. This study contributes knowledge into the lifestyle migration, which has not been fully explored in Turkey to date. It aims to investigate the migration patterns and trends in urban life. Many people migrate from İstanbul to small-scale cities to have a better life. Middle and old aged people are more likely to migrate to change their lifestyle in Turkey. In this sense, the purpose of this study is to analyze the trends depending on the recent migration patterns in the country. The migration data, between 2013 and 2018 years, have been used and it is aimed to define migration patterns of the city in order to determine the change in the migration structure. The study's second aim is to find out people's preferences about the locations of their migration locations. The change

in the urban, migration from large-scale cities to the small-scale cities, structure, and trajectory of lifestyle migration has been discussed in study within the concept of Turkey/İstanbul and the demographic data has been interpreted from a sociological perspective.

2. Research method

2.1 *Research model*

This study has used secondary data analysis of quantitative data, which provides a picture of the current situation of the population and concrete data makes it easier to monitor the change and transformation in the population. “Secondary analysis involves the re-use of pre-existing qualitative and quantitative data derived from previous research studies” (Heaton, 2008: 34). Formal data sharing is the most important mode of quantitative data in secondary data analysis because researchers can access datasets in public or institutional archives and re-use them in secondary research (Heaton, 2008: 35).

2.2 *Data collection tool*

Turkish Statistical Institute’s (TurkStat) formal datasets have been used and these are comprised of: results of General Population Censuses, Address Based Population Registration System and Well-being Index in this research. These data are collected periodically, their reports are presented regularly and databases are available in the website.

2.3 *Data analysis*

In this study, data interpretations have been made mainly in the context of migration data and well-being index data, and migration trends have been described. As a matter of fact, the population of countries does not only provide numerical data but also historically, it draws pictures of social changes and transformations. Migration and well-being index data enables to offer interpretations regarding the change of migration pattern in Turkey. Istanbul, Turkey’s most crowded city, gives important clues in the context of migration dynamics and new urban trends. The city has a population of 15 million and the city can be considered as a case study to offer significant analysis in the context of Turkey’s transformation. The sample of this research consists of migrants from İstanbul to other parts of Turkey. In this study, thus migration from İstanbul to the country’s other provinces between 2013 and 2018 has been analyzed. This study has attempted to depict the common characteristics of the province, and it has presented the new urban trends in Turkey.

3. Results

In the 1950s, Turkey faced a rapid urbanization process, which resulted in the prominence of İstanbul, Ankara and İzmir as the major metropolitan cities, and marked the transition from a rural Turkey to one based on urban centers. Thusly, a decrease in the rural population and an increase in the urban population facilitated a rise in the urbanization rate. The most important developments took place in İstanbul and the city experienced the most important changes in the urban population. Consequently, İstanbul’s urban population is higher than the urban population of Turkey’s other cities (Table 1). As per the 2018’s statistics, İstanbul’s total population is 15,067,724 and still the city is the most crowded city in Turkey.

Table 1. Urban population in Turkey and İstanbul

Years	Urban population (% of total) in Turkey	Urban population (% of total) in İstanbul
1927	24.2	75.8
1950	25.0	85.9
1970	38.4	73.0
1990	59.1	92.4
2010	76.3	96.4

Source: Table generated using data from the General Population Census and Address Based Registration System in TurkStat.

İstanbul had become a crowded city, when intensive migration from rural areas to urban areas started during the 1950s. However, İstanbul has experienced net out-migration since 2015, as in Table 2. This increased migration rate makes possible to analyze the different urban trend in the context of escape from the metropolis, new mobility and lifestyle changes. Today, the quality of life gradually becomes more difficult in İstanbul because the increasing population brings several problems such as: transportation, environment and security problems. These aforementioned problems affect the quality of life in the city. In this regard, the structures of the cities that receive migration from İstanbul and the new urban tendencies have been examined in the study.

Table 2. İstanbul's migration statistics 1965-2018

Periods	Total population	Migration to İstanbul	Migration from İstanbul	Rate of net migration (‰)
2017-2018 ⁽¹⁾	15,067,724	385,482	595,803	-13.9
2016-2017 ⁽²⁾	15,029,231	416,587	422,559	-0.4
2015-2016 ⁽²⁾	14,804,116	369,582	440,889	-4.8
2014-2015 ⁽²⁾	14,657,434	453,407	402,864	3.5
2013-2014 ⁽²⁾	14,377,018	438,998	424,662	1.0
2012-2013 ⁽²⁾	14,160,467	437,922	371,601	4.7
2011-2012 ⁽²⁾	13,854,740	384,535	354,074	2.2
2010-2011 ⁽²⁾	13,624,240	450,445	328,663	9.0
2009-2010 ⁽²⁾	13,255,685	439,515	336,932	7.8
2008-2009 ⁽²⁾	12,915,158	388,467	348,986	3.1
2007-2008 ⁽²⁾	12,697,164	374,868	348,193	2.1
1995-2000 ⁽¹⁾	9,044,859	920,955	513,507	46.1
1985-1990 ⁽¹⁾	6,433,569	995,717	339,040	107.6
1980-1985 ⁽¹⁾	5,068,512	576,782	279,184	60.5

1975-1980⁽¹⁾	4,074,806	557,082	268,429	73.4
1970-1975⁽¹⁾	3,904,588	683,540	242,298	127.5
1965-1970⁽¹⁾	3,019,032	714,126	163,974	207.1

Notes: (1) Foreigners residing within the borders of the country are covered.

(2) Foreigners residing within the borders of the country are not covered.

Source: Table generated using data from the General Population Census and Address Based Registration System in TurkStat.

According to various studies, the population density of İstanbul affects the characteristics of the city. Today, İstanbul includes a stressful environment, transportation problems and increased level of air pollution and fewer green areas as compared to other metropolitan cities. Hence the urban sprawl of İstanbul consumes not only the city itself, but also surrounding cities. For example, İstanbul's water resources are not enough for the population because of the density and the settlement in water basins (Düzce-Melen, Tekirdağ-Kazandere, Pabuçdere). Also, the negative life conditions depending on the density diminish the city's attraction gradually. In this environment, some of İstanbul's residents tend to migrate back to the town or province from which they originally migrated years ago, while other individuals migrate to a city they perceive as more livable. This indicates that lifestyle migration provides a meaningful description of the migrated population (from İstanbul to other cities), as well as the definition of new mobility.

When İstanbul's migration data for the last five years was examined (see Table 3), the top ten destination provinces were: Kocaeli, Tekirdağ, Ordu, Tokat, Balıkesir, Giresun, Bursa, Sakarya, Sivas, Trabzon, Antalya, Muğla, Samsun, Kastamonu, Çankırı and Rize. The most important qualification of these cities is to have the lowest population density.

Table 3. Migration rate from İstanbul to Turkey's other provinces 2013-2018

2013-2014	%	2014-2015	%	2015-2016	%	2016-2017	%	2017-2018	%
KOCAELİ	5.50	KOCAELİ	7.00	KOCAELİ	6.70	KOCAELİ	6.40	ORDU	5.00
TEKİRDAĞ	5.00	TEKİRDAĞ	5.80	TEKİRDAĞ	5.80	TEKİRDAĞ	5.50	KOCAELİ	4.30
TOKAT	4.30	ANKARA	4.70	ORDU	4.90	ANKARA	4.70	TOKAT	4.30
ANKARA	4.20	İZMİR	4.00	ANKARA	4.30	İZMİR	4.40	TEKİRDAĞ	3.90
BALIKESİR	4.10	TOKAT	3.80	GİRESUN	4.10	TOKAT	4.10	GİRESUN	3.60
İZMİR	3.90	ORDU	3.20	İZMİR	3.90	BURSA	3.30	İZMİR	3.40
GİRESUN	3.00	BURSA	3.20	TOKAT	3.90	ORDU	2.80	ANKARA	3.40
ORDU	2.80	SAKARYA	3.00	BURSA	3.20	GİRESUN	2.80	SİVAS	3.10
BURSA	2.80	ANTALYA	2.70	SAKARYA	2.70	SAKARYA	2.70	TRABZON	2.70
MUĞLA	2.60	SAMSUN	2.50	SAMSUN	2.50	ANTALYA	2.70	SAMSUN	2.70
SİVAS	2.60	KASTAMONU	2.40	ANTALYA	2.30	SAMSUN	2.50	ÇANKIRI	2.50
SAKARYA	2.40	BALIKESİR	2.20	BALIKESİR	2.10	BALIKESİR	2.30	RİZE	2.50

Source: Table generated using TurkStat data.

Migration patterns also vary according to age groups. When the age distribution of migrants was examined, it was noticed that the share of the population over 40 years of age in the migration rate had increased over years (as in Table 4).

Table 4. Age distribution of migrants from İstanbul

	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018
0-4	5.5%	6.2%	6.6%	6.6%	5.3%
5-9	5.5%	6.3%	6.7%	6.3%	5.1%
10-14	4.6%	5.1%	5.3%	5.1%	4.5%
15-19	10.2%	12.2%	11.5%	10.6%	9.0%
20-24	13.1%	15.1%	14.5%	15.1%	12.5%
25-29	11.1%	12.2%	11.7%	12.2%	10.1%
30-34	8.6%	9.5%	9.5%	9.5%	8.2%
35-39	6.0%	7.0%	7.6%	7.6%	7.1%
40-44	4.5%	5.0%	5.3%	5.2%	5.6%
45-49	3.9%	3.9%	4.3%	4.3%	5.4%
50-54	5.0%	4.7%	5.0%	4.7%	6.2%
55-59	5.7%	4.1%	4.0%	4.3%	6.4%
60-64	5.5%	3.4%	3.4%	3.5%	5.8%
65+	10.7%	5.3%	4.6%	4.9%	8.9%

Source: Table generated using TurkStat data.

Migration from İstanbul, in the last five years, tends to be toward small-size towns and medium-size urban areas. In other words, people escape from large-scale urban areas to less-populated areas, including medium-size urban areas (population between 200,000 and 500,000) and small urban areas (population between 50,000 and 200,000). As we can see, most of the provinces where people migrate from İstanbul are smaller-size urban areas (Table 5).

Table 5. Migration from İstanbul to Other Provinces with Population

Province	Ankara	İzmir	Bursa	Antalya	Kocaeli	Samsun
Population	5,503,985	4,320,519	2,994,521	2,426,356	1,906,391	1,335,716
Province	Balıkesir	Tekirdağ	Sakarya	Muğla	Trabzon	Ordu
Population	1,226,575	1,029,927	1,010,700	967,487	807,903	771,932
Province	Sivas	Tokat	Kastamonu	Giresun	Rize	Çankırı
Population	646,608	612,646	383,373	453,912	348,608	216,362

Source: Table generated from Address Based Registration System data in TurkStat.

Most people, who live in İstanbul, are those who were born in Sivas (364,641), Ordu (293,163), Tokat (289,990), Samsun (279,391) and Erzurum (251,299) (TurkStat, 2018). The attraction of these provinces is seen in migrants from İstanbul in the last three years. Moreover, the rest of the provinces can be characterized as smaller cities when they are compared to İstanbul. As reported 2015 well-being index data, it is possible to see the detail of provinces and rankings in terms of different values, and we can notice that İstanbul has the lowest ranking regarding to security, education and life satisfaction (Table 6). At this point, it is seen that people generally migrate to provinces where there is less population; better levels of safety, education and life satisfaction. İstanbul is one good example in this context.

Table 6. Provinces (receiving migration from İstanbul) and index of well-being, 2015

Provinces	Overall Index	Housing	Work Life	Income	Health	Education	Environment	Safety	Infrastructure	Social Life	Life Satisfaction
Sakarya	2	1	28	33	14	38	14	26	20	6	15
İstanbul	5	28	33	1	29	56	37	73	1	1	50
Balıkesir	7	27	24	36	33	12	9	35	12	14	11
Rize	14	7	5	27	3	27	11	5	36	48	34
Ankara	17	8	37	2	6	44	59	75	3	4	64
Bursa	19	35	12	18	35	29	48	43	6	10	35
Trabzon	20	36	56	20	4	19	29	23	11	12	55
İzmir	21	18	60	3	16	31	36	66	2	22	51
Çankırı	22	10	54	28	34	45	35	11	59	42	6
Kocaeli	23	32	10	4	48	39	30	70	10	33	57
Giresun	29	13	46	48	15	7	45	9	48	28	22
Tekirdağ	30	22	6	5	53	46	24	55	17	20	61
Samsun	33	31	41	40	18	22	38	40	30	29	37
Kastamonu	36	16	44	38	46	37	1	39	55	40	43
Tokat	39	40	34	51	44	21	31	24	47	34	47
Sivas	40	43	53	29	28	55	34	18	41	62	45
Antalya	44	23	29	8	41	16	21	79	9	46	78
Muğla	45	44	23	15	12	26	16	81	22	30	72
Ordu	55	46	50	56	32	49	43	25	61	69	52

Source: Table generated using TurkStat data.

4. Discussion

This article addresses the pattern of lifestyle migration in Turkey. The findings are based on the secondary data in order to evaluate the individuals' preferences of urban life by migrating to the smaller cities. Data reveals that people are trying to improve the quality of life in their lives. Lifestyle migration is mainly studied in the literature through foreign migration, but it is observed that the domestic migration pattern in Turkey takes place to improve the quality of life. In this context, the province that receives the migration from İstanbul is very important. As seen in Table 5, most people migrate to smaller cities. This shows that Turkish people migrate with an aim of improving their quality of life. There are many factors that change people's living preferences and strategies such as intense, crowded and stressful life in metropolitan cities. Social changes, in the city, indicate that individuals make decisions based on these changes and lifestyle migration, which is an indicator of the dialectic of the structure-agency, also appears as part of such a change.

The fact that İstanbul has a net out-migration since 2015, such a trend can be related to the change of living conditions in the city. This relation brings new lifestyle preferences, lifestyle migration (Benson, 2010; O'Reilly & Benson, 2009) and new urban life trends up for discussion. According to the 2015 well-being index data, most of the provinces, which received migration from İstanbul, have higher scores than İstanbul in different value categories. In the context of the literature on lifestyle migration, individuals' desires to try to live their lives in a good way can be considered as a reason for the increasing migration rate from İstanbul to other cities. Thus, the descriptive statistics have been discussed in the following depending on the living, economic and environmental conditions and time management of İstanbul.

The decreasing attractiveness of urban living and the desire of individuals to change their living circumstances in the city increase the motivation of migration; thus the action that Tuan (2015) calls escape moves towards a better life is called lifestyle migration by O'Reilly and Benson (2009). Today, the profile of İstanbul, within the scope of the quality of life, is seen in the studies conducted with different criteria. The first study to be mentioned in this context is about stressful life. According to the study of Zipjet (2017), İstanbul is ranked as the 30th most stressful city among 150 ranked cities. This study has ranked the world's most stressful cities using factors such as traffic, security, employment, mental-physical health, transportation and the amount of sunshine hours to determine the stress levels of residents of the world's largest cities. At this point, the provinces, which receive migration from İstanbul, have less population density, a simpler and stress-free life as compared to İstanbul. As Simmel (1969) indicates that the effects of the chaotic environment appear in individuals' daily lives. It can be specified that people do not want stress or rat race in their lives, and they try to change this by migrating to other less stressful cities. The desire to live a less stressful life is thus can be viewed as the main motivation of Turkish people to migrate from İstanbul to the country's other provinces.

In addition, one can say that migration from İstanbul to other cities and provinces, is efficient in terms of time management. As Giddens (1991) states that holding a dialogue with time provides to individuals for spending more time for themselves in everyday life. The population density in large-scale cities increases the physical distance in the city and causes individuals to travel between home and work for minutes and even hours. According to the global traffic scorecard (2018), İstanbul is ranked as the second city, which has intense traffic. The Inrix Global Traffic Scorecard is an analysis of congestion and mobility trends in 220 cities. According to the research report of another study about traffic, *Automobile Rhythms of İstanbul* (2019), the distance to be traveled in 10 minutes in open traffic was taken in about 55 minutes. Every person spends 1 hour and 10 minutes because of traffic congestion. This means that those living in İstanbul spend 4 years of their lives in traffic. The increase in the amount of time spent in traffic causes not only quality time loss but also environmental pollution and mental fatigue of people. It is possible to say that traffic is also one of the examples of the intense and compressed life that Simmel (1969) mentions as the reason of mental fatigue for individuals in the city. All of these factors negatively affect the people's ability of self-realization and their capacity to spend productive time. Thus migrants from İstanbul tend to choose a better urban life for self-realization (O'Reilly & Benson, 2009).

Finally, İstanbul does not have a good ranking in the green area statistics. According to the Global Power City Index (2017), İstanbul is ranked low as the 40th greenest city in 44 cities, and this affects the quality of air in the city. Most of the provinces, which receive migration from İstanbul, are located in the Black Sea Region, and this case is closely related to the intense migration from this region in the 1950s, as well as the characteristics of this region. In the context of the environment and living conditions, the Black Sea Region includes provinces with greener areas and cleaner air. It can be said that geography has a meaning for self-realization, lifestyle and personal renewal, and includes personal experiences and representations. Another point to be considered here is the tendency towards a simple and nature-oriented life. The claim to nature and the desire to enjoy it reflect a tendency to flee the deteriorated city, alienated urban life (Lefebvre, 1996: 158). Hence, urban lifestyle exhausts the individual mentally and it reduces the people's chances to experience a simple and less stressful life. People generally perceive simple life positively because of the negativities in the urban life. With regard to contemporary migration patterns, the action we call lifestyle migration from the metropolis symbolizes the escape from the negative features of the city. Escape from urban life has many direct and indirect motivations. According to Lefebvre (1996: 157-8), the perception that people have a right to access to nature emerged in response to because the noise, fatigue in the concentrationary universe of the explosion of urbanization (expansion of the city wall and suburbanization). Thus, the metropolis, which erodes the individuals' lives, paves the way for a different consumption with the changes that it

creates. The important parts of this consumption are therapeutic place, idyll, ecological and organic culture. In urban life, where a fluid life prevails, the individual starts to turn towards nature and the natural one, which brings us to the consumption of the ecological as a new consumption culture. Thus, the individual who consumes the city today increasingly wants access to consume the countryside in the future. All of them indicate that consumer society is becoming a way of life and the goal is always to live better, produce more and consume more (Marcuse, 2006: 14). The metropolis without natural areas drives residents to nature, and thereby makes the countryside an object of consumption. In other words, we can assert that the artificial nature life in the metropolis leads the individual to the consumption of the rural/nature, and the process of the escape from the metropolis takes place in the context of the object of consumption. From this angle, smaller-scale cities and its lifestyle will gain more importance in the future because of the simple, stress-free life and the integration of rural and urban areas.

5. Conclusion

Lifestyle migration, which reflects a new migration tendency, is depicted with a new lifestyle and a good way of life. As urban life becomes more chaotic, interest in the lowest population density areas, rural areas and areas with close contact with rural areas lead to population mobility. It can be mentioned that the lifestyle migration associated with the life troubles in the city and the problems in individuals' lives have created new mobility pattern, new practices and producing a different urban life. Because as the statistics in Turkey have shown that people escape to smaller places from major metropolitan areas and in small place is easier to live socially than metropolitan areas. Many reasons -such as disappointment of individuals, decrease in the quality of life, increase in security problems and disruption of the time management because of the life in the metropolis- support the migration motivations of individuals. The current conditions and changes in large-scale cities lead individuals to consider different life strategies. In this sense, the process of modernization and the development of technology create new sort of mobility, the possibility of different life and the significant changes in the population dynamics in cities.

As it was seen in İstanbul, migration data in the last three years, gives us clues about new migration patterns in the country because İstanbul has always been a migrant-receiving place but has been more migrant-giving place in the past three years. The fact that İstanbul does not give good results in evaluations made according to traffic, quality of life, stressful life, and environmental conditions causes the change in the hard situations in the city by metropolitan residents. The business life has an important place in human's time zone and in İstanbul, going to work and turning back to the home of an individual is double or even triple the normal time due to traffic. This situation makes individuals' lives more stressful, less productive, physically and mentally tiring. The truth is that metropolis loses its dialogue with time, causes deterioration of environmental conditions and decreases in quality of life. In this context, the social and economic transformations in the city trigger the population to prefer to live in relatively smaller cities and aim to enhance their lives. These cities, which include a simpler urban life and provide a good life, are those where the population density is low, the environmental conditions are better, the individual can hold a dialogue with time, and s/he can realize him/herself. Social transformation changes to migration patterns and reveals the different trends in urban life in the context of Turkey; in this regard, the characteristics of these cities gain importance as an indicator of social change. Consequently, it can be said that this paper has shown that the natural/ecological living conditions in the migrant-receiving locations from İstanbul will be the models of urban life and urbanization, which includes active rural-urban area will be more important in the future.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

References

- Ærø, T. (2006). Residential choice from a lifestyle perspective. *Housing, Theory and Society*, 23(2), 109-130. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14036090600773139>
- Aner, L. (2016). Dwelling habitus and urban out-migration in Denmark. *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 23(4), 662-676. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0969776414532932>
- Bauman, Z. (2008). *The art of life*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Benson, M. (2010). The context and trajectory of lifestyle migration. *European Societies*, 12(1), 45-64. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616690802592605>
- Benson, M., & O'Reilly, K. (2009). Migration and the search for a better way of life: a critical exploration of lifestyle migration. *The Sociological Review*, 57(4), 608-625. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954X.2009.01864.x>
- Clark, W. A. V., & Onaka, Jun L. (1983). Life cycle and housing adjustment as explanations of residential mobility. *Urban Studies*, 20(1), 47-57. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00420988320080041>
- Clark, W. A. V., Deurloo, M. C., & Dieleman, M. F. (1984). Housing consumption and residential mobility. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 74(1), 29-43. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8306.1984.tb01432.x>
- Eimmermann, M. (2013). Lifestyle migration to the north: Dutch families and the decision to move to rural Sweden. *Population, Space and Place*, 21(1), 68-85. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1807>
- Giddens, A. (1986). *The constitution of society*. California: University of California Press.
- Giddens, A. (1991). *Modernity and self-identity: Self and society in the late modern age*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Gkartzios, M., & Scott, K. (2015). A cultural panic in the province? Counterurbanization mobilities, creativity, and crisis in Greece. *Population, Space and Place*, 21(8), 843-855. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1933>
- Goffman, E. (1956). *The presentation of self in everyday life*. Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh.
- Heaton, J. (2008). Secondary analysis of qualitative data: An overview. *Historical Social Research*, 33(3), 33-45. <https://doi.org/10.12759/hsr.33.2008.3.33-45>
- Hoey, B. (2010). Place for personhood: Individual and local character in lifestyle migration. *City & Society*, 22(2), 237-261. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-744X.2010.01041.x>
- Huete, R., Mantecón, A., & Estévez, J. (2013). Challenges in lifestyle migration research: Reflections and findings about the Spanish crisis. *Mobilities*, 8(3), 331-348. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17450101.2013.814236>
- Lefebvre, H. (1996). *Writings on cities*. Massachusetts: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Marcuse, H. (2006). *One-dimensional man*. London: Routledge.

- Nefedova, T. G., Pokrovskii, N. E., & Treivish, A. I. (2016). Urbanization, counter-urbanization, and rural-urban communities facing growing horizontal mobility. *Sociological Research*, 55(3), 195-210. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10610154.2016.1245570>
- O'Reilly, K., & Benson, M. (2009). Lifestyle migration: Escaping to the good life? In M. Benson & K. O'Reilly (Eds.), *Lifestyle migrations: Expectations, aspirations and experiences* (pp.1-13). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing.
- Robins, D. (2019). Lifestyle migration from the Global South to the Global North: Individualism, social class, and freedom in a centre of "superdiversity". *Population, Space and Place*, 25(6), 22-36. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.628>
- Simmel, G. (1969). The metropolis and mental life. In R. Sennett (Eds.), *Classic essay on the culture of the city* (pp. 47-60). New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts.
- Şatıroğlu, A. (2014). Ayda Yörükân'ın kent sosyolojisi çalışmaları [Ayda Yörükân's Works on Urban Sociology]. *Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 29(3), 387-402. <https://doi.org/10.16917/sd.16402>
- Tekeli, İ. (2007). Türkiye'nin göç tarihindeki değişik kategoriler [Different categories of Turkey's immigration history]. In A. Kaya & B. Şahin (Eds.), *Kökler ve yollar: Türkiye'de göç süreçleri* (pp. 447-474). İstanbul: Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Torkington, K. (2012). Place and lifestyle migration: The discursive construction of "glocal" place-identity. *Mobilities*, 7(1), 71-92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17450101.2012.631812>
- Tuan, Y. (2015). *Bir kurucu unsur olarak kaçış* [Escapism]. İstanbul: Litera Yayıncılık.



Rural Household Strategies for Expropriated Land: A Case Study of Demirci Village

Şefika Aydın

Namık Kemal University, Vocational School of Social Sciences, Tekirdağ, TURKEY

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 July 2020

Abstract

In 2017, it was decided to move the military troop from the capital city Ankara to the Polath-Sivrihisar districts line. Residents of Demirci village, located in Sivrihisar, have been faced expropriation of their lands because of this decision. This study is focused on the household strategies developed by the villagers as a result of expropriation. This study aims to address the changes in the village from a sociological perspective. In this context, interviews have been carried-out with 20 people, whose lands have been expropriated. The collected data has been analyzed descriptively. This study finds that the villagers, who have become landless, tend to migrate to cities. And the material provisions, which have been obtained from the expropriated lands, are generally used non-productively by them. This study also highlights a social disintegration caused by land expropriation in the village.

Keywords: expropriation, migration, rural areas, household strategies.

1. Introduction

Expropriation of rural areas causes a rapid change in villages (Konak, 2002; Wei, 2011; Feldman & Geisler, 2012). As a result of the loss of land that provided livelihood, households are obliged to develop new strategies (Ghatak & Mookherjee, 2014; Cao et al., 2008; Orhan & Gök, 2016; Öner, 2004).

According to Redclift (1986: 219), the term “strategy” refers to a long-term perspective, which helps the actors to make informed decisions. The strategy is seen as an adequate metaphor to understand whether actors associate their actions with social change at the macro level and to evaluate their responses to structural obstacles and stressful events (Moen & Wethington, 1992: 233; Wallace, 2002).

In this article, the concept of “household strategy” is used to analyze the behavior of villagers at micro level. This study aims to explore villagers’ responses towards expropriation, their investment and immigration decisions towards the city, their perspectives on agricultural production and animal husbandry, and the change in social relations among them.

This study is based on the idea that various social and cultural contexts, where locally developed strategies are formed, must be taken into consideration (Wallace, 2002: 276; Hajdu, 2006). Therefore, although the main focus of the study is locally developed household strategies, the study attempts to establish connections with structural factors to explain the topic. For this, the study first gives space to the literature related to the process of change and expropriation in

Turkey's countryside in the context of the phenomenon of migration then evaluates the results of the field research that has been conducted in Demirci village.

2. Rural social change in the context of the phenomenon of internal migration in Turkey

Turkish people's migration, from the country's rural areas to cities, have increased in the post-World War II period. The transition to a multiparty movement in Turkey, following World War II and the Marshall Plan that had been implemented in the 1950-1953 and 1960-1972 periods, are important elements that have impacted the rural change. On one hand, the Marshall Plan has made villages more livable to some degree. On the other hand, it has also gradually increased the workforce requirements in the industrial and construction sectors. In addition, the mechanization in agriculture after the 1950s together with other agricultural developments, has rapidly expanded arable areas. This growth; however, along with the growth in population, has caused the transformation of the traditional land system. The polarization between large landowners with small landowners and landless peasants has increased. Many villagers, who have been unable to maintain their agricultural activities, have begun to migrate to cities. Meanwhile, the improvements have provided them transportation facilities and their means of communication have increased. These developments have helped the rural people to experience a modern urban life. "Going to the cities" became quite common in the stages following this process, and thus migration became institutionalized (İçduygu et al., 1998: 221-222; Pamuk, 2009: 68).

Global economic policies have also been effective at reducing the rural population. Commodification, in the Turkish agriculture, has deepened in the globalization process, and this situation has significantly changed the farmers' lives. This structure, which has been created through global trends and comprehensive state-support policies, has eliminated the villages' customary information, production, and marketing networks. New institutions have emerged in the globalization process that establish ties between small manufacturers and larger markets. State policy strengthening of this function in the market has also created fluctuations in cost and demand, and thus small producers are defenseless against the market forces and their levels of risk and increased insecurity (Keyder & Yenil, 2011: 60; İçduygu et al., 1998: 226; Ecevit et al., 2009: 50). In fact, when examining policies on villages and villagers, although developing policies that show continuity toward villages and villagers have not been possible during and prior to the planned period that began in the 1960s, some important steps were seen to have been taken. However, the failure to develop the Government's programs and development plans for villages and villagers has been persisting since 1980, leaving villagers' problems unsolved in Turkey (Kayıkçı, 2004: 2).¹ Thus after 1985, the rural population in Turkey, has started to shrink in an absolute sense. Price-support programs have diminished, subsidies have been removed, and agricultural manufacturers continue to face with the market. The transition, from the market-protection policies to a market-dominated structure, have coincided with the self-sufficient villagers simultaneously, who have begun to separate from the land. Therefore, although great differences have appeared among the geographical regions in Turkey, the process of purifying from being a villager has accelerated in the 1980s, and this process is still continuing to date (Keyder & Yenil, 2011: 61).

Revealing what is actually happening about the movement of people, from rural to urban areas, clearly requires more diverse and different perspectives than macroeconomic factors

¹ In 1980, the Government in Turkey prepared a packet known as the January 24th Decisions. Thus the economy in Turkey had become completely subjected to the control of the IMF, and new liberal practices started to dominate in the country (Keyder & Yenil, 2011: 65).

at the national level. The results from recent research draw attention in this respect. According to Öztürk, Toploğlu, Hilton and Jongerden (2018: 518-521) financial difficulties and poverty are seen as the main reason for migration. Some other common reasons that can be added to the reasons here are: being with family for women, children, and the elderly; marriage for women; finding work, social environment, and better education opportunities for youths; and health issues for the elderly. According to Bıçkı (2011: 178), even though the rural people have been provided the opportunity for sufficient income, they are able to gravitate toward migration.

Village populations vary seasonally, especially as those villagers working in cities, return to their villages in summer months for holidays. This activity, which mostly takes the forms of resting, vacationing, and being engaged in agriculture in the summer months, sustains the villages' vitality for several months (Öztürk et al., 2018: 516-517; Şenol, 2018: 416). However, this situation cannot prevent the standstill of reproduction process on livelihood-oriented villages that are aging and whose population has decreased through migration.

3. Rural expropriation and displacement

The phenomenon of ownership, in the modern world, is seen as a most fundamental human right. In fact, the right to ownership in Turkey is also located under the protection of Article 35 of the Constitution of the Turkish Republic. Ownership rights give usage rights to the owner of the property, as explained in the law. However, this right can be restricted for the public's benefit and for legal regulation. The reason for these restrictions is provision of services such as education, health, transportation, culture, and sports (Gölcüklü, 2017: 11).

Expropriation brings significant changes; however, it causes many families to leave their original places of residence and to experience problems. People are forced to stay away from their natural environment within which they had built social institutions, maintained their culture, manufactured their products, made a living, and socialized. Therefore, the socio-spatial development in its natural state gets interrupted and socio-spatial relations are transformed (Konak, 2002: 82; Wei, 2011; Sargeson, 2013).

For those, living in the countryside, losing agricultural fields clearly means losing their basic financial security. Farmers, whose land has been expropriated, have to migrate and work in non-agricultural sectors (Wei, 2011: 513). While landowners try to resist the state's expropriation in some implementations (Feldman & Geisler, 2019: 588; Cao et. al., 2008: 22), in others expropriation can be met with silence (Steur & Das, 2009: 68-69). The kind of investment over the expropriated land affects the people's responses toward expropriation. In some cases, investments made after expropriation, are able to create new job opportunities for the villager (Yang & Ho, 2019: 588). Agricultural lands, particularly in rapidly industrializing countries like China and India, are expropriated for industrial projects and urban real estate development, and this situation opens the way to versatile results in the countryside (Ghatak & Mookherjee, 2014: 303). For example, approximately 40-50 million people in China are said to have lost arable agricultural land through expropriation and to have had to work in non-agricultural sectors (Wei, 2011: 513).

The Turkish Government usually offers two options to villagers, who face their land being expropriated: (1) compensation for expropriation, (2) provision of new land. The Government uses objective and subjective criteria for the expropriation costing. In addition to these two criteria, mixed systems are also found in which both criteria are used together (Tanrıvermiş et al., 2002: 112). When analyzing studies regarding expropriated villages in Turkey, expropriation is seen to bring many problems with it, such as migration, infrastructure, transforming the production structure, and socio-cultural disengagement (Orhan & Gök, 2016; Bakırcı, 2016; Konak, 2002; Koday, 2013; Şahin, 2000; Şatıroğlu, 2012. Öner, 2004; Tunç, 2013).

As suggested in these studies, some villagers receive expropriation compensation for their land, if their land has been expropriated. Expropriation significantly changes the socio-economic structure in villages. Villages' demographic structures also change, and village populations are reduced by almost half. Those, who belong to rural areas, prefer to migrate to cities where their relatives reside. Families, who only spend summer in the village, come to live in the city rest of the year. Some families spend the money that they receive in exchange for their land on constructing a home in their newly established villages. When assessing basic expenditures and household strategies, many more villagers are seen to have become consumers rather than producers (Orhan & Gök, 2016: 142-143). Therefore, considering expropriation as an important socio-spatial intervention that affects villagers' futures would not be wrong.

4. Research method

4.1 *Research model*

In this research, a case study which is one of the qualitative methods was conducted. The process that the event of expropriation leads to in the village is considered able to be analyzed in-depth using the case study.

The first of the research hypotheses is that rural expropriation precipitates the process of terminating subsistence production. The second hypothesis is that rural expropriation leads to immigrating to cities and resolving social relations in the countryside. Another hypothesis is that villagers come from the position of manufacturer to the position of consumer as a result of expropriations that occur in the form of cash payments.

4.2 *Participants*

The research data have been collected from Demirci village residents who've become landless through the process of expropriation. Pre-field examinations have been done in the village, and around 150 people's fields are determined to have been expropriated; around half of these people are landowners though inheritance and have been identified as people who have no interest in farming and continuously live in the city.

The sample size in qualitative research is affected by many factors such as research topic and purpose and changes accordingly (Neuman, 2004: 161). The sample of the study consists of 20 people whose land has been expropriated. Five of the interviewees are women and 15 of them are men. All the women, who have participated in the interview, are widows and all the men are married. The youngest participant is 40 and the oldest is 73 years old. The participants' average age is 58. When examining educational status, 15 participants have received primary school education, four have received high school education; and one, undergraduate education.

Most of the participants receive pensions in addition to many other forms of income. In total, 14 interviewees receive a pension. Of those receiving a pension, only three rented their land. The others, on the contrary, have engaged themselves in agriculture. Four interviewees have obtained income from a trade in addition to agriculture. Six interviewees earn income from both husbandry and agriculture. Only one interviewee's sole income is from farming. While 2,084 acres of land in total were expropriated, 2,148 acres of land were not expropriated. References made to the participants have been done by specifying participant number in order interviewed, gender, and marital status in parentheses in the text.

4.3 Data collection

The interview technique has been used in the field research. Interviews were held with five villagers before forming the interview questions. In addition, observations were made in the village, and the fields and pastures where the expropriated lands are found have been visited. The semi-structured questionnaire form has been formed based on pre-field interviews, the notes taken from the observations, and the literature review.

The interviewed villagers have been asked about their demographic information, their relations with agriculture and animal husbandry, how much of their land is available, their attitudes toward expropriation, their attitudes toward the material compensation paid for expropriation, how they use the expropriation compensation, their perceptions on the socio-economic change that expropriation have caused, and their expectations related to the future of their village and agriculture.

For sampling, the qualitative research has used purposeful sampling. The interview list was created in line with the information obtained from the pre-interviews done in the village. People, who have resided in the village, prior to the expropriation have been focused specifically in this study. The application stage of the research has been conducted between 6th July and 9th July, 2019. The participants have been provided with information about the study prior to the interview, and consent has been received for using a voice recorder to record the interview.

4.4 Data analysis

The case and individuals are described primarily in case analysis and then problems and themes are analyzed (Cresswell, 2017: 196). Thematic analysis allows one to focus on describable life and behavioral patterns. Thus, the themes that emerge from the participants' stories are brought together to form a comprehensive picture of their common experiences (Aronson, 1994: 1-2).

The data obtained from the voice recordings have been encoded for data analysis. All encoded interviews and notes related to the field observations have been read. The encoded interviews have been analyzed in the program MAXQDA. In the coding, similar topics have been brought together and the topics have been abbreviated as codes (Creswell, 2017: 198). Thus, the emerged themes have been analyzed by associating them with the literature.

5. Findings

5.1 A village whose land has been expropriated: Demirci

The village of Demirci, where the research has been carried out, is located in Eskişehir's Sivrihisar district. The village is off of the Eskişehir-Ankara Highway 33 km from Sivrihisar, 133 km from Eskişehir, and 32 km from Ankara's Polatlı district. Demirci has been established on top of a hill. The village has a hot and dry climate during summer and weather turns cold in the winter here. The lands are steppes, and dry farming (barley, wheat) is generally done. Irrigation farming can be done in a very small area that is watered by artesian wells. One of the basic sources of income is sheep and goat farming. The village has a primary school that has been unused for a long time, lodgings for two teachers, a health center, and a sanatorium. In addition, the village has a drinking water system and a post office. Access to the village is provided by two roads, one asphalt road and the other a gravel road (Sivrihisar Sosyal Kültür & Dayanışma Derneği, 2019).

The population of the village was 641 in 1965, 626 in 1980, 550 in 1990, 323 in 2000, and 210 in 2010. The population of the village, which was 168 in 2015, was determined as 156 when coming to 2018 (TurkStat, 2019).

In 2017, the inhabitants of Demirci have faced land expropriation because of authorities' efforts to move the military from Ankara to the border of the Polatlı and Sivrihisar districts (*Hürriyet Gazetesi*, 2019). According to the interviewees' response, a large portion of the village's arable lands has been expropriated.² Furthermore, interview data suggests that the rate of arable agricultural land has decreased considerably after the second expropriation of land.

The demographic structure is stated to have changed significantly after the expropriation in the village. The village leader did not give any clear information on this issue. The interviewees stated that 20 households live in the village all year round. A significant portion of these are those engaged in animal husbandry.

5.2 Responses to expropriation and the developed household strategies

The village's expropriated lands were stated to have low-productivity. Seven respondents were in favor of the expropriation, especially due to the inefficiency of the expropriated land. These interviewees' poor financial situation prior to the expropriation made it attractive to them because of the income they were taking in. Nine interviewees assessed the expropriation negatively. The interviewees' assessment that land ownership is a necessity for their continued survival appears as the main reason they didn't accept expropriation.

Now they have taken our future this way; that's why I didn't want it. I mean, now we can't leave anything for our kids to inherit. We will leave an empty life in front of them, nothing at all. For example, we will say that you have school or else you are someone else's slave. But even if we had our own land, the children would stay here even if hungry and thirsty (#15, Man, 59).

The state had expropriated the village pastures prior to expropriating their agricultural land. Expropriation of the pastures was generally perceived negatively by the villagers who earn their livelihood with animal husbandry.

I think, the expropriation shouldn't happen because I'm dealing with sheep; I mean it hurt me. My pastures are gone I can't raise livestock (#7, Man, 50).

The expropriation occurred in the village by giving the expropriation compensation as cash. The research participants were asked how they would evaluate being given land instead of the expropriation compensation. Some of the participants stated not wanting to go anywhere other than their village when facing this question. Another section said they could move to new fields, on the record "having fertile lands," because they know nothing but farming and have the agricultural tools and machines. Some participants stated not wanting to be given other lands because they are old, because they have not kids interested in farming, or because they need the money.

It is seen that expropriation of lands and pastures in the village negatively affects the sustainability of agriculture and animal husbandry. The villagers are unable to predict what to do when faced with diminished lands. However, quite a few mentions that agriculture and animal

² According to information given by an interviewee who had previously taken part in village administration, the village has a total of 75,000 quarter-acres of land, including pastures, settlement units, and arable and non-cultivated lands. Of this land, the state has expropriated approximately 31,600 quarter-acres. Within the 31,600 quarter-acres of expropriated land are around 14,270 quarter acres of pasture land (#17, Man, 40).

husbandry would have no future if there is no expropriation. According to the interviewees, no new generation has been produced that will maintain the fields and livestock. In particular, the children born in the village, begin living in urban areas at young age for their education, resulting disruption in the village's processes of reproduction. Young people prefer urban living and they are unable to be completely included in the traditional learning and social reproduction processes (Bıçkı, 2011). This situation deteriorates the relationship between production and social reproduction (Katz, 1991).

Since there is no young generation in the village, agriculture may end completely in the future. It's not the generation ending (#19, Man, 62).

In addition to not producing new generations, changes in climate conditions, the unprofitability of lands, and the occurrence of the relatively high cost of agricultural inputs in Turkey do not make agricultural and animal production sustainable in villages based on subsistence production. On this point, expropriation is seen as an accelerating factor in the sustainability of agriculture and animal husbandry in terms of time.

The villagers have given various responses on the issue of whether or not the compensation for expropriation that the state paid the villagers reflected the real value of the land. Some participants have stated that the material value has been much lower prior to their land being expropriated, and others have been able to receive higher compensation and mention that they have received good compensation from the state. Still others state that the village has been seriously damaged as a result of having the military included in the land, especially within the areas of expropriated pastures, and they could not establish any business with the given compensation, and that their future has been taken away.

While livelihoods based on sheep and goat farming has occurred in the past in villages, the number of people involved in animal husbandry these days has considerably decreased. One interviewee states that 10 people remained interested in sheep and goat farming, and that the number of animals is approximately 2,000. The interviewees, who have done steer breeding, state having to sell their animals when permission wasn't given to enter the pastures. The participant's statement, below, perfectly explains the process regarding the expropriation of the pastures and the villagers' response to it.

First, they (the state) already expropriated the pastures. State officials asked the peasants to approve the expropriation of the pastures. All the villagers approved the expropriation of the pastures. The pastures were expropriated, afterward they expropriated the fields... Later, everyone regretted it. The animal farmers also didn't want it... Once the pastures were expropriated, expropriating the fields was just easy (#11, Man, 48).

"If your land had never been expropriated and someone wanted to come and buy your land for the same value, would you sell?" A section of the villagers responded to the question saying they would not sell their land because it is a source of income for them and it has a valuable presence that can be left as an inheritance in the future. Those, who say that they would sell based these thoughts on reasons such as not having fertile soil, the toil of farming not bringing in income, old age, and no generation remaining to toil in the fields.

Only four interviewees have lived in the village during winters and the city in summers prior to expropriation. Sixteen participants permanently reside in the village. These figures change after expropriation. Eight interviewees have migrated with their family to the city and now only spend summer months in the village and winter months in the city. The other eight interviewees permanently live in the village.

Seventeen of the participants have bought houses with their expropriation compensation that has been given as cash in Ankara's Polatlı District, in Eskişehir, or in Ankara

(108 km), which have respective distances of 32 km, 133 km, and 108 km from the village. Most of these residences were bought for the purpose of “use value.” Their preference for such an investment can be explained by: (1) villagers who have lost land primarily preferring places where their fellow townsmen are, (2) wanting to still continue agricultural work in the village, and (3) desiring to stay in touch with the village.

Aside from buying a home in the city with part of the money they have received, a section of the villagers has been found to act in certain ways such as paying debts, buying a new car or fixing up their current car, replacing the furniture in the house, doing maintenance to their village home or building a new home, and giving their children financial assistance. Therefore, a significant portion of the interviewed people could not become entrepreneurs, could not establish a business in the city, and could not buy land or live stocks in their village. They have inclined to invest in housing without a significantly productive return. When asked the reasons villagers invested their compensation they have received from expropriation in housing, a portion of the villagers stated that because they didn’t receive the money at once but at two different times, they spent the money in different ways each time. Some participants mention that they are not being able to make an income-generating investment because of the scarceness of the money. Some of those, whose land has been expropriated, mention that they are not being able to start new work because of being old or not knowing any work other than farming.

Only two interviewees state that they have not made any investment yet with all the money they have received. One interviewee has started cattle breeding by combining the expropriation compensation with earlier savings in order to do animal husbandry in the village. The two interviewees have gotten a commercial vehicle in the city.

The village has the expectation of a second expropriation. A significant portion of the participants doesn’t want the entire village to be expropriated. Another portion of the villagers stated that, while leaning towards continuing the expropriation of lands that were dry farmed, they had not wanted the lands that were settled and the portion that was suitable to irrigated agriculture to be expropriated. The basic reason for not wanting the village’s settled areas and irrigated agricultural lands to be expropriated can at least be explained by the desire to maintain the ancestral relations in the village and thus through the emotionality that the presence of a village and a past invoke.

We live and die here. I don’t want the village to go. (#2, Woman, 73)

When questioning change in the village economically, most of the interviewees stated people had bought homes and migrated from the village.

Everyone bought a new car. They changed their cars, bought homes in the city, and renovated their houses in the village (#12, Woman, 66).

Some of the participants have renovated their homes after the expropriation. This case is in fact an indicator that their hope from the village hadn’t been completely cut. However, the point that social relations have come to shows social disintegration to have occurred. A significant number of participants stated migrating to the city because of animal husbandry reaching the end of the line and arable land being reduced. Additionally, because of villagers being old and their children choosing not to live in the village, they felt concerned about the future of the village.

(Will your children continue your line of work?) They don’t get it; no one is left who can. We are the last generation. We are the last generation to deal with livestock. We can’t find anyone after us (#17, Man, 40).

6. Discussion

Studies in the field of Turkish rural sociology since the foundation of the Republic of Turkey have addressed various political practices such as statism, protectionism, liberalization, national development, being open to global markets, and local/regional development (Nerse, 2014: 165; Ecevit et al., 2009: 47-48). Sociological studies taking on the subject of expropriations (especially due to dam constructions) that occurred as a result of policies for rural development have mostly addressed the consequences of forced migration and resettlement (Şatıroğlu, 2012; Tunç, 2013; Öner, 2004; Orhan & Gök, 2016). In the international literature, researches on the forced migration and relocation caused by expropriations applied in underdeveloped countries (Feldman & Geisler, 2012) and on the social problems caused by the expropriations aimed at development particularly in industrialized countries such as China and India have drawn attention (Ghatak & Mookherjee, 2014; Fernandes & Raj, 1992; Sargeson, 2013; Wei, 2011).

The common thread observed in the studies in the literature is that the expropriation process leads to changes in social relations, household structures, stratification, production and consumption patterns in addition to social unrest and corrosive relations with public institutions (Konak, 2002; Tunç, 2013; Şatıroğlu, 2012; Sargeson, 2013; Wei, 2011). Furthermore, expropriation affects people psychologically and leads to anxiety and stress for the future (Şatıroğlu, 2012).

In the case of Demirci village, there was no forced migration and resettlement. A significant number of villagers eagerly approved the expropriation and voluntarily migrated from the village to the city, although they had lands that were not expropriated and the residences in the village. This result makes sense only in a social and cultural context (Wallace, 2002).

When the data obtained in the example of Demirci village were examined, it is determined that those who leased their fields and those who had constantly stayed in the village under the burden of agricultural debt desired expropriation. Some villagers, on the other hand, have relied on the expropriation cost and easily approved the expropriation of the pastures of the village, since a new generation to stay in the village could not reproduce. It is considered that these results may be associated with the effect of rural and agricultural policies in Turkey on the villages producing for subsistence. (Pamuk, 2009; Keyder & Yenil, 2011; Ecevit et al., 2009). However, the fact that those who continued their subsistence especially through ovine breeding and those involved in agricultural production by coming to the village in summer months although living in the city did not want the expropriation also draws attention. For these people, land is seen to mean assurance (Wei, 2011: 513).

Expropriation accelerated the process of social dissolution that has occurred through migration to cities and modern life that has entered the villages after 1980. Similar to the literature, with the expropriation, the decrease in the number of households staying in the village in the winter months and the fact that those who moved to the city came to the village for a short time leads to further dilution of the relations and the dissolution of the primary relations (Konak, 2002; Wei, 2011). Additionally, as seen in other samples, villagers evaluated the expropriation price they received with non-income-generating expenses such as housing investment, car and furniture purchasing in the city instead of investing in profitable areas (Şahin, 2000: 85; Orhan & Gök, 2016).

Briefly, when the household strategies of the villagers faced expropriation are evaluated, these have been determined that (1) the villagers who'd been made landless tend to migrate to the city, (2) the financial provision obtained from expropriation is generally used in non-productive ways, and (3) a social dissolution is experienced.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

References

- Aronson, J. (1994). A pragmatic view of thematic analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, 2(1), 1-3.
- Bakırcı, M. (2016). Barajların mekânın yeniden organizasyonuna etkileri: Melen barajı örneği [The effects of dams on the spatial reorganization: The case of Melen dam]. *Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi*, (33), 439-464.
- Bıçkı, D. (2011). Türkiye kırsalında yoksulluk sorunu: Çanakkale Kocalar köyü örneği [Rural poverty problem in Turkey: Çanakkale Kocalar village example]. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi*, 30(1), 161-180.
- Cao, G., Feng, C., & Tao, R. (2008). Local land finance in China's urban expansion: Challenges and solutions. *China and World Economy*, 16(2), 19-30. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-24X.2008.00104.x>
- Cresswell, J. (2017). *Araştırma deseni: Nitel, nicel ve karma yöntem yaklaşımları* (3. Baskı) [Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches]. Ankara: Eğiten Kitap.
- Ecevit, M., Karkıner, N., & Büke, A. (2009). Köy sosyolojisinin daraltılmış kapsamından, tarım-gıda köylülük ilişkilerine yönelik bazı değerlendirmeler [Some evaluations on agriculture-food peasant relations from the constricted scope of village sociology]. *Mülkiye*, 33(262), 41-62.
- Feldman, S., & Geisler, C. (2012). Land expropriation and displacement in Bangladesh. *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 39(3-4), 971-993. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03066150.2012.661719>
- Fernandes, W., & Raj, A. (1992). *Development, displacement and rehabilitation in the tribal areas of Orissa report*. New Delhi: Indian Social Institute.
- Ghatak, M., & Mookherjee, D. (2014). Land acquisition for industrialization and compensation of displaced farmers. *Journal of Development Economics*, 110, 303-312. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2013.01.001>
- Gölcüklü, M. (2017). *Acele kamulaştırma* [Rush expropriation]. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Hajdu, F. (2006). *Rural livelihood strategies in Eastern Cape, South Africa*. Linköping: Department of Water and Environmental Studies, Linköping University.
- İçduygu, A., Sirkeci İ. & Aydınğün İ. (1998). Türkiye’de iç göç ve iç göçün işçi hareketlerine etkisi, *Türkiye’de içgöç* [The internal migration in Turkey and the effect of internal migration on worker movements.]. İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, pp. 207-244.
- Katz, C. (1991). Sow what you know: The struggle for social reproduction in rural Sudan. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 81(3), 488-514.
- Kayıkçı, S. (2004). Cumhuriyet’in kuruluşundan günümüze kadar köye ve köylüye yönelik olarak izlenen politikalar [Policies followed to the village and the villagers from the foundation of Republic of Turkey to the present]. *Türk İdare Dergisi*, (448), 1-22.
- Keyder, Ç., & Yenal, Z. (2011). Agrarian change under globalization: Agrarian change under globalization. *Journal of Agrarian Change*, 11(1), 60-86.
- Koday, Z. (2013). Yeri değiştirilen köy yerleşmelerine örnek: Aşağı Çat, Yukarı Çat ve Taşağıl köyleri [Examples of Villages which are Translocated: Aşağı Çat, Yukarı Çat and Taşağıl]. *Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 17(1), 223-238.

- Konak, A. (2002, Mayıs). Sosyal Antropolojik Yaklaşımla Yeniden Yerleştirme Uygulamalarının Karşılaştırmalı İncelenmesi (Yenisamsat, Reyhanlı/Vazvaza, /Yalıköy Örnekleri) [A comparative examination of practices of resettlement from perspective of social anthropology]. *C.Ü. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 26(1), 81-100.
- Moen, P. & Wethington, E. (1992). The concept of family adaptive strategies. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 18, 233-251.
- Nerse, S. (2014). Türkiye kır çalışmalarında paradigma değişimi [Paradigm shift in the Turkish rural studies]. *Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 3(29), 165-179.
- Neuman, W. (2004). *Basics of social research: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Boston: Pearson Education.
- Orhan, F., & Gök, Y. (2016). Baraj yapımı nedeniyle yeri değiştirilen yerleşmelere örnek: Oruçlu ve Zeytinlik köyleri (Artvin) [Construction of the dam due to the Replaced Settlement Place Example: Fasting and Olive Villages (Artvin)]. *Doğu Coğrafya Dergisi*, 21(35), 131-148. <https://doi.org/10.17295/dcd.58254>
- Öner, İ. (2004). Kadınların Kırdan Kente Yeniden Yerleşime Cevabı: Elazığ'da Keban barajı kadın göçmenleri örneği [Women's response to rural-urban resettlement: A case study of Keban Dam Female Migrants in Elazığ]. Ph. D. diss., Fırat University.
- Öztürk, M., Topaloğlu, B., Hilton, A., & Jongerden, J. (2018). Rural–urban mobilities in Turkey: Sociospatial perspectives on migration and return movements. *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies*, 20(5), 513-530. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19448953.2018.14066>
- Pamuk, Ş. (2009). Türkiye’de tarım ve iktisadi gelişme: 1880-2000 [Agriculture and economic development in Turkey: 1880-2000]. *Mülkiye*, XXXIII (262), 63-76.
- Redclift, M. (1986). Survival strategies in rural Europe: Continuity and change. *Sociologia Ruralis*, 26(3/4), 15-27.
- Sargeson, S. (2013). Violence as development: Land expropriation and China's urbanization. *Journal of Peasant Studies*, 40(6), 1063-1085. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03066150.2013.865603>
- Steur, L., & Das, R. (2009). What’s left? Land expropriation, socialist “modernizers,” and peasant resistance in Asia. *Focaal- European Journal of Anthropology*, (54), 67-72. <https://doi.org/10.3167/fcl.2009.540105>
- Şahin, K. (2000). Altınkaya baraj gölü suları altında kalan köylerden göç edenlerin karşılaştıkları sorunlar ve Vezirköprü şehrine etkileri [Problems of migrants from villages due to Altınkaya dam and their effects on the city of Vezirköprü]. *Osmangazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* (Special Issue), 85-99.
- Şatıroğlu, K. (2012). *Zorunlu göç ve yeniden yerleşimin toplumsal çevre üzerindeki etkisi: Tahtalı barajı örneği* [Land versus Cash versus No Compensation: Long-Term Socio-Economic Impacts of Tahtalı Dam in Turkey]. Ph. D. diss., Ankara University.
- Şenol, E. (2018). Kırdan kente göçün kırsal alanlara etkileri: Boraboy köyü örneği (Amasya Taşova) [The effects of migration from rural to urban on to rural areas: the example Boraboy village (Amasya-Taşova)]. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 11(55), 407-421. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17719/jisr.20185537210>
- Tanrıvermiş, H., Gündoğmuş, E., Birinci, A., & Ceyhan, V. (2002). Türkiye’de tarım arazilerinin kamulaştırma bedellerinin tespitinde karşılaşılan sorunlar ve çözüm yolları [Problems and their solutions for valuing of farmland for condemnation in Turkey]. *Türkiye V Tarım Ekonomisi Kongresi*, pp. 111-123. Erzurum.
- Tunç, İ. (2013). Sivas ili Hafik ilçesi Pusat barajı yapımından etkilenen nüfusun yeniden yerleştirilmesi ve uyum sorunlarının sosyal kültürel antropolojik açıdan incelenmesi [The resettlement of the population affected by the construction of the Pusat Dam, located in Hafik of Sivas city, and the exploration of this population's integration problems from social, cultural and anthropological views]. MA thesis, Cumhuriyet University.

- TurkStat. (2019). Municipal, village and neighborhood populations. Retrieved 4 March 2019, from <https://biruni.tuik.gov.tr/medas/?kn=95&locale=tr>.
- Wallace, C. (2002). Household strategies: Their conceptual relevance and analytical scope in social research. *Sociology*, 36(2), 275-292. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038502036002003>
- Wei, Z. (2011). Rural elderly in contemporary China: A case study of a village in Jiangsu Province. *Marriage & Family Review*, 47(8), 511-528. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01494929.2011.622071>
- Yang, X., & Ho, P. (2019). Is mining harmful or beneficial? A survey of local community perspectives in China. *The Extractive Industries and Society*, (6), 584-592. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.exis.2019.02.006>





The Social Networks and Engagements of Older Turkish Migrants in Germany

Ferhan Saniye Palaz

Istanbul University, Department of Sociology, Istanbul, TURKEY

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 July 2020

Abstract

During the 1960s, Germany received high numbers of Turkish labor migrants, and this first generation has currently reached to old age. This qualitative research aims to discuss the social networks and engagements of these older Turkish migrants who have aged in Germany. Academia has shown growing interest in the importance of social capital of older people in the form of their social networks, social support, and social participation. This study focuses on their daily social interactions in Germany. The findings reveal that participation in associations, social clubs, and neighborhood social groups enables them to re-establish new social roles in post-retirement period and after their child-bearing years. Their small groups, which meet regularly, are valuable emotional support resources. Their relatively low human capital is argued to influence the homogeneity of their social networks, but not the variety of social engagements.

Keywords: aging, transnational aging, social capital, social engagement, social networks, older migrants.

1. Introduction

Aging and migration have been dominant factors in Europe's socio-demographic change since the 1950s and influenced several European countries' domestic political agenda, from macro-economic management to community relations (Ruspini, 2009; Warnes et al., 2004). For countries, which have imported a migrant labor force after World War II, older migrants constitute a growing population stratum (Ciobanu & Hunter, 2017). Germany is known to have developed a highly organized labor migration system in Europe's post-war history and has concluded recruitment agreements with Turkey in 1961, as well as with many other countries between 1955 and 1973 (Castles & Kosack, 1973).

According to official policies, "guest workers" were meant to be temporary. But even after suspending of the program in 1973, most didn't return, and additional flow of migration occurred for family reunification (Schierup, Hansen & Castles, 2006). The exact number of Turkish guest workers, who have migrated to Germany between 1961 and 1973, is unknown (Yurdakul, 2009). According to Kaya (2007), many Turkish migrants in Germany have practically and symbolically have made both countries their social sphere. Portes, Guarnizo and Landolt (1999) characterize migrants' "dual life" as having homes in two countries, speaking two languages, and making a living through continuous regular contact across national borders. Currently, the Turkish immigrants and their children are the largest ethnic minority group in Germany (Barwick & Beaman, 2019), and the first-generation of migrants have already retired or

approaching to their retirement age. Migrants are becoming a substantial part of Europe's older population (Ciobanu, Fokkema & Nedelcu (2017). A majority of this population group in the Western Europe includes labor migrants who arrived before 1970s (Lanzieri, 2011).

The number of those, who return to their country of origin, is known to decrease with age (Bolzman et al., 2004). Even with a persistent intention to spend retirement in their country of birth, most stay in the country of immigration (Fokkema & Naderi, 2013). According to Liversage and Mizrahi Mirdal (2017), the intention of first-generation Turkish adults in Denmark to return their home countries changes gradually with time based on economic status, healthcare needs, and where their children live. Older migrants, who migrated while young, maintain bridges between the two countries to link their two identities through their home designs, holiday traditions, traditional foods, and associations and clubs they attend (George & Fitzgerald, 2012). First-generation migrants tend to stay emotionally attached to both their home and host countries (Phillipson et al., 2003 and Gardner, 2006; as cited in Buffel, 2017).

Overall, global migration has led to a new type of aging that takes place in a transnational social sphere (Castells, 1996; as cited in Heikkinen & Lumme-Sandt, 2013). In transnational aging, multiple places simultaneously have value to older adults (Klok et al., 2017). Thus, considering different sorts of social networks rather than focusing solely on a local basis becomes increasingly important for academic debate (Ryan et al., 2008). According to Horn and Schweppe (2017), by cutting across many themes such as everyday practices, biographies, family relationships, social services, well-being, and social policy related to aging research, transnational aging offers us a broader approach to the existing theoretical paradigm. Warnes and Williams (2006: 12) stated that international migrants' aging to be "at the meeting-ground between two well-established academic and applied fields: migration studies and social gerontology."

This paper investigates the social networks and engagements of the first-generation older Turkish migrants, who have aged in Germany using qualitative research, focusing on their social space in the country of immigration as their geographical mobility between two countries tends to diminish with health problems and disabilities (Stuck et. al., 1999). In the light of Gray's (2009) study, social networks and engagements through formal organizations refer to clubs and faith-based organizations, and informal ties with friends and neighbors. Social capital theorist Putnam's (2000) ideal types *macher* and *schmoozer* are used. *Macher* refers to social networks and engagements, which are based on various cultural, political, and leisure activities/events like attending meetings in faith-based organizations / social clubs, volunteer work, giving speeches, and voting in neighborhood improvement associations and so on. *Schmoozer* also hints at an active social life, but is much less planned and more spontaneous, such as organizing dinners for friends at home, playing card games, passing free time with neighbors, and visiting family members. Putnam (2000) concludes that the one, who does any of the aforementioned activities, is more likely to do the rest. According to Nyqvist and Forsman (2015), the major strength of using social capital theory in aging research is its capacity to cut across different disciplines like public health, social policy, sociology, economics, and political science, and it is therefore applicable to a variety of disciplines. Interest has grown within academic debate on social capital's importance in old age (Poulsen et al., 2011).

Social networks function at different levels, namely: interpersonal, neighborhood, community, governmental, and institutional (Börsch-Supan et al., 2015). To avoid loneliness and isolation in old age, the most successful social network type results from long-term residence and active community involvement in organizations. Authors call these close relationships with local family, friends, and neighbors as "locally integrated support networks" (Wenger, Burgholt & Scott, 2001; as cited in Gray, 2009). Several studies support the significance of involvement in formal organizations and community in old age (Liu & Besser, 2003).

Several studies have discussed and evidenced strong social networks and engagements' positive effect on health and well-being in old age. According to results of de Donder et al. (2012) study, attending cultural activities and being an association/club member contribute to higher levels of feeling safe in old age. Steffens et al. (2016) suggest that club membership in old age is associated with higher levels of life quality and lower levels of early mortality. Moreover, according to studies conducted by Cruwys et al. (2013; 2014), having membership in more than one club helps to decrease the risk of depression. Warburton and McLaughlin (2005) suggest that older people's individual small gestures of volunteerism to be important to both communities and families. Increased social interaction and membership in different clubs reduce memory decline and vulnerability to dementia (Ertel, Glynour & Berkman, 2008; Fratiglioni, Paillard-Borg & Winblad, 2004; as cited in Gleibs et al., 2011).

According to Ysseldyk, Haslam and Haslam (2013), social networks provide a basis for maintaining social identity among older adults in the context of major life transitions, such as episodes of hardships resulting from illness or injury (Haslam et al., 2008), significant life events like entering a nursing home (Knight et al., 2010), the gradual process of aging itself (Aldwin et al., 2007), and perhaps even being reminded of one's own mortality (Sani, Herrera & Bowe, 2009). For migrants, aging adds unique challenges to these life transitions, such as feeling even more homesick even more after retirement and confronting exclusion/social disadvantages (Patzelt, 2017). Thus, social networks and engagements become even more significant for aging migrants.

2. Methods and research contextualization

This research aims to understanding the older Turkish migrants' social networks and engagements by evaluating their daily social interactions based on semi-structured interviews. The interviews give insight into: (1) what urban and public spaces they use to socialize? (2) who they would prefer to socialize with and also how frequently?, and (3) how accessible are their current homes and how it affects their social networks and engagements?. The interviews have been carried out in 2016, five in Berlin, seven in Cologne, and six in Frankfurt. I intended to include a more diverse group after the qualitative research, which I had conducted mostly in mosque-related associations and participants' houses in the Netherlands in 2015 (Palaz & Adıgüzel, 2016). However, I could only partly achieve this because most potential participants did not agree to be interviewed by me. At the end, I conducted eight interviews in mosque-related associations, two in secular/political associations, two in Turkish coffee houses, two in German local coffee shops (*bäckerei*), and four in their homes.

This study uses the phenomenological research design. The participant requirements, which have been determined by using the social science literature, include: an age group over 60 years, good health condition, and a migrant status at a young age. The problem-centered interview has been chosen as the data collection technique. Audio recordings of the collected data has been transcribed for systematic interpretation and descriptive analysis. After determining the themes, systematic analysis has been performed by defining the correlation between themes and transcripts (Kümbetoğlu, 2012; Mayring, 2011). Comments have been made according to the relevant literature on sociology after the data analysis.

All interviews have been conducted individually. Respondents have been recruited using snowball sampling. I have spent more time in these public and urban spaces than the duration of the interviews. The method, which I have used to achieve a relative high diversity, is to ask potential participants whether they are members of social club/association and if I could visit that place with them. I have managed to visit a secular/political association and Turkish coffee house this way. I have also asked participants if they know any first-generation older Turkish adults who would accept being interviewed by me.

My interviewees vary in terms of religious, political, cultural, and ethnic backgrounds. The youngest participant in the study group is 63, while the oldest one is 91. All my participants have children, and many have grandchildren; fourteen participants are married and the rest are widowed. Some live in the same household/building with their descendants, but most live in different parts of the city.

As a native Turkish speaker, I have conducted all interviews in Turkish. As a consequence of different early life stage experiences, male participants have tended to speak German better. This was mostly related to their position in the work market. The gainfully employed female participants state Turkish to be the main/only language needed at work, so they have not learned German properly. I reference my informants' quotes by putting additional information in brackets, if necessary, to provide a clearer picture of the interview:

"I go to a sports center with one of them [one of her neighbors]."

Most participants, in this study, have graduated from elementary school. One is a teacher (University degree), one has a two-year college degree, and two are high school graduates. One female participant is currently learning to read and write in Turkish. Aside from the teacher and two women who have never had paid work, they all have worked as laborers. Two participants have started their own business (one market and one restaurant owner) after working for a time as laborers.

Their limitations with German language skills presented a challenge in their formal paperwork processes. Therefore, they have received assistance from either their children or Turkish friends. Seven are in poor health and mention not being satisfied with their general health. Still, all of my participants are healthy enough to carry out their activities of daily living and go outdoors without getting any kind of help or support. The majority have experienced economic difficulties after retirement.

My participants have given different examples of their social networks and engagements. For some, playing card games and baking bread with friends are valued and stable social engagements. For others, volunteering in an association or taking classes on a religious/cultural topic is the main social engagements. Consequently, all participants mention about having some sort of social engagement, mostly as *schmoozers* rather than *machers*, as I will evaluate below.

The places that I have visited differed from one another in regards to the community that they build. Mosque-related associations have a faith-based community. Turkish coffee house has its own regulars. The secular/political association has a more ideological sense of belonging. Meanwhile, the *bäckerei* offers no shared identity or sense of community. Excluding the *bäckerei*, one common factor is that these places evoke a strong sense of community and facilitate a place to socialize and organize different activities. Mosque-related and secular/political associations provide opportunities for volunteer activities, reading clubs, recreational activities, group trips, picnic organizations, charity organizations, board games, shared TV rooms for watching a soccer match together and, even a small stage for traditional feasts. Mosque-related and secular/political associations offer a social environment both for *schmoozers* and *machers*. In the volunteer associations, first-generation members have a significant contribution in building both the physical and social environments of these places.

3. Social networks and engagement

Two research questions of this study are which urban and public spaces they use to socialize and who they would prefer to socialize with and also how frequently. My participants meet friends at associations and clubs, take walks with neighbors, work voluntarily, attend educational courses and sport clubs. They also visit Turkey to spend their vacations at their hometowns and other cities and to celebrate religious holidays with their family members who live in Turkey. These activities create the transnational context of their aging experience. Economic status has a crucial role in both their daily and transnational mobility. Some of them said they can't afford to visit Turkey as often as they want.

One of the questions of this research is about how accessible their current homes are and how it affects their social networks and engagements. In old age, homes and neighborhoods with easy access have a key role in social life. A majority of my participants lives in privately rented flats and they have been living in these houses for the most of their lives. Even though most of them stated their current homes to have convenient accessibility with an elevator or being a first-floor apartment, three experience challenges. They commonly stated to currently not struggle accessing public and urban spaces, but for some of them, this will become a challenge in the future. A 74-year-old male participant, who has been interviewed at a mosque-related association, highlights another factor to the picture - the economic burden of moving to a better-equipped house.

Due to their transnational aging experiences, my informants have developed unique practices for dealing with health issues. Some enjoy the social support embedded in both local and transnational social networks. A 75-year-old male participant, who has been interviewed, in a mosque-related association says:

“I have no family here... I had an operation on my knee in Turkey because I trusted the doctors there more. I came back here after the surgery... I can walk now using these [crutches], but I can't put on my socks. I have a German neighbor. He has been coming to my home every morning since the operation to [assist me to] put my socks on.”

He also voluntarily helps other older Turkish migrants with their bureaucratic paperwork. His experience shows clearly the importance of maintaining social roles for elders' well-being during retirement:

“I go to the same *bäckerei* every day to help the older Turkish people with their retirement paper work. I have started doing this because I have experience with this kind of documentation. I have started one of the first Turkish associations in Cologne... People need to help for this kind of documentation. I feel useful because I don't have a family here.”

Family responsibilities are also an important dimension in maintaining former social roles in the old age. According to Warburton and McLaughlin (2005), several ways exist in which older people contribute to their communities and families as informal volunteers. An 81-year-old male participant, who has been interviewed in a Turkish coffee house, supports his daughters' work-life as a continuation of his professional identity and his role as a father:

“I have worked as a cook here. I spend my days here [Turkish coffee house]. I also help my daughters' restaurant. I do not cook but I organize the warehouse... After retirement you need to keep yourself busy to stay healthy.”

Some participants maintain their former social roles and they have also gotten new ones. A 67-year-old female participant, who has been interviewed, supports her daughter at home and she attends an educational class. Her experience also gives a deeper perception of the importance of having different social networks for well-being:

“I live with my daughter and her son. My daughter is divorced and she has started to run a lunch counter at the subway. I clean the house and cook. I also take her lunch every day. I make this house a home for them... I spend my leisure time with my neighbors. We meet every day... I have been going to school to learn reading and writing in Turkish for the last four years now.”

An important part of my participants' social networks and engagements was their participation in these associations and clubs. These places were valuable social support resources for them. They support each other with giving advice on the different challenges of transnational aging experience. Their interactions in these associations is quite informal, and people know each other for a long time. A 76-year-old male participant, who has been interviewed in a mosque-related association, gives a detailed example of how important these associations are in their daily social life:

“We have religious lessons three times a week, I attend them regularly. We live here as a community, that's how we can endure our elderly years in exile [he uses the Turkish word *gurbet*, which means living in a foreign land and feeling homesick].”

My informants chose the associations and clubs that they attend to based on the community they want to interact with. Most take part in a certain community, with just a few who attend more than one. As a consequence of their different preferences, the variety of social networks differs greatly from one another. Most participants only socialize with people who share a relatively similar identity, while others socialize with people from different ethnic, religious, cultural, and political backgrounds. A 70-year-old male participant, who has been interviewed in a mosque-related association states that “I go to different Turkish mosques to meet friends and drink a cup of tea, but to pray I always go to an Arabic mosque where is also near here.”

Some of them spend their leisure time with their friends in associations and return home for lunch or coffee because of economic difficulties. While some go to the associations to socialize as *schmoozers*, others actively participate in organizing the association as *machers*. According to Palmberger's study (2017) on older first-generation, the Turkish migrants living in Vienne and who access to cultural, political, and religious volunteer associations, feel socially well-embedded.

Older migrants, with resources embedded in wider social networks are affected by the extent they integrate with the wider community; and when lacking cultural capital, they rely on their own communities and families for specific support (Ruspini, 2009). The only well-educated participant among my informants is a 72-year-old man, who has been a teacher since years; and I have interviewed him in a secular/political association. He has various social networks, which is not common in my other research participants, and he has different social engagements:

“I have started going to the mosque after my retirement I meet friends at the shopping mall. We drink coffee. I come here [secular/political association] a couple times a week. I don't share the same political tendencies with people here, but I enjoy their company... I am also a member of a Turkish-German health association. We organize seminars to raise awareness about diseases such as diabetes, strokes, and dementia... I am a member of the parents' association. I am not as active as I used to be, but sometimes I attend their meetings.”

As previously mentioned, most informants have social networks and engagements typical of *schmoozers* instead of *makers*. While only four have official memberships in clubs/associations, six volunteer at associations' charity events. They bake Turkish pizza, serve food, clean the place, or organize certain parts of the event. A 67-year-old female participant, who has been interviewed at her home, actively volunteers at different mosque-related associations without having any official membership. She highlights associations not as somewhere with close social ties, but as a place to visit for philanthropic reasons. Her experiences with her neighbors also vividly describe the importance of having social networks outside the family. She highlights that they have grown old together as neighbors and have become like a family, and they do not have close relationships with their relatives in Turkey anymore. According to Buffel (2017), understanding older migrants' aging experience requires attention to how they re-create a sense of home. My interviewees stress strong social ties and neighborly support as another dimension of their social networks and engagements.

4. Discussion

Most of my participants have a strong sense of community based on these associations and clubs, and they have a strong social network and social support mechanism. These all work to their advantage in overcoming the challenges of transnational aging experience. These actions reflect the sense of community, as analyzed by Liu and Besser (2003) in their study on older adults' social capital with a focus on their community involvement. In addition to attending associations, several participants also join a social club or neighborhood social group. According to Patzelt's (2017) study on older migrants, this is a valuable approach for dealing with grief after losing a spouse and to remain isolate at home. All these social interactions also help them re-establishing new social roles after retirement and child-bearing years. Their small groups with neighbors and "coffee friends" are valuable sources of emotional support. The small groups meet regularly and provide the participants with support/care (Wuthnow, 1994; as cited in Putnam, 2000).

Higher education and employment status are generally associated with higher levels of social capital in old age (Cramm & Nieboer, 2015). However, this is only partly true for participants of this study. Their relatively low human capital can be said to be related to the homogeneity of their social networks, but not to the variety of social engagements. Moreover, according to Collom's study (2008) on older adults' volunteerism, they prefer interacting with younger generations, and this socialization serves as a bridge between generations and enhances social integration in old age. This is not the case with participants of this study. Their social network and engagements mostly consisted of their peers. This can result from being a first-generation migrant. They may prefer spending their leisure time with those who share similar life paths. More studies with different migrant generations are needed to develop our understanding on this issue. Additionally, more studies are needed to understand the role of NGOs, which have the potential for more inclusive societies (Şentürk, 2014).

People's attachment to residential environment increases with age due to mobility limitations (Gilleard et al., 2007). Consequently, they tend to spend more time at home. Thus, the physical and social environment has an essential role in old age. Environmental inadequacies can limit older adults' full social participation, especially when combined with increased vulnerability to potentially disabling physical/cognitive conditions (Scharlach & Lehning, 2013). Crisis-proof policies lessening older adults' economic burden of moving to better-equipped homes will gain more importance for policy makers through adequate academic research, which is particularly needed on this issue.

Compared to non-migrant peers, older migrants in Europe are known to tend to have worse self-rated health and unassisted functioning, as well as higher depression rates and chronic conditions (Aichberger et al., 2010; Lanari & Bussini, 2012). Considering the significant correlations of general health, well-being, and strong social capital into consideration, studying older migrants' social networks and engagements becomes especially important. From the perspective promoting health, encouraging volunteerism in old age as a mean of tackling these issues may be a vital step (Hirschfelder & Reilly, 2007; as cited in Theurer & Wister, 2010). Public policy and academic debate should also take dimensions into account that go beyond older people's health and material conditions, such as access to public facilities, services, and social relations (Myck et al., 2015). More research is needed to understand the most effective ways to promote health through social capital among older people who've migrated.

While research on young migrants in Europe is widespread, older migrants are still an understudied population (Hunkler et al., 2015). According to Dwyer and Papadimitriou (2006), European Union (EU) member states' policy agendas don't prioritize improving older international migrants' rights. Also, a lack of quantitative data exists on older migrant populations, with no projections present for most of EU member states (Rallu, 2017), even though they can provide the necessary information to estimate future social and health service needs (Rees et al., 2013). The current reluctance to making crisis-proof policies related to older migrants in EU member states causes a dilemma in the EU's aim of "inclusive, innovative, and reflective societies". In addition to projections, older migrants and their families should be included in national samples of large surveys as a matter of standard practice (Schans & Komter 2010). More academic research is needed to provide this sort of qualitative data.

The second-generation of Turkish migrants are also generally an important population group for aging studies. In Germany's case, Turkish descendants constitute the largest immigrant-origin group (Barwick & Beaman, 2019). Even though debate is found whether older migrants often prefer support from their children to formal support (Ciobanu, Fokkema & Nedelcu, 2017; de Valk & Schans 2008), we cannot assume older migrants will be automatically supported by their adult children (Schans & Komter, 2010). Apart from healthcare, descendants' potential for financially abusing older migrants is a highly important research subject (Park & Kim, 2013). More research on intergenerational relationships is needed. In addition to being aware of different migrant generations, Warnes et al. (2004) highlight the significance of different migration histories for future studies, making a distinction for people who migrated younger and aged in a host country with those who migrated after retirement. These background trajectories should be considered while studying with older migrants. Another important dimension that need further investigation is the comparative studies between different countries of migration.

Furthermore, one limitation of this study is that only cross-sectional data has been collected. As a qualitative research, it does not represent the majority. Another limitation is the gender division of my participants. This study includes more male participants (i.e. 13 men) and less female participants (i.e. 5 women).

In sociological studies, especially in Turkey, the role of family in social relations has become clear. This study contributes to the recent social science literature in Turkey by debating the importance of intergenerational relations after migrating from Turkey to a foreign country. Also, hometown associations resulting from both internal and international migrations in Turkey are an important research topic in the Turkish sociological studies. This paper contributes to the current literature by adding a perspective on migrants in Europe and who have a Turkish backgrounded. Lastly, most aging studies in Turkey primarily focus on health and economic well-being of older adults. This study brings their social interactions to the forefront.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

The author would like to thank the anonymous reviewers, and wishes also to thank those who shared their stories with her and who invited her into their homes.

References

- Adıgüzel, Y. (2011). Diasporadaki kimlik algılamalarına göç tipinin etkisi: Almanya ve İngiltere Türk toplumlarının karşılaştırılması [Comparison of cultural identity perception of Turkey originated in Germany and England]. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 3(20), 97-119. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/ijsosyoloji/issue/515/4703>.
- Aichberger, M. C., Schouler-Ocak, M., Mundt, A., Busch, M. A., Nickels, E., Heimann, H. M., Ströhle, A., Reischies, F. M., Heinz, A., & Rapp, M. A. (2010). Depression in middle-aged and older first generation migrants in Europe: Results from the Survey of Health, Ageing and Retirement in Europe (SHARE). *European Psychiatry* 25, 468-475. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eurpsy.2009.11.009>
- Aldwin, C. M., Park, C. L., & Spiro, A. III (2007). *Handbook of health psychology and aging*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Barwick, C., & Beaman, J. (2019). Living for the neighbourhood: Marginalization and belonging for the second-generation in Berlin and Paris. *Comparative Migration Studies*, 7(1), 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-018-0105-3>
- Bolzmann, C., Raffaele, P., Vial, M., & Fibbi, R. (2004). Older labour migrants' well-being in Europe: The case of Switzerland. *Ageing and Society*, 24(3), 411-429. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X03001557>
- Börsch-Supan, A., Kneip, T., Litwin, H., Myck, M., & Weber, G. (2015). SHARE: A European policy device for inclusive ageing societies. In A. Börsch-Supan, T. Kneip, H. Litwin et al. (Eds.), *Ageing in Europe- Supporting Policies for an Inclusive Society* (pp. 1-22). Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter. <https://doi.org/10.6103/SHARE.w5.700>
- Buffel, T. (2017). Ageing migrants and the creation of home: Mobility and the maintenance of transnational ties. *Population, Space and Place*, 23, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1994>
- Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Castles, S., & Kosack, G. (1973). *Immigrant workers and class structure in Western Europe*. London, New York, Toronto: Oxford University Press.
- Ciobanu, R. O., Fokkema, T., & Nedelcu, M. (2017). Ageing as a migrant: Vulnerabilities, agency, and policy implications. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(2), 164-181. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238903>
- Ciobanu, R. O., & Hunter, A. (2017). Older migrants and (im)mobilities of ageing: An introduction. *Population, Space and Place*, 23, 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.2075>
- Collom, E. (2008). Engagement of the elderly in time banking: The potential for social capital generation in an aging society. *Journal of Aging and Social Policy*, 20(4), 414-436. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08959420802186282>
- Cramm, J. M., & Nieboer, A. P. (2015). Building social capital may protect against loss of well-being among

- older people. In F. Nyqvist & A. K. Forsman (Eds.), *Social capital as a health resource in later life: The relevant of context* (pp. 145-154). Dordrecht, Heidelberg, New York, London: Springer.
- Cramm, J. M., van Dijk, H. M., & Nieboer, A. P. (2012). The importance of neighborhood social cohesion and social capital for the well being of older adults in the community. *The Gerontologist*, 53(1), 142-150. <http://doi.org/10.1093/geront/gns052>
- Cruwys, T., Dingle, G. A., Haslam, C., Alexander Haslam, S., Jetten, J., & Morton, T. A. (2013). Social group memberships protect against future depression, alleviate depression symptoms and prevent depression relapse. *Soc Sci Med*, 98, 179-186. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2013.09.013>
- Cruwys, T., Alexander Haslam, S., Dingle, G. A., Jetten, J., Hornsey, M. J., Desdemona Chong, E. M., & Oei, T. P. S. (2014). Feeling connected again: Interventions that increase social identification reduce depression symptoms in community and clinical settings. *J Affect Disord*, 159, 139-146. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2014.02.019>
- de Donder, L., De Witte, N., Buffel, T., Dury, S., & Verte, D. (2012). Social capital and feelings of unsafety in later life: A study on the influence of social networks, place attachment, and civic participation on perceived safety in Belgium. *Research on Aging*, 34(4), 425-448. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0164027511433879>
- de Valk, H. A. G., & Schans, D. (2008). 'They ought to do this for their parents': Perceptions of filial obligations among immigrant and Dutch older people. *Ageing and Society*, 49-66. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X07006307>
- Dwyer, P., & Papadimitriou, D. (2006). The social security rights of older international migrants in the European union. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32(8), 1301-1319. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600927773>
- EN Horizon 2020 Work Programme 2018-2020 (2019). Europe in a changing World – Inclusive, innovative and reflective societies. Retrieved from https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/h2020/wp/2018-2020/main/h2020-wp1820-societies_en.pdf
- Ertel, K. A., Glymour, M. M., & Berkman, L. F. (2008). Effects of social integration on preserving memory function in a nationally representative US elderly population. *American Journal of Public Health*, 98, 1215-1220. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2007.113654>
- Fratiglioni, L., Paillard-Borg, S., & Winblad, B. (2004). An active and socially integrated lifestyle in late life might protect against dementia. *The Lancet Neurology*, 3, 343-353. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-4422\(04\)00767-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-4422(04)00767-7)
- Fokkema, T., & Naderi, R. (2013). Differences in late-life loneliness: A comparison between Turkish and native-born older adults in Germany. *Eur J Ageing*, 10, 289-300. <http://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-013-0267-7>
- Gardner, K. (2006). *Narrative, age and migration: Life history and the life course amongst Bengali elders in London*. Oxford: Berg.
- George, M. & Fitzgerald, R. (2012). Forty years in Aotearoa New Zealand: White identity, home and later life in an adopted country. *Ageing & Society*, 32, 239-260. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X11000249>
- Gilleard, C., Hyde, M., & Higgs, P. (2007). The impact of age, place, aging in place, and attachment to place on the well-being of the over 50s in England. *Research on Aging*, 29, 590-605. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0164027507305730>
- Gleibs, I. H., Haslam, C., Alexander Haslam, S., & Jones, J. M. (2011). Water clubs in residential care: Is it the water or the club that enhances health and well-being? *Psychology & Health*, 26(10), 1361-1377. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08870446.2010.529140>

- Gray, A. (2009). The social capital of older people. *Ageing & Society*, 29, 5-31. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X08007617>
- Haslam, C., Holme, A., Haslam, S. A., Iyer, A., Jetten, J., & Williams, W. H. (2008). Maintaining group memberships: Social identity continuity predicts well-being after stroke. *Neuropsychological Rehabilitation*, 18, 671-691. <https://doi.org/10.80/09602010701643449>
- Heikkinen, S. J., & Lumme-Sandt, K. (2013). Transnational connections of later-life migrants. *Journal of Aging Studies*, 27, 198-206. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2013.02.002>
- Hirschfelder, A. S., & Reilly, S. L. (2007). Rx: Volunteer: A prescription for healthy aging. In S. G. Post (Ed.), *Altruism and health* (pp. 116-40). New York: Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195182910.003.0010>
- Horn, V., & Scheppe, C. (2017). Transnational aging: Toward a transnational perspective in old age research. *Eur J Aging*, 14, 335-339. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-017-0446-z>
- Hunkler, C., Kneip, T., Sand, G., & Schuth, M. (2015). Growing old abroad: Social and material deprivation among first- and second- generation migrants in Europe. In A. Börsch-Supan, T. Kneip, H. Litwin et al. (Eds.), *Ageing in Europe – Supporting policies for an inclusive society* (pp. 199-208). Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter.
- Kaya, A. (2007). German-Turkish transnational space: A separate space of their own. *German Studies Review*, 30(3), 483-502. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27668369>.
- Knight, C., Haslam, S. A., & Haslam, C. (2010). In home or at home? Evidence that collective decision making enhances older adults' social identification, well-being and use of communal space when moving to a new care facility. *Ageing and Society*, 30, 1393-1418. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X10000656>
- Klok, J., van Tilburg, T. G., Suanet, B., & Fokkema, T. (2017). Transnational aging among older Turkish and Moroccan migrants in the Netherlands: Determinants of transnational behavior and transnational belonging. *Transnational Social Review*, 7(1), 25-40. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21931674.2016.1277656>
- Kümbetoğlu, B. (2012). *Sosyolojide ve antropolojide niteliksel yöntem ve araştırma* [Qualitative method and research in sociology and anthropology]. İstanbul: Bağlam.
- Lanari, D. & Bussini, O. (2012). International migration and health inequalities in later life. *Ageing & Society*, 32, 935-962. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X11000730>
- Lanzieri, G. (2011). *Fewer, older and multicultural? Projections of the EU populations by foreign/national background*. Luxemburg: Eurostat. <https://doi.org/10.2785/17529>
- Liu, A. Q., & Besser, T. (2003). Social capital and participation in community improvement activities by elderly residents in small towns and rural communities. *Rural Sociology*, 68(3), 343-365. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1549-0831.2003.tb00141.x>
- Liversage, A., & Mirdal, G. M. (2017). Growing old in exile – A longitudinal study of migrant women from Turkey. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(2), 287-302. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238910>
- Mayring, P. (2011). *Nitel sosyal araştırmaya giriş* (A. Güçüş & M. S. Durgun, Çev.) [Introduction to qualitative social research]. Ankara: Bilgesu.
- Moya, J. C. (2005). Immigrant and associations: A global and historical perspective. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 31(5), 833-864. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830500178147>
- Munford, L. A., Sidaway, M., Blakemore, A., Sutton, M., & Bower, P. (2017). Associations of participation in community assets with health-related quality of life and healthcare usage: a cross-sectional study of older people in the community. *BMJ Open*, 7, 1-9. <http://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2016-012374>

- Myck, M., Najsztub, M., & Oczkowska, M. (2015). Measuring social deprivation and social exclusion. In A. Börsch-Supan, T. Kneip, H. Litwin et al. (Eds.), *Ageing in Europe – Supporting policies for an inclusive society* (pp. 67-77). Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter.
- Nyqvist, F., & Forsman, A. K. (2015). Healthy ageing: Focus on social capital. In F. Nyqvist & A. K. Forsman (Eds.), *Social capital as a health resource in later life: The relevant of context* (pp. 1-11). Dordrecht: Springer.
- Palaz, F. S., & Adıgüzel, Y. (2016). Active aging experiences of Turkish immigrants in Netherlands. *Turkish Journal of Sociology*, 36, 37-45. <http://doi.org/10.16917/iusosyoloji.291223>
- Palmberger, M. (2017). Social ties and embeddedness in old age: older Turkish labour migrants in Vienne. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(2), 235-249. <http://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238907>
- Park, H. J., & Kim, C. G. (2013). Ageing in an inconvenient paradise: The immigrant experiences of older Korean people in New Zealand. *Australian Journal on Ageing*, 32(3), 158-162. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-6612.2012.00642.x>
- Patzelt, A. (2017). 'A totally new world has been opening up for me' – Experiences of older German migrants who are actively involved in the German-speaking community in Ottawa, Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(2), 218-234. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238906>
- Phillipson, C., Ahmed, N., & Latimer, J. (2003). *Women in transition. A study of the experiences of Bangladeshi women living in tower hamlets*. Bristol: Policy Press.
- Polacsek, M., & Angus, J. (2016). Making themselves at home: Support needs of older Germans in Australia. *Australian Journal on Ageing*, 35(3), E1-E5. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajag.12263>
- Portes, A., Guarnizo, L. E., & Landolt, P. (1999). The study of transnationalism: pitfalls and promise of an emergent research field, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22(2), 217-237. <https://doi.org/10.1080/014198799329468>
- Poulsen, T., Christensen, U., & Lund, R. (2011). Measuring aspects of social capital in a gerontological perspective. *Eur J Ageing*, 8, 221-232. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-011-0205-5>
- Putnam, R. (2000). *Bowling alone*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Rallu, J. L. (2017). Projections of older immigrants in France, 2008-2028. *Populations, Space and Place*, 23, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.2012>
- Rees, P., Zuo, C., Wohland, P., Jagger, C., Norman, P., Boden, P., & Jasinska, M. (2013). The implications of ageing and migration for the future population, health, labour force and households of Northern England. *Applied Spatial Analysis & Policy*, 6, 93-122. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12061-013-9086-7>
- Ruspini, P. (2009). *Elderly Migrants in Europe: An overview of trends, policies and practices*. Suiça: University of Lugano (USI).
- Ryan, L., Sales, R., Tilki, M., & Siara, B. (2008). Social networks, social support and social capital: The experiences of recent Polish migrants in London. *Sociology*, 42(4), 672-690. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038508091622>
- Sani, F., Herrera, M., & Bowe, M. (2009). Perceived collective continuity and in-group identification as defense against death awareness. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 45(1), 242-245. <https://doi.org/10.016/j.jesp.2008.07.019>
- Schans, D., & Komter, A. (2010). Ethnic differences in intergenerational solidarity in the Netherlands. *Journal of Aging Studies*, 24, 194-203. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2008.10.007>
- Scharlach, A. E., & Lehning, A. J. (2013). Ageing-friendly communities and social inclusion in the United States of America. *Ageing & Society*, 33, 110-136. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X12000578>

- Schierup, C., Hansen, P., & Castles, S. (2006). *Migration, citizenship, and the European welfare state: A European dilemma*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2015-010164>
- Steffens, N. K., Cruwys, T., Haslam, C., Jetten, J., & Haslam, S. A. (2016). Social group memberships in retirement are associated with reduced risk of premature death: evidence from a longitudinal cohort study. *BMJ Open*, 6, 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2015-010164>
- Stuck, A., Walthert, J., Nikolaus, T., Büla, C., Hohmann, C., & Beck, J. (1999). Risk factors for functional status decline in community-living elderly people: a systematic literature review. *Social Science and Medicine*, 48, 445-469. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536\(98\)00370-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536(98)00370-0)
- Şentürk, M. (2015). Türkiye’de kamunun ve stk’ların sosyal yardım uygulamaları: Yeni eğilimler ve ihtiyaçlar [Social assistance applications of the public and NGOs in Turkey: Recent trends and needs]. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 3(28), 0-307. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/pub/ijsosyoloji/issue/560/5549>
- Theurer, K., & Wister, A. (2010). Altruistic behaviour and social capital as predictors of well-being among older Canadians. *Ageing & Sociology*, 30, 157-181. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X09008848>
- Uslaner, E. M., & Conley, R. S. (2003). Civic engagement and particularized trust – The ties that bind people to their ethnic communities. *American Politics Research*, 31(4), 331-360. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1532673X03031004001>
- van der Meer, T. (2016). Neither bridging nor bonding a test of socialization effects by ethnically diverse voluntary associations on participants’ inter-ethnic tolerance, inter-ethnic trust and intra-ethnic belonging. *Social Science Research*, 55, 63-74. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2015.09.005>
- Warburton, J., & McLaughlin, D. (2005). ‘Lots of little kindnesses’: Valuing the role of older Australians as informal volunteers in the community. *Ageing & Society*, 25, 715-730. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X05003648>
- Ysseldyk, R., Haslam, S. A., & Haslam, C. (2013). Abide with me: Religious group identification among older adults promotes health and well-being by maintaining multiple group memberships. *Ageing & Mental Health*, 17(7), 869-879. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13607863.2013.799120>
- Yurdakul, G. (2009). *From guest workers into Muslims: The transformation of Turkish immigrant associations in Germany*. UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Warnes, A. M., & Williams, A. (2006). Older migrants in Europe: A new focus for migration studies, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32(8), 1257-1281, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600927617>
- Warnes, A. M., Friedrich, K., Kellaher, L., & Torres, S. (2004). The diversity and welfare of older migrants in Europe. *Ageing and Society*, 24(3), 307-326. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X04002296>
- Wenger, G. C., Burholt, V., & Scott, A. (2001). *The ageing process: The Bangor longitudinal study of ageing 1979–1999*. Centre for Social Policy Research and Development, Institute of Medical and Social Care, University of Wales, Bangor, Gwynedd.



Examining the Role of Immigrant Carers in Care for Older People at Home: The Case of Istanbul

Hamza Kurtkapan

*Neusehir Hacı Bektas Veli University, Neusehir, TURKEY
Health Services Vocational School*

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 June 2020

Abstract

In the modern period, the prevalence of chronic diseases has increased among old people due to the extended lifespans. Accordingly, older people who need for continuous care support has received much more focus. This study examines the experiences of immigrant female carers who are employed in home-based long-term older people care. Specifically, this study evaluates immigrant carers' daily life practices and relationships with older people. In addition, this study explores the scope of the immigrant carer model as an alternative to caring for older people in traditional and institutional care models. In the study, a qualitative case study has been used. Care takers who immigrant Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan have been interviewed between 15 September and 15 October 2018. Snowball sampling method has been used to select interviewees from the abovementioned countries. All of the participants consist of women. The data has been analyzed in categorical content. The results show that a strong emotional bond has developed between immigrant caregivers and elderly people receiving care. At the same time, financial concerns were found to be the main factors contributing to the cares' motivation. In this respect, it could be said that this model bears traces in both aspects of home-based older people care. This model could actually be considered to be an intermediate (buffer) mechanism that holds the characteristics of both traditional and modern care together.

Keywords: sociology, social work, older people care, immigrant carers.

1. Introduction

In the 21st century, population aging is one of the major trends (WHO, 2007). Advances in health and technology areas have led to increases in peoples' lifespans (UNDESA, 2015). With the extension of life, the number of older people in the total population continues to grow (Klie & Durak, 2018: 91). In many countries older people are the most vulnerable and fragile as compared to other age groups. The prolongation of human life, which has been a significant milestone of the modern period, brings with it a number of problems. Among them is the growing burden of older people who chronic diseases. This makes the issue of caring for older people more important.

The number of Turkish older people continues to increase. This is happening most rapidly unlike the developed countries (Kurtkapan, 2019). The rapid increase in the proportion of older people within Turkey's total population has been one of the main issues of social policy. Organizing services within an infrastructure, which is kind to them, is an important agenda.

Within this framework, many events are organized in both political and scientific circles. The 1st Council on Ageing, which was held in Ankara on 20 April 2019 under the auspices of the Presidency of the Republic of Turkey is a good example of these organizations.

The main problem that needs to be addressed for older people is who will be responsible for their care (Kurtkapan, 2018b). For older people, the need for supporting basic needs is also increasing due to the loss of ability to carry out the activities of daily life (Klie & Durak, 2018: 90). Should care of older people continue to be the family's responsibility in the traditional sense, or should long-term-care be shifted from family to institutional settings? There seems to be a lot of focus on this issue for the upcoming period because of the demographic and institutional changes expected in Turkey. In one of the studies on immigrant older people, individuals who are older and volunteer indicate that they work voluntarily to look after older and needy people (Palaz & Adıgüzel, 2016: 444).

In a dictionary published by the Turkish language institution, care is defined as an act of meeting and fulfilling a need. Older people care, on the other hand, includes support for the basic needs of older people such as protection, nutrition, dressing, and health. Long-term older people care includes individuals who have experienced physical and mental loss of power or are ill aged (Reichert, Naegele & Durak, 2018: 116). The social, economic and physical support individuals aged 65 and over needs are provided through older people care services (Canatan, 2018: 190).

A significant proportion of older people in Turkey need care (Şentürk & Ceylan, 2015). The results of the Turkey's Family Structure Survey show that 6.3% of households in the country are in need of older people care (TAYA, 2011: 358). Older people care is the family's priority (Özmete & Hussein, 2017; Bilge et al., 2014; Görgün-Baran, 2005; Kalaycıoğlu, 2003). Several mechanisms related to family provided care have also been developed (Bilgili, 2000: 2). The most common model of home-based long-term older people care is the informal care service model (Oğlak, 2017: 76).

There are different types of home-based older people care models available. These include family provided care, hiring relatives and private individuals who have retained these services with paid. Some of these individuals are educated and professionals, while others are not trained in the care of older people. Domestic and immigrant carers are employed in paid older people care. Paid and unskilled immigrant female carers in home-based older people care are becoming more and more prevalent.

In Turkey, home-based older people care model is preferred both by older people and the public. In this regard, it is argued that older people want to spend the last stages of life in the houses they are used to (Klie & Durak, 2018: 90; Kurtkapan, 2018a; Kalinkara, 2012, Şentürk & Altan, 2015). Here, all aspects of older people care need to be taken into consideration. Because of there are both social and health dimensions of home-based older people care (Güven & Seval, 2016: 295). The care requirements of older people need to be resolved in cooperation with other institutions of the community, especially the family. Older people care in Turkey is mostly provided at home and mostly by the immigrant women (Canatan, 2018: 200).

There is need for social policy to solve the problem of elderly care in Turkey. Working conditions for the carers of aged people need to be improved. More work should be done on home-based older people care (Özkul & Kalaycı, 2018: 18). In this sense, policies on home-based older people care in unrecorded older people care model need to be urgently developed (Oğlak, 2013: 83). If necessary measures are not taken, the social security and health system will be inadequate for the aging population (Eryurt, 2014: 90). In this context, more academic work on home-based older people care is needed.

What will be the future of the informal immigrant carer institution? The current situation of countries with a high population rate and the level of development may provide insight into our future scenario. In Italy, the proportion of immigrant carer in the care sector is quite high (Klie & Durak, 2018: 92). Considering the rate of aging is 20% and the level of development higher than us, this country may shed light on our 30 years from now. In addition, the fact that it is a Mediterranean country shows the example of a model that we will encounter more frequently in the future because there are some cultural similarities between the two countries. Although unemployment is high in Italy, more immigrants are employed in this regard. In the European Union, 7% of all workers in 27-member countries are non-citizen workers (European Commission, 2013: 24). Immigrant carer is common in Italy, Greece, and Spain, which are referred as Mediterranean countries (Lamura et al., 2018: 134). Older people care work, in areas near the Germany border, is provided by illegal immigrant workers, for whom no social security contribution is paid. It is estimated that only about 150,000 workers come from Poland (Reichert & Naegele, 2018: 119). Considering all these aspects, it is seen that immigrant employment for the care of Turkish aged people, will continue to increase. Therefore, the shortcomings and deficiencies of this issue should be identified and short and medium-terms solutions should be developed.

The income inequality between the target and source country motivates the carers to send the fixed portion of their income to their country (Lamura et al., 2018: 136). It is underlined that an immigrant carer correlates more emotionally and socially with aged people individual's family (Lamura et al., 2018: 137). Women, who come to work as care takers, are known to work in older people care sector (Canatan, 2018: 200).

Various studies have been carried out on older people care around the world, and these have identified several problems for carers in older people care. Among these, it was first found that carers in care service were not economically adequately rewarded. Secondly, because women in the family has a primary responsibility in care; women have not able to take part in the wage labor market. Finally, it is said that no common language has been developed between older people care at home and at the institution. (Wellin & Jaffe, 2004: 293).

In Turkey, families are expected to take care of older people (Şentürk & Altan, 2015). Older people care in Turkey, from the past to the present, has traditionally been arranged through family members. To let this happen, several factors function as facilitators. Particularly, the shortage of older people population, the short life span of women, and the fact that they could assume responsibility for care are some of these factors. Yet today, women's participation in the social life outside their home undermines the traditional caring role of women (Canatan, 2018: 191). Providing elderly care to close family members increases the burden of care. But the level of religious coping reduces that burden (Balci, Atilgan & Bulut, 2016).

Due to changes in the family, social and economic factors, families may need support in older people care. In addition, this need comes to the fore with the increase in older people population (Canatan, 2018: 192). In some families, older people care is provided to third parties for a fee. A significant proportion of these carers are immigrant women from Turkic Republics, who do not have work permits. This study has address the issue of immigrant female carers providing home-based older people care.

In this context, the daily life practices of immigrant carers, the relations they have developed with older people and their family, the reasons for choosing this job are examined. The importance of older people care will increase in Turkey. In this study, it is aimed to make a modest contribution to the institutionalization of the immigrant carer model, which is a part of the solution for older people care.

2. Methods

2.1 *Research model*

Home-based care service is an older people care practice that has gained prominence in recent years and is becoming increasingly prevalent. Carers play a key role in this model. The aim of this study is to evaluate the immigrant carer model in line with the experiences of immigrant carers who provide home-based care. For the target group and objectives of the research, it was deemed appropriate to conduct research with the case study pattern, which is one of the qualitative research methods. In the case study, the researcher examines a limited case at a specific time with multiple data aggregation tools (Creswell, 2009; Neuman, 2014: 42). The research aims to explore in-depth the status of immigrant carer in home-based long-term care. The result of the study includes both the description and themes that the researcher has revealed (Creswell, 2009). In this research, the findings are described and evaluated on the basis of certain themes.

2.2 *Working group*

The research data was collected from a group of women carers of Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan, who provide home-based care to older people in need of permanent home care in İstanbul. A total of 14 participants were interviewed. Participants are thought to have sufficient experience with the subject and to answer questions sincerely. Interviews were conducted in homes – where older people care was provided. The participants were reached by snowball sampling method. All of the female participants were of age ranging between 27 and 47 years with a minimum experience of 6 months and a maximum of 7 years. Among the interviewed women, all of them were married and mothers, except one participant.

2.3 *Data collection*

In the study, the interview technique was applied as it provided flexibility to the researcher. The data was collected with a semi-structured interview form. In the preparation of this form, the literature on elderly care and the sociology of old age was used and the opinions of the experts on the subject were given. The data were collected from 15 September to 15 October 2018. Interviews were conducted by the female care takers at homes of the old people in İstanbul. The interviews were kept short so as not to disturb the older people. All but one of the interviews were audio recorded.

2.4 *Data analysis*

In the study, categorical content analysis was used for analyzing the data obtained from the interviews. Before the analysis, interview notes, audio recording transcriptions were combined. Interview analyses were first divided into codes and then categorized and finally analyzed on a theme axis (Creswell, 2009).

2.5 *Ethical issues in the research*

In order to comply with the ethical requirements, participants were informed about the purpose, scope and identity of the researcher. Participants were asked to identify a pseudonym before the interview. These pseudonyms were used in all types of recordings, audio files, and observation notes. Attention was paid to the confidentiality and the privacy of personal data. Audio recordings and transcriptions were stored on the researcher's laptop and encrypted.

3. Findings

There are many models in which people are cared for at home. Among these models, the most common one is family provided care, which is an informal older people care provided by the family members. However, due to the growing burden of care and the impact of urbanization in the family structure, different models of home-based long-term care also appear. In this sense, the paid carer model is becoming increasingly preferred. Some traditional families have progressively been used to hire paid carers. Immigrant women are preferred in this regard for various reasons.

One participant acknowledges the leading role of the family in elderly care, but says that the bride and the girls were inclined to engage the migrant carer model as they could not fully fulfil their elder care responsibilities because of the new conditions and responsibilities that emerged with urbanization:

“Our expectation is that we see him as the person who will help us. In fact, we need to take care of the elderly as a bride, but we see them as helpful personnel who could stand next to the elderly 24/7 to help us in cases where we can't keep up.” (Miss Hanife, 45 years old)

In this model, family members pay to obtain the support services for the care of their elders. Carers are constantly checked by other members of the family. “If something bothers us, we warn him or her. If he does well, we appreciate the work he does. He is constantly observed” (Miss Hanife, 45 years old). Family members live in the same apartment or site, although they are not in the same house. There may be various reasons for the transition from the traditional aged care model to a new model. These include the challenges of urban life and the housing situation, the transformation in the responsibilities of the family, and the economic conditions and lifestyles. This changing situation makes the change inevitable in older people care. In this sense, the paid carer model is being developed. In this context, there are migrant care takers, who are immigrants and work in the country. The family that feels the social pressure at first can accept this situation, especially when there are similar cases in their daughter-in-law's families. Participants, especially those with older relatives, may have difficulty in accepting this fact in the first place.

“In fact, when I first heard it, I was a little nervous. It was as if I had not to hand over to other hands when there were so many children and grandchildren. It touched me and made me think. “I was worried that he might not be comfortable. After all, he's a stranger and a person he never knew, can we trust him? On the one hand the unease caused by it, on the other hand the conscientious responsibility because of his sons and grandchildren not being able to take care of him.” (Miss Sema, 35 years old)

The participant, who is aware of the fact that the responsibility of the family has changed in older people care states that there should be a long-term and boarding carer in older people care as a result of this imperative. She also states that it is inevitable to take home-boarding carers for the elderly, who those with a vulnerability and dependence on self-care and health care. “Today, family member can't agree on elderly care, and they don't look after older people. They can't stay permanently for care at older peoples' home. It would be better if someone from the outside stayed with him”, said Miss Sema (35 years old).

As far as the participants' motivations for coming to Turkey as care takers is concerned, two aspects are important to mention here: (i) firstly, the daily routines of the carers providing home-based care, and (ii) secondly, the symbolic interaction between the carers and the older people.

Participants, who take care of the older people reveal that they have economic motivation to come to Turkey. It can be stated that they view the job of older people's care as an opportunity to make savings. For example, Mrs Gill (32 years old) states that “*the purpose of us is always the same. It's about making money, for buying houses and cars after returning to the our*

country.” Unemployment and a lack of job opportunities in their home countries are forcing them to work. Another interviewee said that:

“We have a pretty small chance of getting a job in our country so we are coming here and doing this job. We don’t have much choice (either working in the workplace or carer in care services).” (Miss Nagihan, 27 years old). “I needed work and money, there were no convenient jobs in our country.” (Mrs. Mayıs, 47 years old)

This study reveals financial circumstances and unemployment in the interviewees’ countries as the key reasons of their migration to Turkey and to adopt the care taking profession. In the study, some problematic areas of immigrant carer model in home-based long-term older people care have been identified. These problems directly stem from immigrant carers’ less education, skills and experience to provide care to the aged people in Turkey. All these factors negatively affect the quality of older people’s care service.

In terms of the older people’s care routines, participants assert that they plan a regular life for old people. This is carried out through the doctor’s advice and routine drug purchases and exercises. Breakfast and morning conservations are scheduled as a routine practice in order to begin the day. Daily health care takes an important place in the old people’s daily plan. Sometimes welcoming guests are considered as part of this job:

“When we get up in the morning, we talk about how s/he slept, after then we have breakfast and tidy the house, and after that I have the older people do sports. Sometimes I take him/her out and walk. I do the daily and health care, like cream putting on ointment, taking meds, etc.” (Mrs. Gül, 32 years old)

“I walk with him/her through in the morning, clean up, cook together if s/he is awake. We move during the day so that s/he could sleep comfortably in the evening without disrupting his/her sleep. Although some of these movements are recommended by the doctor, sometimes I do so that they sleep comfortably at night.” (Mrs. Firuze, 41 years old)

Old people may be sometimes physically active at night in case of need. For instance, an interviewee reveals that “*they could wake up 2-3 times a night, just like a baby. I accompany him/her when s/he gets up*” (Miss Nagihan, 27 years old). This shows that older people care is done 24/7 and very abrasive. Probably that’s the reason that local caregivers avoid providing home-based care. The changes in the social structure of Turkey show that the place and importance of migrant carers in the future of older people care will continue.

In order to contribute to formalization and development of home-based immigrant older people care service, studies should consider perspectives of the immigrant caregivers, shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Some of the qualities that immigrant carers should have

The qualities that immigrant carers should have	Interview Note:
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There should be no language problem 2. Must be reliable (no theft) 3. Should be able to do household chores 4. Should be able to do the cleaning 5. Must have health information 6. Must be respectful 	<p>“There have to be people who don't have language problems, don't steal, could do household chores, cook, and have health knowledge.” (Mrs. Gül, 32 years old)</p>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Should not be too young (30 years and over) 8. Must be smooth and friendly 9. Must be patient 	<p>“She should not be too young, be (older than) 30 years old, nice-talking, concerned, patient, friendly. Even if the mother is angry with him/her, but s/he should never be angry with him/her.” (Mrs. Firuze, 41 years old)</p>

- | | |
|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 10. Should love older people care work | “This is a labor of love. It is necessary to love this work and each other. I would recommend to those who love this job.” (Miss Nagihan, 27 years old) |
| 11. Should love older people | |
| 12. Should do the job wholeheartedly | |

Source: It was compiled by the researcher from the interview notes.

“Be human first and do it sincerely. For me, this is not a profession, no, I can’t stand this for another moment if not the mother I would not stop for a minute. God condemns us. If I leave 90-year-old woman, my conscience does not allow me, and God will punish me.” (Mrs. Mayis, 47 years old)

Findings in this study indicate that immigrant carers do this work for their regular income and to have some moral and ethical values in their personality such as love, respect, and conscience. All the participants in this study mention that they have developed an emotional connection with the older people in a short time. In fact, they highlight that older people care service is difficult and they could overcome this difficulty by adding psychological and emotional elements into their work. All the immigrant carers, who took part in the study, state that they call the older people as “mother” to show respect. “They may like to be called like this”, says Miss Negihan (27 years old). In one of the houses observed, one of the older people’s close relatives said that the immigrant carer called the older people a more sincerely than his/her own son.

The participants state that they have done this work temporarily. Many of the participants do this by traditional methods in the way they learn from their own families. They state that they have no experience. For example, one interviewee says:

“I have been working for 7 months, and I had no previous experience.” I have to finish paying off my house, I will quit this job when I get paid to go to university and I become set in my way.” (Mrs. Gül, 32 years old)

Similarly, another interviewee suggests that “I have little work experience in older people care, and I do not know exactly what to do in this care” (Mrs. Firuze, 41 years old).

Considering that migrant carers are already being used effectively in older people care in countries like Germany and Italy, it can be said that migrant carers will be an important part of Turkey’s vision for the future of older people care. The long-term home-based immigrant carer model is a model open to development. The results and recommendations, developed in light of the aforementioned findings, are thought to contribute to the field of sociology of aging.

4. Discussion and recommendations

The family has an important role in the in-house care of older people. However, due to urban conditions, families are no longer able to afford care takers for the aged people. For this reason, people from outside the family are used to look after the aged people. It is seen as difficult to maintain older people care at home with an established sense of care (Klie & Durak, 2018: 90). For this purpose, various care model applications are being introduced, one of which is the home-based immigrant older people carer model.

When looking at the professional qualities of immigrant carers, it is seen that their professional qualities are just like family members. In fact, it can be said that this kind of care functions like the buffer mechanism that Kiray proposes for urban development. The concept of the “buffer mechanism” refers to an intermediate mechanism that connects the various elements of the social structure and includes the elements of both the old and new structure in terms of both structure and function Since (Kaçmazoğlu, 2017: 406). Family members are unable to fulfil their older people care responsibilities in a changing social structure, home-based immigrant older people carer model serves to support the family’s older people care responsibility. In this model, neither complete professionalism nor complete volunteering is essential. It functions as an

intermediate mechanism in the transition from the traditional to the modern older people care model.

Through this limited study, older people care model can be looked at from the perspective of Turkey. As such, we could not been able to fully urbanize and modernized older people care in Turkey (Kurtkapan, 2018b). However, it is obvious that we cannot maintain traditional elderly care. In older people care the family is forced because of urban conditions and traditional values. There is neither a fully modern/urban nor a fully traditional model in the older people's care.

With increased older people's care programs in Turkey, more professionals will be involved in older people care in the future. Until then, however, unqualified immigrant carers will continue to work as intermediaries. With this in mind, immigrant carers need to be included in the formal care system. In this context, the necessary training and courses should be given to these carers and it should first take place the adoption of immigration legislation.

This study has aimed to shed light on the fact that immigrant carer older people care is becoming increasingly common in Turkey. Further work needs to be done on migrant carers and to improve the quality of older people care in the country.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

References

- Balcı, S., Atılgan, N., & Bulut, B. (2016). Examining the relationship among religious coping, burdens, and life satisfaction of those who care for the homebound elderly. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 36(2), 465-475. <https://doi.org/10.16917/iusosyoloji.284549>
- Bilge, U., Elçioğlu, Ö., Ünalacak, M., & Ünlüoğlu, İ. (2014). Türkiye'de yaşlı evde bakım hizmetleri [Elderly home-care in Turkey]. *Euras J Fam Med*, 3(1), 1-8.
- Canatan, A. (2018). Türkiye'de profesyonel yaşlı bakımı [Professional elderly care in Turkey]. In İ. Tufan & M. Durak (Eds.), *Gerontoloji II* (pp. 187-201). Ankara: Nobel.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed method approaches*, 3rd Ed., London, SAGE Publications.
- Eryurt, M. A. (2014). Türkiye'de yaşlı nüfus ve yaşlılık dönemiyle ilgili yaşam tercihleri [Lifestyle choices associated with the older people population in Turkey]. In M. Turgut & S. Feyzioğlu (Eds.), *Türkiye aile yapısı araştırması tespitler ve öneriler* (pp. 90-112). Ankara: Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı, Aile ve Toplum Hizmetleri Genel Müdürlüğü Yayınları.
- Güven, S. (2016). Evde bakım hizmeti verme [Providing home care services]. In V. Kalıncara (ed.), *Yaşlılık disiplinlerarası yaklaşım, sorunlar ve çözümler II* (pp. 293-325). Ankara: Nobel.
- Görgün-Baran, A. (2005). *Yaşlı ve aile ilişkileri: Ankara örneği* [Older people and family relations: The case of Ankara]. Ankara: TC. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Yayınları, No: 127.

- Kaçmazoğlu, H. B. (2017). Mübaccel Belik Kıray'ın sosyolojik görüşleri üzerine [On the sociological opinions of Mübaccel Belik Kıray]. *Sosyoloji Konferansları*, (55), 385-412.
- Kalaycıoğlu, S., Tol, U.U., Küçükural, Ö., & Cengiz, K. (2003). *Yaşlılar ve yaşlı yakınları açısından yaşam biçimi tercihleri* [Lifestyle preferences for the elderly and their relatives]. Ankara: Türkiye Bilimler Akademisi Raporları.
- Kalınkara, V. (2012). *Temel gerontoloji, yaşlılık bilimi* [The gerontology, science of old age]. Ankara: Nobel Yayın.
- Klie, T., & Durak, M. (2018). Yaşlı bakım kurumları [Older people care institutions]. In İ. Tufan & M. Durak (Eds.), *Gerontoloji II* (pp. 89-104). Ankara: Nobel.
- Kurtkapan, H. (2018a). Community centers of local governments for retirees: The case of Istanbul. *Journal of Aging and Long-Term Care*, 1(3), 131-136.
- Kurtkapan, H. (2018b). *Kentte yaşlılık ve yerel yönetim uygulamaları* [Aging in the city and local government practices]. Ankara: Nobel Yayıncılık
- Kurtkapan, H. (2019). Kentte yaşayan yaşlıların iyi oluş halleri [The status of wellbeing of the retirees living in the city: The case of Istanbul]. *Turkish Studies Social Sciences*, 14(1), 119-131.
- Neuman, W. L. (2014). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. London: Pearson.
- Oğlak, S. (2017). Yaşlı bakımında görünmeyen işgücü: aile bakımı ve ekonomik değeri [The value of informal caregiving on elderly care: As a shadow workforce]. *Istanbul Gelişim University Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 73-87.
- Özkul, M., & Kalaycı, I. (2018). Enformel bir iş ve istihdam alanı olarak yaşlı bakıcılığı: yaşlı yakınları ile bakıcı ilişkilerinde yaşanan sorunlar [Elderly care as an informal job and employment area: The problems between the relatives of the elder and caregiver]. *Süleyman Demirel University Visionary Journal*, 9(20), 1-27. <https://doi.org/10.21076/vizyoner.372115>
- Özmete, E., & Hussein (2017). *Türkiye'de yaşlı bakım hizmetleri raporu: Avrupa'dan en iyi uygulama örnekleri ve Türkiye için bir model tasarımı* [Report on aged care services in Turkey: Design a model for best practice from Europe and Turkey]. Ankara: T.C. Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı, T.C. Çalışma ve Sosyal Güvenlik Bakanlığı.
- Palaz, F. S., & Adıgüzel, Y. (2016). Hollanda'daki göçmen Türklerin aktif yaşlanma tecrübeleri [Active aging experiences of immigrant Turks in the Netherlands]. *Istanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 36(2), 431-463. <https://doi.org/10.16917/iusosyoloji.291223>
- Reichert, M., Naegele, G., & Durak, M. (2018). Uzun süreli bakım ihtiyaçları ve politikalar: Almanya örneği [Long-term care needs and policies: The case of Germany]. In İ. Tufan & M. Durak (Eds.), *Gerontoloji II* (pp. 105-129). Ankara: Nobel.
- Stone, R. I., & Bryant, N. (2019). The politics of immigration: Who will care for grandma? *Generations*, 42(4), 50-56.
- Şentürk, M., & Altan, R. B. (2015). Giriş, İstanbul'da yaşlıların mevcut durumu araştırması [Introduction, current situation survey of older people in Istanbul]. In M. Şentürk & H. Ceylan (Eds.), *İstanbul'da yaşlanmak, İstanbul'da yaşlıların mevcut durumu araştırması* (pp. 13-35). İstanbul: Acilim Kitap.
- Şentürk, M., & Ceylan, H. (Eds.) (2015). *İstanbul'da yaşlanmak, İstanbul'da yaşlıların mevcut durumu araştırması* [Aging in Istanbul, the current situation of the older people in Istanbul]. İstanbul: Acilim Kitap.
- TAYA (Türkiye Aile Yapısı Araştırması) (2011). Türkiye'de aile yapısı araştırması 2011 [Turkey family structure research 2011]. Ankara: Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı & Afşar oğlu Matbaası.
- United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) (2015). *World population ageing 2015* (ST/ESA/SER.A/390). New York: United Nations.

Wellin, C., & Jaffe, D. J. (2004). In search of “personal care”: Challenges to identity support in residential care for elders with cognitive illness. *Journal of aging studies*, 18(3), 275-295.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2004.03.005>

World Health Organization [WHO] (2007). *Global age-friendly cities: A guide*. World Health Organization.



Social Exclusion in the Process of Employment: The Experiences of Roma Youth

Ali Egi

*Çankırı Karatekin University, Çankırı, TURKEY
Department of Sociology*

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 July 2020

Abstract

This study aims to understand how young individuals in the Roma/Gypsy community experience the social exclusion in the employment process. This has been structured according to the qualitative research design based on experience, meaning, and processes. In-depth interviews and a focus group were conducted with 11 Roma youths aged 19-30 living in Balıkesir, Turkey. A semi-structured interview form was used for the interviews. The findings were analyzed by using a phenomenological approach. The findings are clustered on the basis of identity, space and employment: (1) The Roma youth are exposed to social exclusion due to their ethnic identity during the employment process and are therefore forced to work in temporary jobs. (2) The young Roma experience social exclusion, especially in job applications. (3) The Roma identity and the stigmatized neighborhoods associated with this identity lead to problems for Roma youth in job applications or working life. (4) The attitudes of Roma youth oriented social exclusion in employment vary according to the level of education. Finally, (5) It has been discovered that the relationship established by Roma youth with their neighborhoods has a three-dimensional character: “normalization, self-criticism and divergence”.

Keywords: Roma/Gypsy, Roma youth, employment, Roma youth and employment, social exclusion, spatial stigmatization, Turkey.

1. Introduction

Roma or Gypsies¹ have been constantly exposed to discrimination and social exclusion in the regions they live in. Although naming² has varied in different geographies (Kolukırık, 2004: 8-13), attitudes of the rest of society towards Roma have remained considerably unaltered. As a reflection of these attitudes in modern society, Roma communities have squeezed into stigmatized areas of cities and thus became marginalized. The Roma community, on which poverty is wandering like a specter, is trying to cope with the difficulties of material living conditions. They also struggle with the social superstitions that developed because of their ethnic identity. There is a discriminatory and internalized discourse on the Roma community in social life. The discourse

¹ Young Roma participants who considered that the term “Gypsy” had a pejorative meaning, preferred the use of “Roma”, which means “human” or “man” in the Romani language (Kenrick, 2007: 215) during the research.

² Rom, Dom, Lom, Poşa, Abdal, Elekçi, Koçer, Kıpti, Cono, Cingen, Mıtrıp, etc.

legitimizes the processes of exclusion and stigmatization. It is also the source of structural social problems. Roma living in cities struggle with the concrete situations of these problems. The main problems and policies are clustered in education, housing, health, and employment categories (Aile, Çalışma ve Sosyal Hizmetler Bakanlığı, 2016).

This study, which is designed as a qualitative research, remarks specifically on the exclusion experiences of young Roma³ in the employment process. It basically seeks to understand the following research question in terms of the phenomenological approach: How do Roma youth experience social exclusion in the employment process? The purpose of the study is to explore the social patterns of the point of view along with the strategies of Roma youth who are exposed to exclusion in employment. Employment is a critical phase in the social life of Roma individuals because it provides a public sphere where Roma can struggle with exclusion and stigmatization.

Roma/Gypsy studies in Turkey seem to be clustered into three categories; *ethnicity* [identification, culture, history] (Aksu, 2010; Aras, 2016; Şanlıer, 2013), *discrimination* [social exclusion, stigmatization, inequality, legal struggle on fundamental rights] (Taylan & Barış, 2015; Gezin, 2016; Karan, 2017; Marsh, 2008) and *social policy* [poverty, disadvantageous, access to services, education, health, housing, employment] (Akkan, Deniz, & Ertan, 2011; Gün, 2016). There have also been comprehensive reports regarding all of these categories prepared by public institutions and non-governmental organizations (Batı Karadeniz Kalkınma Ajansı, 2016; Genç & Taylan, 2017; İlik, 2016; Taylan, Barış & Genç, 2015). Among this literature, it has encountered no studies that especially investigate or try to figure out the employment process of Roma youth. The paper tries to explore what the young Roma in Balıkesir experience during their participation in employment, and what their ethnic identity means in employment. Thus, the study is methodologically limited, but it is significant in terms of describing what ethnic identity means in employment for a young Roma with an underprivileged chance of life.

2. Research method

2.1 Research model

This study uses a qualitative phenomenological approach to understand the social exclusion experiences of Roma youth in the employment process. Phenomenological research, which is formed around a main phenomenon, focuses on what people experience and how they interpret this experience (Patton, 2002: 106). Therefore, the phenomenological approach is based on the perspective of individuals. The main phenomenon in this study is the “social exclusion” fact that emerged during the employment process. It is trying to be understood with the phenomenological model, how the main phenomenon is interpreted in the social world of Roma youth within the framework of identity and space.

2.2 Participant group

Within the scope of the study, it was planned to reach young people between the ages of 19-30 who live in a place called the “Roma/Gypsy” neighborhood. Participants were selected from Roma youth working in either a temporary or regular job. Interviews were conducted with the participants through the mediation of opinion leaders living in the neighborhood. In order to ensure that individuals’ multiple perspectives are reflected (Creswell, 2012: 207), participants were determined according to the maximum diversity type of purposeful sampling. In-depth interviews were conducted with 11 young people (7 males, 4 females) living in Gümüşçeşme,

³ Throughout this paper, both the terms “Roma youth” and “the young Roma” will be refer to individuals between the ages of 11-30 in the Roma community living in Balıkesir.

Gündoğan and Dinkçiler neighborhoods of Balıkesir. The age, education and occupational information of the participants are shown in the table below:

Chart 1. Young participants (P) profile

Gender	ID	Age	Education	Occupation	Gender	ID	Age	Education	Occupation
Male	P1	29	ESG	Musician (oldest)	Male	P7	28	ESG	Hairdresser
Male	P2	22	No education	Junk-dealer	Female	P8	21	PSG	Cashier (youngest)
Male	P3	23	HSG	Security guard	Female	P9	25	PSG	Cleaner
Male	P4	24	HSG	Bazaar worker	Female	P10	24	PSG	Broom making
Male	P5	24	HSG	Municipal employee	Female	P11	22	Undergraduate	Student
Male	P6	26	ESG	Chef					
PSG: <i>Primary school graduate</i> ESG: <i>Elementary school graduate</i> HSG: <i>High-school graduate</i>									

In the findings section, P(1-11) ID codes were used instead of the names to show the opinions of the participants. In addition, 5 opinion leaders from the Roma community in Balıkesir also supported the interviews concerning the employment situation of Roma youth.

2.3 Data collection tool

In this study, in-depth interview technique, one of the basic tools of qualitative research, based on the interaction and trust relationship between the interviewer and the interviewee, was used to understand how Roma youth experienced the employment process. Apart from face-to-face in-depth interviews, an unplanned focus group interview was held with four of the young participants. The focus group interview offered young participants the opportunity to respond more comfortably, especially in expressing their experiences of exclusion. Apart from the in-depth interview and focus group, the observation notes of the SIROMA⁴ Project were also used to strengthen the validity of the findings.

2.4 Data collection process

A semi-structured interview form was applied to the participants in the data collection process. In the form, questions about employment were asked in three stages. The first stage is related to the job search and job application process. The second stage is focused on experiences in the process of working in any job. At the last stage, the process of quitting the job has been evaluated. In addition, all questions regarding employment were asked by correlating them with the neighborhood and Roma identity.

⁴ SIROMA: “Technical Assistance for Promoting Social Inclusion in Places Densely Populated by the Roma”, funded by the European Union in 2017 and the Republic of Turkey in 2017. It started in 12 provinces, 20 counties by the Ministry of Family and Social Policies of that time on 8 November 2015, and finished on 8 November 2017, is a comprehensive project. Reference Number: EuropeAid/134662/IH/SER/TR. The author of this article was the provincial coordinator of Balıkesir in the period January-November 2017 and participated in field research in different Roma districts at the provincial level.

The data collection process was carried out from 4-11 July 2019. Before the interviews, the opinion leaders living in the neighborhoods were contacted and the trust relationship was established with the young participants. Places where young participants could feel comfortable were preferred during the interviews. Interviews took place in different locations in the neighborhood and city center. Each interview lasted 30-60 minutes on average. During the interview, a voice recorder was used with the permission of the participants. The interviews were conducted in line with ethical principles and with an approach away from expressions that would offend the participants.

2.5 Data analysis

The data collected from the participants was deciphered and analyzed through the qualitative data analysis software Maxqda. The software enables coding between the data of the interview and understanding the relations between these codes. During the coding process of the data, two main themes emerged: “sense of exclusion” and “neighborhood effect”. The first one shows what the Roma identity means for the participants in the employment process, and the second shows how the neighborhood as a stigmatized space negatively affects the employment process of the participants.

2.6 Limitations of research

The first limitation of the research is spatial. The interviews were carried out in three neighborhoods where Roma live densely in the center of Balikesir. The second limitation is related to the scope of the subject. This study only focuses on the experience of exclusion phenomenon in the employment process. The third limitation is about the participants. The process of persuading the participants was challenging. Some young Roma refused to the interview because they thought it was unimportant. The fourth limitation concerns the number of participants. The number was limited because it was a qualitative research study and many similar reports were included in the literature. Besides, the interview and observation data obtained from field interviews during the SIROMA Project process were also used to support the opinions of participants. The final limitation of the research concerns an ethical issue. During the interviews, insulting statements based on stereotypes were avoided. The position of the researcher in Roma studies is a critical threshold⁵ that can directly affect the relationship with the participants.

3. Findings

The main problems faced by Roma community in Turkey are collected in education, housing, health, employment and social services categories. Among the problems, participation in employment is of key importance. This study, through the findings reached by using qualitative research design, has tried to understand in what jobs Roma youth are working and what problems they experience in the job application process and working life.

3.1 Employment opportunities for Roma

There is no concrete data on the employment status of Roma. Because the employment data in Turkey cannot be collected based on ethnicity (European Roma Rights Centre, 2014: 21;

⁵ Weckman (2013: 3-12) gives advice to researchers working with Roma/Gypsies. She provides highly guiding methodological principles to tolerate problems that may arise from the researcher’s position in the research process.

İlik, 2016: 40). However, with the initiatives of the Ministries of the Republic of Turkey, the European Union and domestic and international NGOs, Roma's issues have begun to be discussed at least in the political level over the last ten years. Although the region, participant profile, time period and methods differ in the studies, the results are similar. Many studies categorize Roma as poor or subclass in terms of income level. Even if the figures are not officially known, Roma remain weak in formal employment in cities.

Many reports and academic studies indicate that Roma are often forced to work in informal and low-paid jobs, with irregular incomes, unqualified (unskilled) positions; and in part-time, low prestigious, precarious, temporary, unhealthy, risky, backbreaking, marginal, informal jobs⁶. Some of the Roma citizens carry on *traditional work* from the family such as musicianship, floristry, basketry, broom-making, blacksmithing, tin-making, potting, sieve making. Traditional jobs, also called "Roma jobs", vary regionally. Among Roma, while a certain number of people earn their living through *periodical/seasonal agricultural* and factory works, a large majority work in *informal daily jobs*. "Marketing, waste collecting, scraping, peddling, cleaning, chauffeuring, carting, portage, shoe-shining, leather-making" are the most preferred of these daily works. There are also marginal jobs that are not common, such as "fortune-telling and begging". According to the findings obtained from the interviewees, the work done by the Roma youth in Balıkesir, partly matches the general classification above. These jobs can be classified as formal jobs, traditional family jobs and temporary/precarious jobs. The diversity of jobs in the employment process varies according to the profile of the neighborhood, family relations, educational level, the impact of the social surrounding and individual approaches.

3.2 Roma youth in formal jobs

Among the interviewees, there are young Roma who achieved to participate in formal jobs such as cashier, worker (supported by İŞKUR⁷), chef, security guard and hairdresser. There are factors such as "family encouragement, role model leadership and a high level of education" at the background of this participation in regular jobs. One of the interviewees (P6) who is a chef stated that he had, by chance, been involved in a public training course and, after his individual efforts, had been cooking in a hotel for 9 years. The factor that influences the employment of Roma youth is the periodic vocational training courses in the neighborhood⁸. Some opinion leaders underlined that although İŞKUR offered some opportunities to young Roma in neighborhoods, they did not want to work. The young Roma do not accept because the "Community Benefit Programs"⁹ supported by İŞKUR are limited to periods of 6-9 months. Some young Roma stated that "On-the-Job Training Programs"¹⁰ are more beneficial for them, but this time the employers did not accept them because of their Roma identity.

⁶ See (Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı, 2017: 126; Akkan et al., 2011: 25; Gün, 2016: 43; İlik, 2016: 40; Marsh, 2008: 55; Romanlar Federasyonu, 2017: 25; Taylan & Barış, 2015: 25).

⁷ Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR) depends on the Ministry of Family, Labour and the Social Services and it is a public institution established to assist in the protection, development, dissemination and prevention of unemployment and to carry out unemployment insurance services.

⁸ Through these courses, not only Roma young people but also individuals of different age groups receive training on different fields.

⁹ İŞKUR implements this program to ensure their adaptation to the labour market and to provide temporary income support. Aim of the program is to prevent the unemployed who have difficulties in their employment and to prepare them to labour market.

¹⁰ This is the program organized for the unemployed registered to İŞKUR to gain professional experience and to see the practice in the occupations they receive theoretical training and to ensure their adaptation to

There is also an interviewee (P7) who set up his own business as a hairdresser. According to him the young Roma who go to an Apprenticeship (vocational) Training Center with the guidance of family members at an early age can join the employment by setting up their own businesses. Among Roma youth, some of them do not give up applying to the “insured” jobs, although they are usually unemployed. A young Roma emphasized that when he was unemployed, he worked in the bazaar, but it was more important for him to have an “insured” job (P3).

3.3 Roma youth in temporary works

The number of the young Roma working in temporary jobs without social insurance is also high in the neighborhoods. The characteristics of temporary/informal jobs differ in terms of neighborhoods. The young Roma in the Dinkçiler neighborhood tend to be musicians. This neighborhood is known for its “musicians” in Balıkesir. Because of this characteristic, they separate themselves against other Roma neighborhoods by considering themselves as more “prestigious”. Most of the families in the neighborhood live on musicianship. The musician profession is transferred from father to son. Traditional transference within the family may adversely affect the motivation of children in education at an early age. Musician families mention that they have serious problems in employment. An interviewee summarizes the situation such as;

“We love this job, we took it from the father but there is no insurance” (P1).

In the neighborhood, adult musicians train the enthusiastic young Roma by including them in their social networks. Although there are good examples of musicianship (such as Hüsni Şenlendirici, one of the famous Roma musicians in Turkey), it is a daily-job with no insurance. In the employment process, the relationship that young Roma have with a musician job often remains as an “additional” job. Of course, many young Roma declare they want to work in insured jobs with a regular income.

Some young Roma in temporary jobs in the Gümüşçeşme neighborhood, work in the bazaar. The reason the bazaar job is widespread among the young Roma is that the shopkeepers in the neighborhood provide job opportunities for them. One participant stated that when he could not find a job in the market, he turned to the bazaar, which he defined as a “father profession”. Women particularly prefer cleaning jobs that have a high risk of physical dangers. In the neighborhood, “süpürgecilik” (broom making) (P10) and “elekçilik” (sieve making) are also common, partly as traditional family occupations. There is also shoe-shiner, waste collector and junk-dealer (P2) among the Roma youth in the Gümüşçeşme neighborhood. Broom making is the main source of livelihood in the Burhaniye neighborhood in the Susurluk district of Balıkesir.

Seasonal jobs in the coastal and inland areas of Balıkesir are also common among Roma youth. There are also families who migrate seasonally to different regions of Turkey in agriculture. The relationship of Roma in seasonal agricultural work leads to a breakdown in the education of school-age children. In the summer, basketry is a traditional business in coastal areas. Especially in Erdek and Edremit, selling chaise lounges and “hawking” jobs are also common among young Roma.

the working environment. It is a program in which the unemployed can improve their professional skills and gain experience.

3.4 Exclusion in employment: Job application and working process

So, which problems do Roma youth experience in the employment process? In this study, it has been seen that there are two phases of employment as “job application” and “working” process which are important for Roma youth.

3.4.1 Job application

Social exclusion in cultural, economic and political spheres is the opposite of social integration or, more broadly, inclusion. The term refers to the social conditions and processes that are theoretically complex, ambiguous and flexible (Silver, 1994: 536). Exclusion signifies any disadvantaged situation that a group of people experience individually or as a group within the community they live in (Gezgin, 2016: 73). The disadvantaged situation caused by exclusion leads to the isolation of individuals from various spheres of the social world (social, economic, political, cultural, and spatial) both physically and psychologically. The young Roma pointed out that they were exposed to social exclusion especially in job applications because of their ethnic identity. The phenomenon that triggers and embodies exclusion in job applicants is the identity of the neighborhood.

Most of the Roma communities live in the peripheral or segregated neighborhoods of the cities because of socio-economic reasons. These neighborhoods are not only stigmatized by poverty but also by criminal phenomenon such as crime and drugs. It is possible to come across such stigmatized neighborhoods/territories segregated based on ethnicity or socio-economic status in each city. These places, also known as “Gypsy/Roma neighborhoods” (Açıklalın & Şahin, 2016: 72) or “exile neighborhoods” (Wacquant, 2014: 120), have a key role in the employment process, especially for the individuals living in it. Therefore, spatial stigmatization (Şentürk, 2015: 176), negatively affects job applications of young people living in these neighborhoods and inhibits the processes of inclusion in the urban area. Some young Roma prefer to keep themselves distant from the neighborhood due to the stigmatized image. They even think about leaving the neighborhood:

“If I were in the money after getting a nice job, the first thing I would do is leave this neighborhood. I am tired of repeating that. Before I began this job, I applied at a super-market. The man (authorized) looked at my CV and saw Gümüşçeşme (name of the stigmatized neighborhood). After that, no one called back.” (P3)

One of the young Roma, whose only dream was to be a public officer, accepted the stigmatized image of the neighborhood and preferred to show his address differently in order to hide Roma identity:

“One day, they asked me where I lived in a job application. I told Cengiz Topel [somewhere near Gümüşçeşme neighborhood]. I couldn't say Gümüşçeşme. But there was a girl working there, the 'devil' and she recognized me. 'Don't you live in the Gümüşçeşme side,' she said. But she didn't let the surrounding people understand the case. The girl was not a Roma, but she said she knew where I really lived because she was also living there.” (P4)

Some young Roma who are aware of spatial stigmatization stated that social exclusion is not a problem, especially in metropolitan cities, but that their identity draws attention in smaller cities like Balıkesir (P5). Some of them expressed that the employers underlined their neighborhoods in their job application. When they heard the name of the neighborhood, they did not consider young Roma's applications directly or indirectly:

“10% of employers evaluate our job applications seriously. The rest do not even care about it. For example, the employer does not say he/she needs it bluntly, but he/she beats around the bush.” (P8)

“I expect them to be clear. When it is said “we have no need for employees” I respect that. Yet, when the name of the neighborhood is mentioned, they beat around the bush, and I don’t like it.” (P4)

Some young people stated that they received negative answers in their job applications because of health problems and some could not find “references”. One of the young Roma especially stated that even “skin color” was a problem in job applications:

“The person sees that we have dark skin. Aha, that's definitely Gypsy, he says. I clearly feel it. He shakes his head, saying we do not need anyone.” (P3)

A certain number of Roma youth who are squeezed between identity and neighborhood in their job application processes are able to fight exclusion. Exclusionary reactions often reduce the motivation of the young Roma in employment. The young Roma prefer to go to “family work” or to the temporary/casual/seasonal jobs mentioned above, considering that it will not make sense to improve their skills. Consequently, social exclusion built on the perception of space and identity in the job application process, prevents the participation of Roma youth in employment and isolates them from formal job opportunities. More importantly, this segregation process strengthens attitudes towards concealing the Roma identity.

3.4.2 *Working life*

The neighborhood, which is described as “wrecked”¹¹ among Roma youth, does not quit following them even after they are employed. The young Roma who succeed in passing the first phase (job application) face a more challenging phase when they start a work. Social exclusion/discrimination against Roma youth continues in working life. In this process, most of the interviewees stated that they were harassed directly or indirectly in their workplaces. Even though they can overcome the employer factor, the relationships with workmates can be nerve-racking:

“The biggest problem of our young people at work actually starts after beginning work. When you start chatting with someone then the tension begins. The man asks where you live and insistently asks, when you answer Gümüşçeşme, Gündoğan, then he asks: ‘Are you Gypsy?’ And then it goes on telling it to the people.” (Opinion leader, male, driver, age: 39)

“When I start to work anywhere, at first it is not a problem in which neighborhood I live. But in time, the people around are starting to talk about my identity allusively.” (P8)

A common opinion among Roma youth in the process of working is that exclusion has been overcome in time:

“There are generalizations about Roma in society. I’m very uncomfortable with this. People have prejudices. I have had patience. I worked in harmony with others. I proved myself in the workplace. I gave information about the Roma to everyone I chatted to.” (P6)

In the process of working, Roma youth have to struggle with the negative perception created against them. The reaction of Roma youth to social exclusion in the work process is categorized in three ways; “Abandonment”, “Disregard” and “Hiding identity”. Some young Roma do not receive the exclusionary attitudes of workmates favorably in the workplace. They are getting

¹¹ The definitions in other countries are as follows: *ghetto* in the USA, *banlieue* in France (suburban), *quartieri periferici* (or *degradati*) in Italy, *problemområde* in Sweden, *favela* in Brazil, *villa miseria* in Argentina (Wacquant, 2010: 1), *varoş* (outskirt) or *gecekondu* (slum) in Turkey.

stressed in time. So, they react more severely to the others and finally quit the job. Some young people do not care about employer or workmate's mobbing. And also, if some young Roma think their identity will be a problem in the places where they work, they try to keep their identity as confidential as possible.

3.5 Strategies against exclusion in the triangle of identity, education, and space

Identity and space are the critical phenomena that affect the process of participation of Roma youth in employment. The balance between identity and space is directly related to the extent to which young people are involved in the educational process. Within this framework, the attitudes of Roma youth according to their educational level were classified in three different ways:

Roma youth with a high level of education: Among Roma youth, some continue to live by hiding their identity, while others emphasize and struggle for Roma identity. Young Roma develop strategies against social exclusion in the employment process, such as caring about vocational courses, ensuring continuity in education, proving oneself with personal performances, persisting in insured jobs and contacting with effective references. The role models in the Roma community also strengthen this group's approach to employment. Social participation (inclusion) is high among these young Roma.

Roma youth with a low level of education: Some of them continue with family jobs (musicians). Another group focuses on temporary and informal jobs. These are the ones who are exposed to exclusion, especially in job-application processes, and who have to partially hide their identity. It is possible to group these young people's responses to exclusion into three categories: "abandonment, disregard and hiding of identity". Social participation is on a middle-level among these individuals.

Uneducated group (junk-dealer, waste collectors): They do not care about the exclusion in employment; they just seem to be focused only on saving the day. They do not have any expectations from the labor market. These young Roma have internalized the social exclusion. Levels of isolation and social closure are high among these young Roma and social participation is weak.

It is also possible to categorize the relationship of Roma youth with their neighborhoods and their approaches towards spatial stigmatization as follows:

- *Normalization:* The first group states that their neighborhoods are stigmatized because of prejudices and stereotypes from the past. Current problems attributed to the neighborhoods are also routinely experienced in other non-Roma neighborhoods. However, the people living in the urban areas just think of the Roma neighborhoods as problematic.

"Prejudice exists for each notion and for everyone. There is not so much discrimination. Of course, there has been a prejudice legated by the elders, but when you meet, sit, eat, and talk with them (non-Roma), prejudice evaporate." (P7)

- *Self-criticism:* The second group states that some groups living in the neighborhood are responsible for stigmatization. They emphasize that some individuals in their Roma community have had an impact on the transformation of their neighborhood into "restless" spaces. The neighborhood does not seem to be a safe place because of its criminal associations.

"What a poor and pitiful community this is. Because of a few, many people get frustrated. I see why people don't come to this neighborhood because even we are afraid of it. How can they (non-Roma) not be afraid." (P11)

- *Departure:* The young Roma in the third group accept the negative stigma built on the neighborhood. They want to distance themselves from the neighborhood. They want to move

from the neighborhood when they have an opportunity. In their opinion, the neighborhood has sunk into crime. They do not wish to live in these neighborhoods, but they have to live there for now.

“If I had money, I would move to a nice neighborhood with my mother. This neighborhood has already been bad. Its charm is lost.” (P9)

“I do not have so many friends in this neighborhood. At the first opportunity, I want to move somewhere else but I am here for now because my family lives here.” (P4)

As a result, there is a complex sociological process for Roma youth. On the one hand, they are trying to exist in this cycle of poverty, inadequate education and limited employment. On the other hand, they have to struggle with the exclusion and discrimination.

4. Conclusion

Roma in Turkey is typically exposed to social exclusion and discrimination because of their ethnic identity. Exclusionary discourse produces social, economic, cultural and spatial problems in everyday life. This study has sought to understand the employment processes in the economic field from the point of view of the young Roma.

Roma identity stands as a barrier for the young Roma because of the social superstitions in employment. Another phenomenon that is an obstacle is the neighborhoods in which they live. For those living in other parts of the city, these neighborhoods are “tumorous” spaces and marginalized with crime. The criminal character of the neighborhood is identified with this Roma ethnicity, and therefore a social stigma built in the form of “Roma/Gypsy neighborhood” has emerged. The neighborhood, as a stigmatized space, reduces the employability of Roma youth and makes their social integration even more problematic. This study has tried to understand the exclusion experiences of the Roma youth who are squeezed between the stigmatized space and the labor market. Participation in employment is a significant social threshold for Roma youth. It provides a public sphere where the young Roma can struggle with the exclusion and the stigmatization.

The Roma/Gypsy community is part of the ethnic diversity in Turkey. In recent years, the problems of the community have started to be discussed at a systematic level through both academic publications and public-NGO projects. On the one hand, the problems caused by social exclusion are handled in all dimensions. On the other hand, it is concentrating on institutional social policies to improve the capacity of the community. Integrative sociological approaches are preferred rather than discriminative ones across the studies conducted on Roma. An expression used in SIROMA Project, summarizes the perspective on different ethnic and social groups in Turkey: “Our difference is our wealth, our unity is our future”.

Roma youth try to overcome social, economic and spatial dimensions of exclusion by individual effort. However, there are structural problems that depend on urban policies and city administrators. The institutional approaches towards the areas where Roma inhabit need to change. Most of Roma community seems to be dependent on social aids according to some social policy-makers. As Roma opinion leaders draw attention, these social aids have negative impacts on the community. The continuity of social aids in the neighborhoods also contributes to the reproduction of negative spatial stigmatization over the neighborhoods. This study recommends focusing on education and employment-oriented activities rather than the official social aids. The common proposition of the Roma opinion leaders and employment experts was that “one person must have a regular income in every household”. Having a regular income job will increase the school attendance of children in the household. This will also increase the level of literacy and lead to the training of qualified/skilled employees in the labor market. It is obviously essential for the young Roma to have an insured, secured, and regular income job. A stable employment process

will reinforce their participation in social life. As well, it will provide a public sphere where they can properly deal with exclusion and stigmatization. Otherwise, social exclusion can easily result in introversion or isolation.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The author declares no competing interests.

References

- Açıklım, N., & Şahin, B. (2016). "Burada her şey kendiliğinden": Mersin'de yaşayan Romanlar üzerine alan araştırması ["Everything happens spontaneously here": A case study on Romani communities living in Mersin]. *Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 36(1), 71-97. <https://doi.org/10.16917/sd.11769>
- Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı. (2017). *Siroma Sosyal İçerme kitabı* (No. EuropeAid 134662/IH/SER/TR) [Siroma Social Inclusion book]. Retrieved 18 August 2019, from <http://www.ikg.gov.tr/romanlarin-yogun-olarak-yasadigi-alanlarda-sosyal-icermenin-desteklenmesi/>.
- Akkan, B. E., Deniz, M. B., & Ertan, M. (2011). *Sosyal dışlanmanın Roman halleri* [Roma states of social exclusion]. İstanbul: Edirne Roman Derneği: Sosyal Politika Forumu: Anadolu Kültür.
- Aksu, M. (2010). *Türkiye'de Çingene olmak* [Being Gypsies in Turkey]. Ankara: Anekdot Yayınevi.
- Aras, T. (2016). Çoklu kültürün bir ifade biçimi olarak Çalgıcı Romanlar [Instrumental Roma as a form of expression of multiple cultures]. In P. Yazgan & F. Tilbe (Series Eds.), *Türk Göçü 2016 Seçilmiş Bildiriler-1* (pp. 151-157). Retrieved 2 October 2018, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322387169_Coklu_Kulturun_Bir_Ifade_Bicimi_Olarak_Calgici_Romanlar.
- Batı Karadeniz Kalkınma Ajansı. (2016). *Sosyal dışlanma sorunsalı ve Zonguldak Roman araştırması* [Social exclusion problem and Zonguldak Roma research]. Retrieved 21 January 2020, from <https://www.bakkakutuphane.org/dokuman/sosyal-dislanma-sorunsali-ve-zonguldak-roman-arastirmasi/239>.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th Ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Genç, Y., & Taylan, H. H. (Eds.) (2017). "*Hep Birlikte Daha Güzel Yarınlar*": *Proje sonuç raporu ve Roman sorunları alan araştırması* ["Together to a Better Tomorrow": Project final report and field research on Roma issues]. Kocaeli: Bolu Sosyolojik Araştırma Merkezi Derneği.
- Gezgin, E. (2016). *Damgalanan mekânda yaşam: Bir kentin "öteki'si olmak"* [Life in the stigmatized space: Being the "other" of a city]. Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi.
- Gün, S. (2016). *Etnikleşen yoksulluk: Çingeneler/Romanlar örneği* [Ethnicization of poverty: The case of Gypsies/Roma] (Unpublished master's thesis). Hacettepe Üniversitesi, Ankara.
- İlik, B. (2016). *Türkiye'de Roman yurttaşların sorunları ve çözüme ilişkin çalışmalar* [The problems of Roma citizens in Turkey and work for solutions]. Retrieved 21 January 2020, from <https://docplayer.biz.tr/49068264-Turkiye-de-roman-yurttaslarin-sorunlari-ve-cozume-iliskin-calismalar.html>.
- Karan, U. (2017). Görmezlikten gelinen eşitsizlik: Türkiye'de Romanların barınma ve eğitim hakkına erişimi [Ignored and unequal: Roma access to the right to housing and education in Turkey]. Retrieved 2 October 2019, from Minority Rights website: <http://minorityrights.org/publications/gormezlikten-gelinen-esitsizlik-turkiyede-romanlarin-barinma-ve-egitim-hakkina-erisimi/>.

- Kenrick, D. (2007). *Historical dictionary of the Gypsies (Romanies)* (2nd Ed.). Lanham, Md: Scarecrow Press.
- Kolukırcık, S. (2004). *Aramızdaki yabancı: Çingener* [The stranger among us: Gypsies] (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Ege Üniversitesi, İzmir.
- Marsh, A. (2008). Eşitsiz vatandaşlık: Türkiye Çingenerinin karşılaştığı hak ihlalleri [Unequal citizenship rights violations faced by Gypsies in Turkey]. In E. Uzpeder, S. Danova/Roussinova, S. Özçelik, & S. Gökçen (Eds.), *Biz buradayız! Türkiye’de Romanlar, ayrımcı uygulamalar ve hak mücadelesi*. İstanbul: Mart Matbaacılık.
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods* (3rd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage Publications.
- Roman Vatandaşlara Yönelik Strateji Belgesi (2016-2021) [Strategy Document for Roma Citizens] (2016, April 30). Retrieved 18 August 2019, from Resmi Gazete website: <http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2016/04/20160430-11.htm>.
- Romanlar Federasyonu (2017). *Roman İstihdam ve Mesleki Danışmanlık Ağı Projesi: Roman istihdamında bölgesel sorunlar eylem planı* [Roma Employment and Vocational Counseling Network Project: Regional problems in Roma employment action plan]. Retrieved 25 August 2019, from IKG website: <https://mistik.ikg.gov.tr/upload/2017-09/48e154d0-471f-4114-90ab-e63b892f5f46.pdf>.
- Şanlıer, S. (2013). *Hukuki düzenlemeler ışığında Osmanlı Çingeneri* [Ottoman Gypsies in the light of legal regulations]. İstanbul: Ofis Yayın Matbaacılık.
- Şentürk, M. (2015). Dışarıda ve dışında olmak: Yoksul gençlerin mekânla ilişkileri [Being outside and apart: Impoverished youths’ relations with locales]. *Sosyoloji Dergisi*, 3(31), 169-203. <https://doi.org/10.16917/sd.04346>
- Silver, H. (1994). Social exclusion and social solidarity: Three paradigms. *International Labour Review*, 133(5-6), 531-578. Retrieved 19 August 2019, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/247563087_Social_Exclusion_and_Social_Solidarity_Three_Paradigms
- Taylan, H. H., & Barış, İ. (2015). *Romanlar ve sosyal dışlanma* [Roma and social exclusion]. Konya: Çizgi Kitabevi.
- Taylan, H. H., Barış, İ., & Genç, Y. (2015). Sakarya’da Romanlara yönelik sosyal mesafe araştırması [Social distance research for Roma in Sakarya]. In E. Dömek & H. H. Taylan (Eds.), *Uluslararası Roman sorunları çalıştay bildirisi kitabı* (pp. 36-43). Retrieved 25 August 2019, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/310463130_SAKARYA'DA_ROMANLARA_YONELIK_SOSYAL_MESAFE_ARASTIRMASI.
- Türkiye Avrupa Roman Hakları Merkezi Raporu [Turkey and the European Roma Rights Center Report] (2014, March 26). Retrieved 20 January 2020, from European Roma Rights Centre website: <http://www.errc.org/reports-and-submissions/turkiye-ulke-profil-2011-2012>.
- Wacquant, L. (2010). *Urban outcasts: A comparative sociology of advanced marginality*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Wacquant, L. (2014). Neoliberal şehirde marjinalite, etnisite ve cezalandırma: Analitik bir kartografya [Marginality, ethnicity and punishment in the neoliberal city: an analytical cartography]. In S. Torlak & Ö. Kulak (Trans.), *Mekan meselesi*. İstanbul: Tekin Yayınevi.
- Weckman, S. (2013). Researching Finnish Gypsies: Advice from a Gypsy. In D. Tong (Ed.), *Gypsies: An interdisciplinary reader* (pp. 3-10). New York: Routledge.





Post-Materialist Waste: A Study of Turkey's Importation of Rubbish

Michael Babula & Glenn Muschert

*Khalifa University of Science and Technology, Abu Dhabi, UAE
Department of Humanities and Social Sciences*

Received: 14 March 2020 ▪ Accepted: 28 May 2020 ▪ Published Online: 20 July 2020

Abstract

Focusing on the case of Turkey's rubbish importation, this article examines the discrepancy between Turkey's importation of foreign rubbish and its national agenda to become a zero-waste society. Drawing upon the sixth (2012) wave of the World Values Survey (WVS) conducted in Turkey, analysis has identified a noted shift in the social values respondents hold, indicating a shift from traditional strong-economy values, known as materialist values, and the emergent environmentally-friendly values, known as post-materialist values. Most of the Turkish population shares concerns for both types of values, while a growing Turkish minority holds post-materialist values. The analysis draws on chi-square tests, which indicate that a shift towards post-materialist values has produced prioritizing environmental concerns over the strength of the economy among this sample. Rather than pursuing a waste-free society due to a rubbish apocalypse, the results indicate that further development in the Turkish economy will facilitate further shifts toward post-materialism, in which context the population would become increasingly positive toward waste refurbishment and other environmental concerns.

Keywords: world values survey, materialist values, post-materialist values, environmentalism, Turkish social values.

Social scientists have a long tradition of studying so-called wicked problems (Churchman, 1967), ones that lack precise definitions, that are not yes/no problems, and that are embedded in other related social problems (see Rittel & Webber, 1973). The issue of how to handle rubbish and other waste is one such problem that has been observed as consumption increases worldwide, and subsequently more waste is generated. Some doomsday scenarios exist that warn of the issue of rubbish soon causing a day of reckoning, such as India's Mt. Everest of Trash (Cassella, 2019) or Singapore's ticking waste time bomb (Hicks, 2019). Even in the academic literature, a waste mountain hides behind the polished veneer of eco-consumerism (de Coverly, McDonagh, O'Malley & Patterson, 2008), and current waste is predicted to increase tenfold (see Jambeck et al., 2015). Moreover, although increased global population should produce increased waste, predictions indicate that the rate of waste produced will continue to rise even faster than the world population (Kaza, Yao, Bhada-Tata & van Woerden, 2018).

In contrast, one simultaneously observes the development of a robust discourse to convert to zero-waste lifestyles (e.g., Kellogg, 2019) that reduce waste to zero by reducing the production of waste or by productively repurposing waste materials. Similarly, a search of "zero

waste” on online shopping sites will reveal, perhaps ironically, a vigorous assemblage of products geared toward consumers who aim to reduce waste. While determining whether or not the coming rubbish apocalypse will take place is beyond the scope of any single study in the sociology of rubbish, the present study examines the cultural trends among Turkish people toward rubbish, including its importation, disposal, and/or reuse. As the following conceptual and empirical discussion will show, Turkey at this point in its history is in a transition from materialist to post-materialist values.

News articles on the Turkish importation of rubbish have recently appeared in important global media outlets (e.g., Laville, 2018), including the issue that rubbish intended for recycling may in fact end up in landfills in Turkey (e.g., Parveen, 2018). In Turkey, however, the issue has hardly been covered. Quite the opposite than highlighting the fact that Turkey imports foreign rubbish, Turkish media have covered how First Lady Ermine Erdoğan has become a public champion of the initiative for Turkey to achieve a zero-waste goal by 2023 (*Daily Sabah*, 2018; *TRT World*, 2019), which will be the centennial of the establishment of the modern Turkish Republic (Ward, 2018). At the same time, however, Turkish importation of waste has increased significantly (Saracoglu & Laville, 2018). Given the push for zero-waste, the increased importation of foreign rubbish into Turkey suggests some discrepancy exists between the zero-waste goals of policy and decision makers with the population that controls the private sector. This article examines this discrepancy, in which the handling of Turkish rubbish is indicative of a contemporary shift from materialist to post-materialist values.

1. Introduction to shifting socio-political environmental values

Data from the World Values Survey (WVS) indicate the majority of the population in Turkey to be of mixed-types, interested in both materialist and post-materialist concerns, although a large minority remains clearly concentrated on materialist concerns. Inglehart (1977), who originally based his paradigm on Maslow’s (1970), needs hierarchy to identify two types of people who are in conflict over economic resources. In Maslow’s paradigm, *materialist* types are concerned primarily with tier-one needs, which consist of the gratification of physical and security needs. Important social issues for materialist types typically include strong police, strong national security/defense, low taxation, and maintaining a strong economy. *Post-materialist* types are those who gratify higher-order needs regarding freedom, self-expression, and quality of life issues that are underpinned by social interests and concerns for self-actualization. Valence social issues among post-materialists tend to include freedom of speech, childcare, healthcare, the environment, and higher education (Inglehart, 1977). The analysis examines key social values toward social and economic life captured in the WVS that demonstrate the concerns of Turkish people and specifically whether they are materialist types concerned with immediate security issues such as maintaining a strong economy and national defense or whether they are post-materialist types who tend toward broader concerns for quality of life and the environment.

Inglehart (1977) further posited that values cross-cut across societies based on economic development and values are passed from one generation to another. A key dynamic is that materialist values tend to correlate with lower levels of economic development and appear among those whose routine concerns fall largely upon their need to pursue subsistence. In comparison, post-materialist values seem to emerge once the physical needs for safety and security are satisfied, particularly among those populations that have achieved a level of material comfort due to economic development and/or the presence of a social welfare system. When presented with a social issue such as rubbish and what to do with it, the two types of values are expected to produce differing points of view and responses. With regards to rubbish as a social concern, materialist types should be concerned with the removal of waste from their immediate living and working environments. If there were a perceived excessive cost associated with the handling of

rubbish and its associated waste, materialists would likely be opposed to bearing such costs, as long as the rubbish was not a problem in their lives and communities. In contrast, post-materialist types should also be interested in repurposing rubbish, aesthetic concerns, and preservation of the environment. Post-materialists are more likely to bear the costs of handling rubbish if it were conducted in the name of recycling or other efforts to preserve the environment.

Jin (2011) stated that waste is the result of increased industrialization; however, this is an oversimplified view. In fact, precisely the opposite appears true in that refinement in waste management practices can lead to a re-purposing of waste materials into quality durable goods, which of course would have positive economic value. Thus, waste also occurs with post-industrial economies, but more importantly than the waste itself is what the society decides to do with their domestic or imported waste. Inglehart (1977) argued that, when economic resources are scarce, people engage in conflict over goods and service that are in short supply. However, what is the creative value of the waste in this exchange, and indeed would it be possible to shift the view of rubbish as waste to rubbish as a potential raw material for durable goods? Thus, rather than seeing an audacious zero-waste policy as a mere starting point, what would happen if waste is viewed differently as a raw material for creative transformation, which ultimately could become a driver of economic growth?

The ultimate post-materialist value that emerges in relation to waste is the push for zero-waste programs, ones in which all produced waste is repurposed as raw materials for future use (Docksai, 2014). Despite the great opportunity that exists for Turkey to repurpose its waste products, the will of the populace to undertake such activity is lacking, as a large portion remains strongly materialist in its values. Policy makers have perhaps moved too far ahead of the population in relation to such shifting socio-political values. However, despite Turkey's significant increases in economic growth from 2004 until 2016, it is now experiencing an economic recession due to increased debt and devaluation of the currency. However, Turkey's growth, while impressive, does not compare to the growth that has taken place in post-industrial economies such as the USA or UK during the 1990s. Turkey remains very much a developing economy where the majority of the population has not experienced significant growth in real wages or reduced income inequality. The economic situation has arguably declined as poverty levels have increased as a result of a significant influx of refugees in recent years. While one may assume that post-materialists and their values may be strongly expressed among governing authorities, a large minority of the population remains as materialist types less concerned with the Turkish import of foreign waste than with promoting a strong economy and workforce.

2. Unexplored potential of creative waste

The sociological literature clearly indicates a creative potential to exist for waste (Pellow & Brehm, 2013; Douglas, 1966). Thompson (2017) identified flexibility in the definitions of value, such that creativity can transform waste into something deemed valuable. While most view waste transient in value, he argued an area of flexibility to exist regarding rubbish in that its lack of value as an item to be thrown away can instead be transformed by creative processes into raw materials that are deemed durable and of value (see discussion in Min'an, 2011). Docksai (2014: 16) paraphrased the World Bank to state that, although humanity will produce three times as much waste at the end of this century, waste is already becoming a "resource – a solution that could also cut global pollution, stave off looming resource crises, and lower manufacturing costs, among other benefits."

In the aftermath of Inglehart's (1977) book titled *The Silent Revolution*, social scientists developed the WVS. This survey indicated that the USA and Europe have continued the onward progress of a post-materialist revolution, and it is exactly these locales that have witnessed effective zero-waste initiatives. For example, the US Army has pursued a 2020 initiative with eight

military installations undertaking programs to reduce their rubbish output to zero (Docksai, 2014). Europe importantly is noted to import more materials than any location on the planet and to throw more away than other continents (Docksai, 2014). However, European countries with the highest levels of post-materialist types have made great strides in repurposing their waste. For example, Norwegians recycle 68% of their rubbish (Docksai, 2014).

The UK, although exporting significant rubbish to Turkey, has also increased repurposing initiatives due to the coalescing off its population’s post-materialist values, gathering the attention of policy makers. Brexit is a recent phenomenon, and the British have mostly enjoyed economic development in tandem with the USA in recent decades, though this has been intermittently disrupted by recession. For example, Toyota PLC introduced reverse osmosis in Derbyshire, UK, which has repurposed 100,000 tons of wastewater to allow boilers and humidity-control systems to work more efficiently at its paint shop (*Professional Engineering*, 2007). Docksai (2014) conceded that, while waste initiatives make for a healthier future, they cost more money. Of course, this may significantly change as nations more aligned with the post-materialist continuum develop methods to make waste repurposing cost-effective and even profitable.

Docksai (2014) referred to the idea that waste repurposing will likely become a necessity as humanity starts to exceed the resource capacity of the planet. We have taken a different view and argue that shifts in values will facilitate increased waste repurposing more than necessity. We posit that post-materialist value-shifts, albeit small, have already taken place in Turkey and are observable based on a decade of growth. This article examines a data set designed to explore shifts in social-value preferences, namely the sixth and most recent wave of the WVS (Inglehart et al., 2014). Because the data collection preceded the 2016 attempted coup and the economic downturn that followed, these data demonstrate, as Abramson and Inglehart (1995) predicted, that values shift away from materialist desires toward post-materialist concerns during favorable economic times. The data demonstrate that necessity, not post-materialist concerns, had long before caused a value shift. Indeed, the value shift, rather than being interpreted as a result of economic woes, preceded the economic challenges of recent years and in fact may set the stage for a continued values shift should the country be able to turn around its current economic woes.

3. Method

This research relies on analysis of the sixth and latest wave of the World Values Survey (WVS) conducted in Turkey in 2012. The WVS is “a global network of social scientists studying changing values and their impact on social and political life, led by an international team of scholars, with the WVS Association and WWSA Secretariat headquartered in Vienna, Austria” (WVS Database, n.d.). The WVS was inspired by Inglehart (1977) and measures four goals on national levels as follows: (a) maintaining order in the nation, (b) fighting rising prices, (c) giving people more say in important government decisions, and (d) protecting freedom of speech. Values (a) and (b) represent materialist goals, while values (c) and (d) represent post-materialist values. Six questions exist which require respondents to rank their values by level of importance, as described in Table 1.

Table 1. Value type rankings by indexed averages (percentages)

	Most Important	Second-Most Important
Materialist values		
High level of economic growth	63.5	20.1
Making sure this country has strong defense forces	20.8	30.4
Maintaining order in the country	42.4	25.5
Fighting rising prices	22.2	28.7
A stable economy	56.5	20.3

The fight against crime	8.6	22.4
Indexed Mean	35.7	24.6
<u>Post-materialist values</u>		
Seeing that people have more say about how things are done at their jobs and in their communities	8.9	29.9
Trying to make our cities and countryside more beautiful	4.6	15.6
Giving people more say in government decisions	23.3	22.1
Protecting freedom of speech	9.6	19.9
Progress toward a less impersonal and more humane society	23.2	28.2
Progress toward a society in which ideas count more than money	9.1	24.7
Indexed Mean	13.1	23.4

Questionnaires for the WVS are administered in person, and respondents address questions in the prescribed order in which they are presented. For each nation, including this Turkish case, WVS questions have been adapted from the master English-language questionnaire and translated into Turkish. The sample has been designed representative of the entire Turkish adult population aged 18 and older. Analysis was conducted on 1,605 useable participant surveys. The sample consists of 51.7% males and 49.3% female; 28% are between 18 and 29 years old, 45.8% between 30 and 49 years old, and 26.2% are 50 years of age or older. In terms of education, 14.4% have no diploma, 52.5% have an elementary school education, 21.7% have a high school education, and 11.4% have a college degree or higher.

4. Results

Inglehart (1977) utilized survey data from 1972 that estimated 24% of Americans to be materialist types and 17% to be post-materialist types, with the remainder being of mixed types. Inglehart (1977) had assumed he would find a large number of mixed types, as people pursuing materialist values would simultaneously show interest in post-materialism as their personal motivational development progressed. Babula (2007) posited the percentages for materialists and post-materialists to respectively be 24% and 52%, drawing upon research that used ratings rather than rankings to identify materialist versus post-materialist types. Babula's data might be slightly more accurate as it resulted in a finer delineation of where Americans fall along the scale. This USA research is useful in drawing a comparison with Turkey.

Table 1 shows the rankings for the values Turkish respondents hold most important and second-most important. The most important ratings indicate the sample to be 35.7% materialist types, 13.1% post-materialist types, and 51.2% mixed types. These percentages shift when participants are asked what their next most important value is. The resulting sample shows 24.6% to be materialist types, 23.4% to be post-materialist types, and 52.0% to be mixed types. The first most-important value rankings are in contrast with the 1972 America data, showing the materialist-type group to be larger than the USA group, whereas the post-materialist group is comparable with the USA at that point in time. Overall, the descriptive data suggest that a large Turkish minority are driven by materialist concerns while the majority is of mixed types with materialists showing interest in post-materialist values. The descriptive data demonstrate that a decade of growth prior to the 2012 survey in Turkey likely had had an impact on shifting values towards post-materialism, given that the majority of the country are classified as mixed types.

Shifting values can be considered in relation to an environmental question that appeared on the WVS. The survey asked, "Here are two statements people sometimes make when discussing the environment and economic growth. Which of these comes closer to your point of view?" Forty-eight percent responded that "protecting the environment should be given priority,

even if it causes slower economic growth and some job loss,” while 44.2% responded “economic growth and creating jobs should be the top priority, even if the environment suffers to some extent.” These descriptive statistics suggest a large number of participants want to protect the environment, and by parity of reasoning, are likely open to other post-materialist ideas, including waste refurbishing even if the costs might run high.

This raises an interesting contradiction because the largest subsection of the sample listed materialism as their first values preferences, and thus we turn to inferential statistics to resolve the dichotomy.

Chi-square analysis has been used to examine if a values shift from materialist to post-materialist values is underway in Turkey. At first, the analysis compared the highest-order priorities of the Turkish sample with their second-order priorities. As each question has four categories, the analysis used the following Bonferroni correction factor: $\alpha = .05/4 \approx .01$ (for the formula, see Field, 2015). Tables 2 and 3 show a significant association to exist between value types and whether participants ranked post-materialist pursuits higher after rendering materialist items as their primary choice for the first set of values ($\chi^2 (9) = 915.34, p < .01$).

Table 2. Crosstabulation for first-ordered values

		Aims of country: second choice				Total	
			A high level of economic growth	Making sure this country has strong defense forces	Seeing that people have more say about how are done at their job	Trying to make our cities and countryside more beautiful	
Aims of country: first choice	A high level of economic growth	Count	0	459	403	148	1010
	Making sure this country has strong defense forces	Count	185	0	66	78	329
	Seeing that people have more say about how are done at their job	Count	92	17	0	25	134
	Trying to make our cities and countryside more beautiful	Count	46	12	11	0	69
Total		Count	323	488	480	251	1542

Table 3. Chi-square tests for first-order values

	Value	df	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Pearson χ^2	915.344	9	.000
Odds Ratio	1,138.822	9	.000
Linear-by-Linear Association	232.604	1	.000
N of Valid Cases	1,542		

Based on the odds ratio, the likelihood of giving higher ranking to post-materialist values as the second-choice item are 1.53 times higher if participants rank materialist items highly as their first-choice item.

Tables 4 and 5 also indicate a significant association to exist between value types and whether participants rank post-materialist pursuits higher after rendering materialist items as their primary choice for the second set of values ($\chi^2 (9) = 763.13, p < .01$).

Table 4. Crosstabulations for second-order values

		Aims of respondent: second choice				Total	
		Maintaining order in the nation	Giving people more say in important government decisions	Fighting rising prices	Protecting freedom of speech		
Aims of respondent: first choice	Maintaining order in the nation	Count	0	258	300	110	668
	Giving people more say in important government decisions	Count	127	0	113	134	374
	Fighting rising prices	Count	216	58	0	75	349
	Protecting freedom of speech	Count	65	38	48	0	151
Total		Count	408	354	461	319	1542

Table 5. Chi-square tests for second-order values

	Value	df	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Pearson Chi-Square	763.129	9	.000
Odds Ratio	1,086.818	9	.000
Linear-by-Linear Association	194.266	1	.000
N of Valid Cases	1,542		

Based on the odds ratio, the likelihood of giving higher ranking to post-materialist values as a second-choice item are 2.20 times higher if participants rank materialist items highly as their first-choice item.

Tables 6 and 7 show the same significant association to exist between value types and whether participants rank post-materialist pursuits higher after rendering materialist items as their primary choice for the third set of values ($\chi^2 (9) = 766.16, p < .01$).

Table 6. Crosstabulations for the third-order values

		Most important: second choice				Total	
		A stable economy	Progress toward a less impersonal and more humane society	Progress toward a society in which Ideas count more than mon	The fight against crime		
Most important: first choice	A stable economy	Count	0	373	266	258	897
	Progress toward a less impersonal and more humane society	Count	163	0	124	73	360
	Progress toward a society in which Ideas count more than mon	Count	68	48	0	29	145
	The fight against crime	Count	95	31	6	0	132
Total		Count	326	452	396	360	1534

Table 7. Chi-square tests for third-order values

	Value	<i>df</i>	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Pearson χ^2	766.158	9	.000
Likelihood Ratio	1,038.891	9	.000
Linear-by-Linear Association	318.875	1	.000
<i>N</i> of Valid Cases	1,534		

Based on the odds ratio, the odds of giving higher ranking to post-materialist values as the second-choice item are 6.36 times higher if participants rank materialist items highly as their first-choice item. Table 8 demonstrates that there are significant associations for first and third sets of values. Specifically, participants who selected post-materialist values are significantly more likely to favor the environment compared with materialist types who are significantly more likely to favor the economy. No significant association were observed for the second set of values.

Table 8. Chi-square and odds ratio for values and whether participants favor the environment or economy

Question Set		Chi-Square Statistic (χ^2)	Degrees of freedom (<i>df</i>)	Odds of post-materialist types favoring the environment than materialist types favoring the economy
First set of values	Aims of the country first choice	25.32**	6	1.19
	Aims of the country second choice	18.33**	6	1.35
Second set of values	Aims of the country first choice	9.07	6	-
	Aims of the country second choice	13.94	6	-
Third set of values	Aims of the country first choice	32.56**	6	1.21
	Aims of the country second choice	51.60**	6	2.10

Notes. **Denotes significance at $p < .01$. Odds ratios have not been calculated for insignificant findings.

The associations observed within the first and third question sets are significant and demonstrate the odds ratios to become noticeably stronger for post-materialist types who favor an environmental agenda, with post-materialist concerns emerging as next most important objective. The data thus demonstrate a sizeable value shift toward post-materialism to have gone underway during the last wave of the 2012 WVS data collected in Turkey. One noteworthy element of the sample who rated materialist items as their first choice is that they simultaneously took interest in post-materialist values as their second choice. This shift impacted the participants’ preference towards promoting environmental concerns, even if such activities come at a short-term cost to the economy. Had the economy continued to improve, the population can logically be assumed to

have viewed the major economic factor of waste imports differently and to have seen value in refurbishment as a key factor in cleaning up the environment and promoting economic growth simultaneously.

5. Discussion

Clearly, the Turkish nation has faced significant challenges in recent years. The influx of refugees has added to an already-diverse population, and Turkey shares borders with several conflict zones. In addition, Turkey still has a significant debt crisis, inflation, and the problems associated with a weak currency. The economic downturn that has been observed in Turkey since 2016 is likely producing negative impacts on how Turkish citizens view environmentalism and waste refurbishment. However, the economic downturn may be limited in its impact on sublimating post-materialist values. Inglehart (1977) indicated that parents and older siblings tend to pass down their formative experiences and values to younger generations. Maslow (1970) argued that people gain a sense of functional autonomy and resistance to threats once human needs have been gratified. The economic growth noted in Turkey between 2004 and 2016 seems to have resulted in a value shift from materialism to post-materialism for many Turks, and this shift has had the effect of setting a trend that prioritizes protections for the environment, even if greater short-term economic costs are incurred.

As a result, what will cause Turkey to turn to waste refurbishing is not a matter of material necessity (i.e., a mountain of garbage), as so often predicted in rubbish doomsday scenarios. Rather, future developments in Turkey's economy are more likely to shift mindsets regarding how waste is managed. Undoubtedly, Turkey faces serious challenges, and future economic trends will have a profound impact on how the country treats the environment and waste. Despite current challenges, over a decade of growth in Turkey has clearly produced a shift towards post-materialist values and a noticeable desire among those holding such values to protect the environment. This shift is profound, as an increase in post-materialist types is likely to lead to such attitudes being expressed in the government and industry, some of the voices who ultimately set policy for the country. As decision-makers begin to see production, consumption, waste, and their interrelated phenomena, the potential exists for a shared sense of the creation, disposal, and potential (re)creation of waste in its social context (see Perry, Juhlin & Normark, 2010). The data shows a coalescence of values among the post-materialist subset of the population, albeit a minority, and the current leadership. A crisis point will not necessarily be required for Turkey to change course from deriving value in importing waste for landfills to acquiring value from refurbishing waste. This progression will naturally occur if Turkey takes critical steps toward improving its economy and providing for the material needs of the population.

Acknowledgements

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

The authors declare no competing interests.

References

- Abramson, P., & Inglehart, R. (1995). *Value change in global perspective*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.
- Professional Engineering (2007). Toyota uses waste water to heat Burnaston paintshop. *Author*, 20(12), 5.
- Babula, M. (2007). Political values in a threat environment, *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 40(2), 319-324. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20451953>.
- Babula, M. (2013). *Motivation, altruism, personality, and social psychology: The coming age of altruism*. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Cassella, C. (2019, June 10). India’s “Mount Everest” of trash is growing so fast, it needs aircraft warning lights. Retrieved from <https://www.sciencealert.com/a-growing-mountain-of-rubbish-in-india-will-soon-require-aircraft-warning-lights>.
- Churchman, C. W. (1967). Wicked problems. *Management Science*, 14(4B), 141-146. <https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.14.4.B141>
- Daily Sabah* (2018, November 1). First Lady Ermine Erdoğan’s “zero waste” project proves fruitful in first year. Retrieved from <https://www.dailysabah.com/turkey/2018/11/02/first-lady-ermin-erdogans-zero-waste-project-proves-fruitful-in-first-year-1541101176>.
- de Coverly, E., McDonagh, P., O’Malley, L., & Patterson, M. (2008). Hidden mountain: The social avoidance of waste. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 28(3), 289-303. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0276146708320442>
- Docksai, R. (2014). A world without waste? *The Futurist*, 48(2), 16.
- Douglas, M. (1966). *Purity and danger: An analysis of concepts of pollution and taboo*. London, UK: Routledge & Keegan Paul.
- Field, A. (2015). *Discovering statistics using IBM SSSP Statistics* (4th ed.). London, UK: Sage.
- Hicks, R. (2019, May 25). How will Singapore defuse a 16-year waste timebomb? Retrieved from <https://www.eco-business.com/news/how-will-singapore-defuse-a-16-year-waste-timebomb/>.
- Inglehart, R. (1977). *The silent revolution: Changing values and political styles among Western publics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Inglehart, R., Haerpfer, C., Moreno, A., Welzel, C., Kizilova, K., Diez-Medrano, J., & Puranen B. (Eds.). (2014). World Values Survey: All rounds – Country-pooled data file version. Madrid, Spain: JD Systems Institute. Retrieved from <http://www.worldvaluessurvey.org/WVSDocumentationWVL.jsp>.
- Jambeck, J. R., Geyer, R., Wilcox, C., Siegler, T. R., Perryman, M., Andrady, A., Narayan, R., & Law, K. L. (2015). Plastic waste inputs from land into the ocean. *Science* 13, 768-771. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.126035>
- Jin, H. (2011). Rubbish as a consequence of the ever more refined industrialization. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 28(7-8), 354-357. <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0263276411424760>
- Kaza, S., Yao, L. C., Bhada-Tata, P., & Van Woerden, F. (2018). *What a waste 2.0: A global snapshot of solid waste management to 2050*. Washington, DC: World Bank. Retrieved from <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/30317>.
- Kellogg, K. (2019). *101 ways to go zero waste*. New York, NY: The Countryman Press.
- Laville, S. (2018, October 18). Turkey’s plastic waste imports from the UK are booming – but at what cost? Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2018/oct/18/uk-plastic-waste-imports-to-turkey-boom-but-at-what-cost>.

- Maslow, A. (1970). *Motivation and personality* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Min'an, W. (2011). On rubbish. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 28(7-8), 340-353.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276411424758>
- Parveen, N. (2018, July 22). UK's plastic waste may be dumped overseas instead of recycled. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2018/jul/23/uks-plastic-waste-may-be-dumped-overseas-instead-of-recycled>.
- Pellow, D. N., & Brehm, H. N. (2013). An environmental sociology for the twenty-first century. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 39, 229-250. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-071312-145558>
- Perry, M., Juhlin, O., & Normark, D. (2010). Laying waste together: The shared creation and disposal of refuse in a social context. *Space and Culture*, 13(1), 75-94.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1206331209353685>
- Rittel, H. W. J., & Webber, M. M. (1973). Dilemmas in a general theory of planning. *Policy Sciences* 4(2), 155-169. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01405730>
- Saracoglu, G., & Laville, S. (2018, October 18). Turkey's plastic waste imports from the UK are booming – but at what costs? Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2018/oct/18/uk-plastic-waste-imports-to-turkey-boom-but-at-what-cost>.
- Thompson, M. (2017). *Rubbish theory: The creation and destruction of value* (2nd ed.). London, UK: Pluto Press.
- TRT World. (2019, April 9). Green economy possible – Turkey's first lady. Retrieved from <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/green-economy-possible-turkey-s-first-lady-25690>
- Ward, L. (2018, November 15). Zero waste to be mandatory in Turkey under draft bill. Retrieved February 18, 2019, from <https://www.fethiyetimes.com/greenfethiye/28426-zero-waste-to-be-mandatory-in-turkey-under-draft-bill.html>
- World Values Survey Database (n.d.). Website. Retrieved from <http://www.worldvaluessurvey.org/wvs.jsp>.



Special Issue: “Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems” – Afterword

Müjdat Avcı (PhD), Associate Professor
Osmaniye Korkut Ata University, TURKEY
Department of Political Science and Public Administration
Email: mujdatavci@osmaniye.edu.tr

Having just engaged the six sociological studies presented in this special issue on “Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems,” it seems apropos to offer some considerations on the origins and development of the sociological discipline in Turkey. Though perhaps not widely known outside of the Turkish context, the field of sociology in Turkey goes back to the earliest days when the discipline first appeared in European contexts (specifically in England, France, and Germany) during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. This context is essential, because it clarifies that Turkish sociology has long been concerned with the problems of society and their solution. Thus, the studies in this special issue do not emerge spontaneously, but rather are grounded in a long-standing intellectual tradition within the discipline.

Sociology, born in France in the first half of the 19th century with Auguste Comte (see Swingewood, 1984) and Le Play (see Brooke, 2017) found its reflection in Europe and America, and soon after in the Ottoman Empire (Sanay, 2014). In the years following the declaration of the Tanzimat Edict¹, some thinkers who had been in contact with Western social scientists had begun to produce the first sociological studies on the Ottoman society. By the early 1900s, we witness the establishment of the first chair of sociology. We see that the first sociology lessons were given by Ziya Gökalp (see Shaw & Shaw, 1977) in Dar’ül-Fünûn², even though there are different opinions on this subject, together with the first chair of sociology founded in 1914. Since the establishment of the new Turkish state in 1923, sociology has been integrated into the high school curriculum since the first years of the republic, at the same time as instruction in sociology began within post-secondary institutions (Kaçmazoğlu, 1999). Thus, it is noteworthy

¹ The Tanzimat Edict is the published declaration of the new sultan Abdülmecid in front of the notables of the Muslim and non-Muslim peoples on 3 November 1839, five months after the death of the Sultan II. Mahmut (Berkes, 1973). According to the declaration, Christian nationals and Muslims were made equal before the law. No one would be punished without trial in courts. Thus, the rights of non-Muslim nationals were guaranteed by the Sultan. The Tanzimat Edict also stated that new laws will be introduced in order to prevent the collapse of the Ottoman Empire in the direction of Westernization of the administration (Kongar, 2003).

² Dar’ül Fün’un, which was originally decided to be established in 1846, was opened only in 1863. With the opening of this institution, it was aimed that all Ottoman subjects, Muslim and Non-Muslim, to be educated side by side, to ensure that the state, which was on the way of Westernization, was included in public services and to conduct a modern university education outside religious schools and influences. However, due to some problems, Dar’ül Fün’un was opened in 1863. Having been opened several times under various names until 1933 (Darülfünun-i Şahane, Darülfünun-i Osmani, etc.), it took its name as İstanbul University on 1 August 1933, and started its education life as being the first and only university in Turkey (Akyüz, 2001: 154-157, 325-328).

that the new Turkish state was one of the leading countries where sociology was taught in educational institutions.

The first sociological researches in the Ottoman Empire were carried out by Ahmet Şuayp and colleagues (see Doğan & Alkan, 2016). These thinkers brought the understanding of biological sociology to the country with the translations they made. In the same period, Celal Nuri (see Aydın, 2007) and Abdullah Cevdet (see Gündüz, 2009) are seen to try to bring in Turkey the concept known as spiritual sociology in the West (Sanay, 2014).

Social studies initially carried out in Turkey were built within the perspectives of Western sociology and the approach to events and phenomena were produced within the framework of the concepts developed in the West. In this regard, taking into account the current situation of the Turkish society, sociology actually entered into the Turkish context to function as a solution to social problems which were expected to develop from the dissolution of Ottoman social orders.

It is accepted that in the beginning of the early 20th century in Turkey, real sociological activities started by Ziya Gökalp, the representative of the sociology of Comte and Durkheim, and Prince Sabahattin (Akşin, 2007), the representative of the Le Play school (İçli, 2012). Until the 1930s, sociology was taught in both high schools and universities. In this period, there was little development in the social science research apart from articles published by thinkers such as Mehmet Servet Bey (see Dinçşahin, 2015) and İsmail Hakkı Baltacıoğlu (see Dinçşahin, 2015; Sanay, 2014).

By the 1930s, historical developments in Turkey and beyond drove studies that changed sociological perspectives, generally in translations (Kayalı, 1994). The scholars who became prominent in these years were Hilmi Ziya Ülken (see Leaman, 2015) and Ziyaeddin Fahri Fındıkoğlu (see Brice, 1981). Ülken is one of the most important thinkers in Turkey's further work in this field, and his ability to analyze the works of Western thinkers and his research on Turkish intellectual history are from main efforts to be mentioned for this period. Another thinker whose name should be mentioned in these years is Fındıkoğlu, who is influenced by Gökalp's understanding of sociology and is known for being a versatile thinker in the history of Turkish sociology, has made important contributions to the development of Turkish sociology with his monographs, copyright and translation studies as well as his interest in applied sociology (Sanay, 2014). Especially in the mid-1930s, the effects of the German School of Sociology were strong (see İçli, 2012; Vandenberghe, 2009), although in the 1940s, it is seen that in some sociology departments, applied sociology courses have been given in line with the Le Play school, and the interest in monographic studies has increased in this period (see Brooke, 2017).

In the 1950's, with the effect of the "Science Sociale" school in Turkish sociology, scholars focused on producing monographic field studies carried out especially in villages (Şahin, 2017). These were also the years in which the ideological standpoint of the Turkish sociology also differs depending on the changing political conjuncture in Turkey. The changes that emerged in the Turkish society in the 1950s and afterwards are the problems caused by the internal dynamics of the society. Since it was understood that these problems could not be solved with theoretical studies, sociologists of this period turned to applied studies. Therefore, it is observed that studies based on empirical thought and application were adopted more in the sociology of this period.

In the 1960s, Turkish sociology entirely came under the influence of American sociology bedecked with Marxism. The sociology of this period seems to have lost focus, and may

be characterized as non-hypothetical and without emphasis on real social problems. Without a theoretical basis, Turkish sociology in this period also jumped from a philosophically weighted theoretical point to an extremely experimental one where only field research and the survey method were regarded as valid. In M. B. Kıray's words, "ambiguous" studies have completely influenced the sociology of this period (as cited in Kaçmazoğlu, 1999). While the basic assumptions of American sociology in Turkey has become the dominant paradigm, there has been an increase in sociology studies focusing on historical research by the 1960's. Thus, 1960's has been the years in which two deep-rooted sociological tradition based on different assumptions progressed in Turkey. The first is the American structural-functionalist sociology school, and the second is the historical understanding of sociology that focuses on historical research (Şahin, 2017).

After the 1980s, when viewed in the work of sociologists working in major sociology departments in Turkey, these sociologists are seen to have argued that the solutions to the problems of Turkish society should be sought in the society's own history and structure in one hand, and on the other hand in the dimension of inter-communal relations in Eastern-Western line. Therefore, the studies carried out in this context were predominantly in a theoretical style. Considering the last three decades in Western sociology, many new issues have emerged, such as globalization, the rise of the European Union, multinational society, postmodernism, ethnicity, micro nationalism, women's studies, environment, political economy, nation state, locality and identity. These fields have also gained traction in Turkish sociology, and many studies, mostly theoretical, have been written by sociologists. Today sociologists in Turkey are examining the issues by sociologists of America or Continental Europe both on an inter-societal and national basis (Şahin, 2017).

As a result, the fact is that Turkish sociology has become more diverse in theoretical perspectives, with multiple focal points in modernization theory, positivism, nationalism studies, secularism, can cultural studies. Thusly, these emphases define the boundaries of the field of study of sociology in Turkey (Kaçmazoğlu, 2001). This special issue on "Turkish Perspectives on Social Problems" is a valuable work that reflects the diversity of topics that Turkish sociology has today. I believe that this special issue, which contains valuable studies that will make important contributions to the Turkish sociology literature and beyond, will guide new studies and reveal different perspectives on the basis of each subject. In addition to this, I think it is very auspicious for the sociology world that such important works have been produced in the growing sociology community in terms of quality and quantity.

As a colleague in the sociological endeavor, I wish like to thank all my academician friends and respected editors who contributed to this project work with their devoted work. I am indeed proud to be a part of this exemplary work team. Best wishes to all my colleagues, in Turkey and also worldwide, who research in the field of sociology and who continue to engage with the understanding and solution of social problems everywhere.

References

- Akyüz, Y. (2001). *Türk eğitim tarihi*, 8th Ed [Turkish education history]. İstanbul: Alfa Basım Yayım.
- Akşin, S. (2007). *Turkey, from empire to revolutionary republic: The emergence of the Turkish nation from 1789 to present* (Trans.: D. H. Mursaloğlu). New York: New York University Press.
- Aydin, C. (2007). *The politics of anti-westernism in Asia: Visions of world order in pan-Islamic and pan-Asian thought*. New York: Columbia University Press.

- Berkes, N. (1973). *Türkiye’de çağdaşlaşma* [Modernization in Turkey]. Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi
- Brice, W. C. (Ed.). (1981). *An historical atlas of Islam*. Leiden, Netherlands: E. J. Brill.
- Brooke, M. Z. (2017). *Le Play: Engineer and social scientist*. New York: Routledge.
- Dinçşahin, Ş. (2015). *State and intellectuals in Turkey: The life and times of Niyazi Berkes, 1908-1988*. Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books.
- Doğan, A., & Alkan, H. (2016). Perception of society and democracy in Ottoman liberal and socialist thought. *İnsan ve Toplum*, 5(10), 7-27. Retrieved from <https://insanvetoplum.org/content/6-sayilar/10-10/1-mo153/atila-dogan--haluk-alkan.pdf>.
- Gündüz, M. (2009). Sociocultural origins of Turkish educational reforms and ideological origins of late ottoman intellectuals (1908–1930). *History of Education*, 38(2), 191-216. Retrieved from <http://rousseastudies.free.fr/articlegunduz.pdf>.
- İçli, G. (2012). *Sosyolojiye giriş* [Introduction to sociology]. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Kayalı, K. (1994). *Türk düşünce dünyası – I* [Turkish thought world – I]. Ankara: Ayyıldız Yayınları.
- Kaçmazoğlu, H. B. (1999). *Türk sosyoloji tarihi üzerine araştırmalar* [Researches in the history of Turkish sociology]. İstanbul: Birey Yayıncılık.
- Kaçmazoğlu, H. B. (2001). *Türk sosyoloji tarihine giriş – I* [Introduction to the history of Turkish sociology – I]. İstanbul: Birey Yayıncılık.
- Kongar, E. (2003). *21. yüzyılda Türkiye* [Turkey in the 21st century]. İstanbul: Remzi Kitabevi.
- Leaman, O. (Ed.). (2015). *The biographical encyclopedia of Islamic philosophy*. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Sanay, E. (2014). *Sosyoloji* [Sociology]. Ankara: Nobel Yayın.
- Shaw, S. J., & Shaw, E. K. (1977). *History of the Ottoman Empire and modern Turkey: Volume 2: Reform, revolution, and republic: The rise of modern Turkey 1808-1975*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Swingewood, A. (1984). *A short history of sociological thought*. London: Macmillan Education.
- Şahin, M. C. (2017). Türk sosyolojisinin kısa tarihi: dönemler, şahıslar ve ana yönelimler [A short history of Turkish sociology: Periods, individuals and main trends]. *İslâmî İlimler Dergisi*, 12(1), 7-41
- Vandenbergh, F. (2009). *A philosophical history of German sociology*. New York: Routledge.



AIMS AND SCOPE

The OJSS, as an international multi-disciplinary peer-reviewed **online open access academic journal**, publishes academic articles deal with different problems and topics in various areas of sociology (urban and rural sociology, economic sociology, sociology of science, sociology of education, political sociology, political science, criminology, demography, human ecology, sociology of religion, sociology of sport and leisure, applied sociology – social work, methodology of sociological research, etc.).

The OJSS provides a platform for the manuscripts from different areas of research, which may rest on the full spectrum of established methodologies, including theoretical discussion and empirical investigations. The manuscripts may represent a variety of theoretical perspectives and different methodological approaches.

The OJSS is already indexed in Crossref (DOI), ERIH Plus, DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals), BASE (Bielefeld Academic Search Engine), Google Scholar, J-Gate, ResearchBib and WorldCat - OCLC, and is applied for indexing in the other bases (Clarivate Analytics – SCIE, ESCI and SSCI, Scopus, Ulrich’s Periodicals Directory, Cabell’s Directory, SHERPA/RoMEO, EZB - Electronic Journals Library, Directory of Research Journals Indexing, NewJour, CiteFactor, Global Impact Factor, Open Academic Journals Index, etc.).

The authors of articles accepted for publishing in the OJSS should get the ORCID number (www.orcid.org), and Thomson-Reuters’ Researcher ID (www.researcherid.com).

The journal is now publishing 2 times a year.

PEER REVIEW POLICY

All manuscripts submitted for publishing in the OJSS are expected to be free from language errors and must be written and formatted strictly according to the latest edition of the [APA style](#). Manuscripts that are not entirely written according to APA style and/or do not reflect an expert use of the English language will **not** be considered for publication and will **not** be sent to the journal reviewers for evaluation. It is completely the author’s responsibility to comply with the rules. We highly recommend that non-native speakers of English have manuscripts proofread by a copy editor before submission. However, proof of copy editing does *not* guarantee acceptance of a manuscript for publication in the OJSS.

The OJSS operates a double-blind peer reviewing process. The manuscript should not include authors’ names, institutional affiliations, contact information. Also, authors’ own works need to be blinded in the references (see the APA style). All submitted manuscripts are reviewed by the editors, and only those meeting the aims and scope of the journal will be sent for outside review. Each manuscript is reviewed by at least two reviewers.

The editors are doing their best to reduce the time that elapses between a paper’s submission and publication in a regular issue. It is expected that the review and publication processes will be completed in about 2-3 months after submission depending on reviewers’ feedback and the editors’ final decision. If revisions are requested some changing and corrections then publication time becomes longer. At the end of the review process, accepted papers will be published on the journal’s website.

OPEN ACCESS POLICY



The OJSS is an open access journal which means that all content is freely available without charge to the user or his/her institution. Users are allowed to read, download, copy, distribute, print, search, or link to the full texts of the articles, or use them for any other lawful purpose, without asking prior permission from the publisher or the author. This is in accordance with the BOAI definition of open access.



All articles published in the OJSS are licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Authors hold the copyrights of their own articles by acknowledging that their articles are originally published in the OJSS.

